

1810058 Mark Stewart-Deane - ECPT6009 Action Research Project

March 2024

Action Research Into Communicating Non Verbal Self Actualisation Through Fine Art Practice Within Lifelong Learning

Contents:

Introduction	2
Literature Review	3
Methodology	8
Results / Discussion	9
Conclusion	12
Resource List	14
Appendix	15

Introduction

Applying fine art practice to promote self actualisation is arguably a revolutionary educational strategy in the field of adult learning. The purpose of this action research project is to investigate how self actualisation could be expressed through nonverbal communication via a fine art context. Through examining this field, the research aims primarily to promote sustainability in the arts, inform teaching methods and contribute to the development of successful pedagogical strategies. Additionally there could be the potential to uncover a bypass of Maslow's Hierarchy of Needs which may benefit educational theory.

I have an appointment as a practitioner teaching adult learners fine art, specifically life drawing and oil painting. The result of each session I conduct produces an immediate body of work, and more often than not some improvement. My strategy is underpinned by learning through doing. Through these circumstances I have witnessed a prevalence of self actualisation with my learners, they look forward to the sessions, leave their troubles behind and only consider their art practice in the classroom. As the inside enquirer I potentially have an authentic opportunity to evaluate what my learners are experiencing. I propose to offer my learners a voice through the medium of fine art to express their self actualisation. I believe that this articulation has the possibility to be more effective as a non verbal response. Based on this rationale I suggest that action research would be the most appropriate apparatus for interrogating the subject.

This plan will provide a literature review to consider recent research into; adult learning in fine art, self actualisation in terms of well being, action research and reflective practice, practice as research, non verbal communication in research and the controversial concept of creativity through 'pataphysics.

There will be a section on the selection and justification of methodology, at this stage I will be conducting desktop research as a secondary option. Although the longer term objective would be to administer a primary action research project that would produce a collaborative artwork. Ethics approval has so far been rejected for this proposal and therefore an element of this secondary research will potentially provide the data needed to proceed with this application.

Results and discussion of the application of action research in the context of itself and this report will be analysed. Recommendations towards further research will be examined pointing to future action, both in the long and short term,

Evaluation and reflection of the project will make up the conclusion of this iteration of the project.

Literature Review

This literature review will survey the current understanding of the themes to be considered for the action research project, providing the tools or lenses to authenticate the research project. Covering; adult learning in fine art, self actualisation, action research and reflective practice, practice as research, non verbal communication in research and 'pataphysics. Essentially this looks at the past in regards to time, applying the work of others as frameworks to comment on and develop concepts.

The search strategy has drawn upon search terms within UWTSD databases and some relevant previous research. The justification for this strategy is that it lends authority to the project as the sources used are officially recognised, academically respected and cited. The selection criteria has considered the most recently published work relevant to the research question. It should be noted that as the research area is somewhat esoteric, the range of material is limited.

Adult Learning in Fine Arts

The effectiveness of definitions and descriptions employed in adult learning can only be fully assessed when they are applied directly to a specific field of learning, in this case fine arts. This paper (Orzelski-Konikowski, I., 2011) offers a conceptual framework for those who are just starting out in pedagogy or are searching for fresh methods for educating adults, based on the author's twelve years of experience as an art educator. The underlying assumption of the essay is that adult learners are lifelong students who want to learn more about topics that they find interesting and relevant to their needs. Adult students, being lifelong learners, have higher

expectations of their lecturers' professionalism and competence than their younger peers. They are often highly driven individuals who recognise their technical limitations and seek to widen their creative horizons. When working with adult learners, educators must be more adaptable and make personalised improvements. This is true for all aspects of education, including classroom management.

