

**A critical evaluation and the identification of next teaching and learning steps
focusing on a case study of an individual learner or a group of learners, based on an
observed critical incident.**

Introduction

In this assignment, I will be looking closely at an observed incident in a classroom, identifying the possible impact of the actions surrounding it, and reflecting upon how it can affect my own teaching and professional judgement in the future. A critical incident refers to an event that marks a turning-point or change in an individual (or group)'s