Self Actualisation

Many descriptions of well being emphasise self actualisation. However, perspectives on how self actualisation is pursued and how it leads to wellbeing remain relatively unexplored. This research (Fabian, M. 2020) fills that gap by introducing a new theory of self actualisation known as the coalescence of being. The theory is based on insights from existential philosophy, but it is significantly expanded by including current psychological notions, most notably self determination theory, self discrepancy theory, and terror management theory. The basic process of coalescence is the individual's attempt to reconcile their real, ideal, and ought selves. They do this by setting their ideal self and ought self as a goal and then living according to that aim. When their true self is revealed to them by their acts or the assessments of others, they can track their progress towards this aim. Success produces good affect, whilst failure produces negative affect. Introspecting on these signals allows the individual to better understand if their objectives are self congruent (strongly identifying with their self concept) or require adjustment. This insight enables iterative recalibration of the three self constructs, which speeds the coalescence process. The last section of the study examines how coalescence leads to well being as described by a variety of ideas.

Action Research 1

Action research comprises considered deliberation, rigorous data collecting, theory testing, and adherence to agreed upon principles (Mcateer, M., 2013). Educators generate contextualised knowledge by in depth analysis, which serves as the foundation for conceptual frameworks and analytical tools. Key traits include practice based techniques, critical evaluation, and a desire to improve. Action research is conducted in recurrent cycles, with one informing the next, emphasising philosophical underpinnings above simple method. Representations vary; some show it as a succession of cycles, while others, emphasise its changing and chaotic

character. The initial fact finding and analysis phase lays the groundwork for following cycles, directing project design and theoretical orientation. This step requires data sensitivity and the recognition of personal values, both of which are essential for effective action research.

Action Research 2

This book offers a complete guide to action research, allowing the conduct of action inquiries and the creation of quality reports for distribution (McNiff & Whitehead 2009). It covers the following topics: identifying research questions, action planning, methodological techniques, and evidence creation for robust testing. The article emphasises the value of action research in enhancing learning and educational methods, as well as increasing knowledge and theory. It refutes the concept that practitioners are only implementers, arguing for their active participation in theoretical disputes. The book advocates for rethinking theory as practical thinking about social issues, enabling practitioners to theorise their own methods and contribute to larger discourses. It enables practitioners to recognise their role as researchers capable of developing important hypotheses based on their own experiences.

Action Research and Reflective Practice.

The use of reflection to support and deepen practice is becoming more widely accepted in education, healthcare, and the social sciences. (McIntosh, P., 2010.) Reflection is thought to produce depth of knowledge and significance for both the practitioner and others around them. Along with the use of reflection, there is a common application of action research, which some consider as a philosophical method to studying humans in which sharing occurs within mutually supportive situations. As a result, many academics and practitioners argue that improving the technique of action research requires philosophical thought. McIntosh contends that reflective practice and action research can become mechanical in their application unless new creative ways are used. This book explores the contradiction between the use of evidence based practice, which is founded on solid 'objective' research, and reflection, which has 'subjectivity' and personal interpretation. It contends that reflection is also research. The author improves the usage and efficacy of action research and reflection by incorporating new creative and visual techniques. Action

Research and Reflective Practice explains how creative methodologies may be used effectively in critically reflective ways, resulting in a new type of action research that is both original and theoretically sound. The resulting strategy will improve evidence based research in education by improving perception and comprehension of events, identity, and self.

Practice as Research

Practice based research is a growing field in the creative arts, with studio based doctorates increasingly preferred over traditional research. This book (Barrett, & Bolt, B., 2010) is intended expressly as a training tool to help students begin on such research. The chapters include real examples of studio based study in art, cinema, video, creative writing, and dance, each supported by a theoretical essay with references. This work examines the link between practice and theory, drawing on theorists such as Deleuze, Bourdieu, and Heidegger. It goes to great lengths to define procedures, outcomes, and settings, and is a great illustration of how practice may function as a genuine alternative form of inquiry.

Non Verbal Communication Data in Research

Interviews are the most popular way of gathering qualitative data in both qualitative and mixed research because they have the ability to supply researchers with rich data. (Denham, M.A. and Onwuegbuzie, A.J., 2013) Unfortunately, while collecting and evaluating interview data, it appears that researchers pay little attention to characterising nonverbal communication data and its function in making meaning. The analysis in this mixed methods research based systematic review, is of the prevalence and use of nonverbal communication data throughout the stages of all qualitative research studies published in a credible qualitative journal. Nonverbal communication was observed in just 24% of qualitative research investigations. Furthermore, the level of debate varied widely, from a simple reference to meaningful integration and interpretation. Nonverbal communication was least common throughout the data processing phase of study and most underutilised in case studies. Clarification, juxtaposition, discovery, confirmation, emphasis, illustration, elaboration, cooperation, affirmation and effect were highlighted as the critical roles of nonverbal conversation throughout the research process.

Pataphysics

Pataphysics is a chaotic literary trope that has a significant but underappreciated effect on twentieth century art and postmodern philosophy. (Clarke, Peter., 2021) It is an effective technique for increasing creativity, lending spontaneity and unpredictability to any artistic creation. It is often seen as an extension of metaphysics, comparable to how metaphysics is an extension of physics. Another method to understand pataphysics is to define it in terms of the pataphor, which is essentially an extremely expanded metaphor. Pataphysics yields different tools for aiding the creative process, including: Divergent Thinking; which is the essence of creativity, through pataphysics you will come across a wide open canvas for bizarre ideas and associations. Imaginary Solutions; the conventional scientific method requires investigating the natural world and reaching conclusions about how things work. Pataphysics urges us to think beyond that process and conceive how things could be, to focus on the exceptions, particularly the imagined ones, rather than what is expected. If you're having trouble coming up with fresh concepts, it's likely that you're stuck thinking in terms of typical norms and cliched responses. However, when it comes to writing or making art, there are no restrictions. It is art. You can do whatever you want. You can accomplish anything.

Common patterns across the literature are the philosophical perspectives, the emphasis on experimentation and breaking new ground. As the literature is more extensively investigated and the research develops it will probably become apparent that gaps exist in the knowledge, inevitably provoking further reading.

The literature will provide the theoretical framework through which the research will conceptualise and investigate the question. It will inform the results, integrate theory and practice, developing new insights and knowledge. The findings of the literature review relate to the question in both practical and philosophical contexts and encourage the imaginative inquiry necessary to tackle the research question.

Methodology

This section will cover the selection and justification of the methodology used within the project. Methodologies should be flexible and evolving; action inquiries do not aim for definitive responses. The approach is the process itself, which is often messy, random, and exploratory. The research at this phase comprises desktop research as a secondary option which is underpinned by the theories of Mary McAteer (2013) and guided by the techniques of McNiff & Whitehead (2009). The longer term objective would be to conduct primary action research, culminating in the production of a non verbal collaborative artwork conveying self actualisation through fine art practice in lifelong learning. So far ethics approval for the proposal has been rejected. Arguably the translation of action research is to keep the conversation going, but action research needs a structure. This secondary research will serve to consolidate the framework and assist in the preparation of further research iterations for potential primary research.

The proposal for primary research is experiential in nature and the data generated will be qualitative, focussing on gaining insight and understanding about the subject's perception of events and circumstances. The subjects to be engaged in the primary research are made up of adult learners under my tutelage, participating in fine art courses at Learning Pembrokeshire, Pembrokeshire, Archives, Prendergast, Haverfordwest, Pembrokeshire, SA61 2PE. It is vital that as the researcher my own emotional reflexivity is considered and how my own beliefs and biases influence the study.

Initially the basic premise is to send an invitation email to the enrolled learners. Those learners that respond will be invited to a meeting to introduce the research and whether they would like to participate further in the focus group and what that will demand in terms of the required commitment. The desired outcome of the research is a collaborative non verbal artwork that expresses the experiences of self actualisation from the participants pursuit with fine art practice in lifelong learning. The ethics form is included in the appendix of this submission.

This secondary research is supported by the literature review which will go on to inform the results and discussion to produce the conclusion of this first iteration. The results and discussion section of this paper will determine the next cycle. If the recommendations dictate I would continue with primary research. This would mean editing and resubmitting the ethics form which would be advised by the most recent ethics panel comments and the conclusion of this secondary research.

Issues to be addressed for obtaining ethics approval are not overwhelming. Specifics are required on the study foundation or rationale and the range of benefits that are being researched need to be stated and why. There is a demand for literature to explain and justify the research. The selection rationale of participants needs more detail. More particulars about producing artwork, additional information on the criteria for establishing the focus group and further information on security of data have also been requested.

Results and Discussion

Embarking on an action research project has been a journey of discovery, challenges, and insights. This reflection delves into various aspects of the project, including the robustness of the process, insights from the literature review, future recommendations, ethical considerations, and the proposed methodology. Through this reflective account, I aim to critically analyse the project's progress, identify areas for improvement, and chart a course for future iterations.

Action research, characterised by its iterative nature and emphasis on practitioner involvement, provides a suitable framework for investigating complex phenomena within educational settings. Through cycles of reflection, planning, action, and evaluation, action research enables practitioners to engage deeply with their practice, identify areas for improvement, and enact meaningful change.

This action research project investigates the effective use of fine art practice to facilitate collaborative, non verbal responses of self actualisation in post compulsory education. The aim is to promote well being, sustainability in the arts and contribute

to positive pedagogical strategies. The research is conducted within the framework of action research, allowing for rigorous data collection, theory testing, and the generation of contextualised knowledge.

According to McNiff & Whitehead (2009), ontology fundamentally influences our perceptions of ourselves and our interactions with others. In the context of action research, several ontological commitments guide our approach: Firstly, action research is inherently value laden, reflecting our beliefs and priorities. Secondly, it is ethically committed, recognising the moral implications of our actions. Lastly, action researchers acknowledge their interconnectedness, understanding their relationships with others within their social environment.

The culmination of the project underscores the validity and robustness of the process employed, particularly in light of my direct engagement and experience within the field. As a practitioner teaching fine art to adult learners, I have navigated the intricacies of art education, witnessing first hand the transformative potential of self actualisation through artistic expression.

Due to rejections by the ethics panel of the submitted ethics form, the primary research is adjourned while this secondary research option is explored. The first stage of this secondary research and commences with the literature review serving as a cornerstone for the research endeavour. This offers valuable insights into various dimensions of adult learning in fine arts, self actualisation, action research, reflective practice, nonverbal communication and pataphysics. Each domain provides a lens through which to understand the complexities of the research question and informs the subsequent methodology and analysis. The review highlights the importance of philosophical perspectives, experimentation, and breaking new ground in the context of fine art practice and adult learning.

The literature research emphasises the significance of reflection in deepening practice and enhancing learning outcomes. McIntosh (2010), highlights the symbiotic relationship between reflective practice and action research, emphasising the need for creative approaches to ensure their effectiveness. By incorporating new methodologies and visual techniques, practitioners can elevate the quality of action

research and foster a deeper understanding of events, identity, and self. Orzelski-Konikowski's (2011) conceptual framework highlights the need for flexibility and personalised methods in adult education, which is consistent with the project's emphasis on individual expression and self discovery via art. Fabian's (2020) study on self actualisation established the notion of 'coalescence of being', which provided a more nuanced understanding of the processes involved in reaching self accord. The action research literature by McAteer (2013) and McNiff & Whitehead (2009) provides useful information on methodological methods and the iterative nature of inquiry. Furthermore, findings from practice based research (Barrett & Bolt, 2010) stresses the integration of theory and practice in creative endeavours, reinforcing the project's multidisciplinary approach. The literature review improved my comprehension of the study setting by critically interacting with multiple views, which guided future decisions and actions.

The methodology requires a combination of secondary research to inform the eventual plan for primary action research. The secondary research, informed by the literature review, serves as a foundation for the project, providing theoretical insights and frameworks. The plan for primary research entails engaging adult learners in fine art courses, aiming to collaboratively produce non verbal artworks expressing experiences of self actualisation. Ethical considerations, including participant selection and data security need to be carefully addressed, to ensure the integrity of the research process.

It is imperative to translate these insights into actionable recommendations that inform future research and practice. In the short term, there is a pressing need to address the gaps in knowledge identified through this study. This necessitates further exploration into the dynamics of non verbal communication in fine art education and its impact on self actualisation.

Future research endeavours should adopt a longitudinal approach to track the long term effects of self actualisation through fine art practice. Additionally, there is a need to explore the potential policy implications of integrating non verbal communication strategies into adult learning curricula, thereby fostering a more inclusive and holistic educational experience.

The rejection of ethics approval underscores the need for greater clarity and specificity in articulating the study rationale and potential benefits. Addressing these concerns requires applying some findings from the secondary research and a review of the research design and methodology, ensuring alignment with ethical guidelines and standards.

During the primary research phase, the focus will be on generating qualitative data through participant engagement and observation. The envisaged collaborative artwork will serve as a tangible manifestation of the participants' self actualisation journey, providing valuable insights into the transformative power of fine art practice.

This action research project represents a critical step towards understanding and harnessing the potential of fine art practice in promoting self actualisation within lifelong learning. By engaging with the literature and reflecting on practice, we have laid the groundwork for future exploration and innovation in this dynamic field. Moving forward, it is essential to build on these insights and recommendations, driving continuous improvement and advancement in art education and practice.

Conclusion

The aim of this action research project is to launch a pioneering exploration of communicating nonverbal self actualisation through fine art practice within lifelong learning. Rooted in the conviction that fine art can serve as a transformative educational tool, the project aims to unravel the potential of artistic expression in fostering self actualisation among adult learners.

The journey of this project, marked by challenges and discoveries, underscores the significance of action research as a methodological framework. Through iterative cycles of reflection, planning, action, and evaluation, practitioners engage deeply with their practice, identifying areas for improvement and enacting meaningful change. This approach offers a robust foundation for investigating complex educational phenomena within the realm of fine art practice.

The project's objectives are twofold: to explore the efficacy of fine art practice in facilitating self actualisation and to contribute to the sustainability of the arts in adult learning contexts. By leveraging action research methodologies, the project seeks to generate contextualised knowledge, inform teaching methods, and develop pedagogical strategies that promote holistic wellbeing.

The synthesis of insights from the literature review underscores the interdisciplinary nature of the project, drawing on theories from adult learning, self actualisation, action research, reflective practice, nonverbal communication, and pataphysics. These diverse perspectives provide valuable lenses through which to understand and address the complexities inherent in the research question.

Ethical considerations, particularly the rejection of ethics approval, highlight the need for greater clarity and alignment with ethical guidelines. Addressing these concerns requires careful review and refinement of the research design and methodology, ensuring ethical integrity throughout the research process.

Looking ahead, future research endeavours should adopt a longitudinal approach to track the long-term effects of self actualisation through fine art practice. Additionally, exploring the potential policy implications of integrating nonverbal communication strategies into adult learning curricula can foster a more inclusive and holistic educational experience.

In essence, this action research project represents a crucial step towards harnessing the transformative potential of fine art practice in promoting self actualisation within lifelong learning. By building on the insights gained and recommendations provided, the project aims to drive continuous improvement and innovation in art education and practice, ultimately enriching the educational experiences of adult learners and promote sustainability in the arts.

Word Count 3847

Resource List

Barrett, & Bolt, B. (2010). *Practice as research : approaches to creative arts enquiry* (Barrett & B. Bolt, Eds.; First edition.). I.B. Tauris & Co Ltd.
<https://doi.org/10.5040/9780755604104>

Clarke, Peter. (2021) *Pataphysics: A Secret Weapon for Creativity*
<https://medium.com/blankpage/pataphysics-a-secret-weapon-for-creativity-8fdb4574a3b> (Accessed 03/03/24)

Denham, M.A. and Onwuegbuzie, A.J. (2013) “Beyond Words: Using Nonverbal Communication Data in Research to Enhance Thick Description and Interpretation,” *International journal of qualitative methods*, 12(1), pp. 670–696. Available at:
<https://doi.org/10.1177/160940691301200137>.

Fabian, M. (2020) “The Coalescence of Being: A Model of the Self-Actualisation Process,” *Journal of happiness studies*, 21(4), pp. 1487–1508. Available at:
<https://doi.org/10.1007/s10902-019-00141-7>.

McAteer, M., (2013) *Action Research in Education*. BERA/SAGE Research Methods in Education. London: SAGE Publications Ltd. Available at:
<https://doi.org/10.4135/9781473913967>

McIntosh, P., (2010) *Action research and reflective practice: Creative and visual methods to facilitate reflection and learning*. Routledge.

McNiff, Jean. and Whitehead, Jack. (2009) *All you need to know about action research*. London: SAGE.

Orzelski-Konikowski, I. (2011) “The Power of Adult Learning in Fine Arts: Drawing upon Personal Experience,” *Canadian journal of university continuing education*, 37(1), pp. 1-.

Appendix

Mind Map



Poster Narration

Slide 1.

Action Research Plan: communicating non verbal self actualisation through fine art practice within lifelong learning.

Slide 2.

I am ideally placed as a practitioner to manage the action research project. I conduct weekly adult learning fine art classes in life drawing and oil painting through

Pembrokeshire County Council. I have witnessed the substantial benefits that my students experience through fine art practice. This action research project investigates the utilisation of fine art practice to facilitate non verbal self actualisation in adult learning. The ultimate goal is to explore how self actualisation can be expressed through nonverbal communication within a fine art context, aiming to promote sustainability in the arts and contribute to pedagogical strategies.

Slide 3.

The research is conducted within the framework of action research, allowing for rigorous data collection, theory testing, and the generation of contextualised knowledge. The methodology involves a combination of secondary research and the eventual plan for primary action research, focusing on adult learners engaged in fine art courses.

Slide 4.

This literature review will survey the current understanding of the themes to be considered for the action research project, providing the tools or lenses to authenticate the research project. As the literature is more extensively investigated and the research develops it will probably become apparent that gaps exist in the knowledge, inevitably provoking further reading. The literature will provide the theoretical framework through which the research will conceptualise and investigate the question. It will inform the results, integrate theory and practice, developing new insights and knowledge.

Slide 5.

Adult Learning in Fine Arts (Orzelski-Konikowski, 2011) offers a conceptual framework for those who are just starting out in pedagogy or are searching for fresh methods for educating adults. Arguably adult students, being lifelong learners, have higher expectations of their lecturers' professionalism and competence than their younger peers, indicating a more sophisticated approach may be appropriate.

Action Research and Reflective Practice. (McIntosh, 2010.) Reflection is thought to produce depth of knowledge and significance for both the practitioner and others around them. It contends that reflection is also research. The author improves the usage and efficacy of action research and reflection by incorporating new creative and visual techniques.

Practice as Research; (Barrett & Bolt, 2010) practice based research is a growing field in the creative arts, with studio based doctorates increasingly preferred over traditional research. This book goes to great lengths to define procedures, outcomes, and settings, and is a great illustration of how practice may function as a genuine alternative form of inquiry.

Self Actualisation; perspectives on how self actualisation is pursued and how it leads to wellbeing remain relatively unexplored. The research by (Fabian, 2020) fills that gap by introducing a new theory of self actualisation known as the coalescence of being. The study examines how coalescence leads to well being as described by a variety of ideas.

Non Verbal Communication Data in Research; (Denham and Onwuegbuzie, 2013) Interviews are the most popular way of gathering qualitative data in both qualitative and mixed research because they have the ability to supply researchers with rich data. Unfortunately, while collecting and evaluating interview data, it appears that researchers pay little attention to characterising nonverbal communication data and its function in making meaning.

Pataphysics; (Clarke, 2021) It is an effective but currently esoteric technique for increasing creativity, lending spontaneity and unpredictability to any artistic creation. Pataphysics urges us to think beyond conventional processes and conceive how things could be, to focus on the exceptions, particularly the imagined ones, rather than what is expected.

Slide 6

Methodology should be open ended and developmental. Action research literature by McAteer (2013) and McNiff & Whitehead (2009) provides valuable guidance on methodological approaches and the iterative nature of inquiry. Moreover, insights from practice based research (Barrett & Bolt, 2010) underscore the integration of theory and practice in creative endeavours, affirming the project's interdisciplinary approach. By critically engaging with diverse perspectives, the literature review enriches my understanding of the research context and informs subsequent decisions and actions.

Slide 7

Action research, characterised by its iterative nature and emphasis on practitioner involvement, provides a suitable framework for investigating complex phenomena within educational settings. Through cycles of reflection, planning, action, and evaluation, action research enables practitioners to engage deeply with their practice, identify areas for improvement, and enact meaningful change.

Slide 8

During the primary research phase, the focus will be on generating qualitative data through participant engagement and observation. The envisaged collaborative artwork will serve as a tangible manifestation of the participants' self actualisation journey, providing valuable insights into the transformative power of fine art practice.

In the short term, there is a pressing need to address the gaps in knowledge identified through this study. This necessitates further exploration into the dynamics of non verbal communication in fine art education and its impact on self actualisation.

Future research endeavours should adopt a longitudinal approach to track the long term effects of self actualisation through fine art practice.

Slide 9

In essence, this action research project represents a crucial step towards harnessing the transformative potential of fine art practice in promoting self actualisation within lifelong learning. By building on the insights gained and recommendations provided, the project aims to drive continuous improvement and innovation in art education and practice, ultimately enriching the educational experiences of adult learners and promote sustainability in the arts.

Thank you for your attention.

Ethics panel Comments

December panel: (Initial Submission)

SECTION E: Provide further information regarding (i) Interview protocol and procedures (ii) Analysis of subsequent data (iii) Focus Group protocol and arrangements (iv) Case studies, not mentioned in methods section, but introduced in Section F: Scope of Research Activity

SECTION G: Intended Participants

'No' is ticked for No. 1 'Students or staff at the University?', although the Methods Section claims that 'Interviews to be conducted with up to 20 randomly selected students'.

Further information needs to be provided regarding No.11 and 12 – who exactly participants will be and how they are to be recruited.

SECTION H: Anticipated Risks

2. Risks to participants – provide further detail - more thought needs to be given to this

3. Sensitive, embarrassing or upsetting topics - There is always a chance during interviews and focus groups that sensitive, embarrassing or upsetting topics may be disclosed. It is therefore important to note this and have a strategy to deal with this e.g. details of any support/advice (e.g. helpline numbers) to be offered to participants. Note that where applicable.

In addition to this, consent procedures should make it clear that if something potentially illegal is discovered, this may need to be disclosed.

4. Risks to Investigator – More information needed.

5. Risks to University – More information needed.

SECTION I: Feedback, Consent and Confidentiality

1. Feedback - More information needed. For example, signposting information available should anyone become distressed or anxious.

2. Informed consent - More information needed. For example, how will consent be obtained and recorded in accordance with prevailing data protection legislation?

3. Confidentiality / Anonymity - Again – More information needed. For example, no consideration of the particular confidentiality/anonymity issues which can arise when involved with interviews/focus groups.

SECTION J: Data Protection and Storage

1/2. Personal data. No answer provided.

3/4. Special category data. No answer provided.

12. Security of data. Further information required.

17. Use of personal addresses, postcodes, faxes, emails or telephone numbers. No is answered to this question yet the methods section suggests that invitation to participate in the research will be sent via email to students.

24. Data storage arrangements. Further information required.

February panel: (Resubmission)

Sufficient detail not provided.

'Purpose of research activity' section not completed. There is no detail of the study foundation or rationale. What range of benefits are being researched and why? There is no literature to explain and justify this research.

Explain 'randomly selected'.

'Up to 20'? Consistency – 15-20 stated in G10. How will you decide who you will target? How will you obtain their email addresses? What information will you include in the invitation? (Focus of the research, anonymity and confidentiality, right to withdraw etc.) Ethics issue.

How will the 5 FG participants be identified? Are they from the interview group or a different participant pool?

More detail needed about producing artwork. When? How? What for? (Could include this info in the 'Purpose' section).

Students at another institution to be recruited, so 'No' is correct..

E12: Emailed, not mailed.

When will you ask people to participate in the focus group? How will you decide who to ask? Will you look for diversity?

'Section J: 12. Security of data. Further information required' - comment not addressed fully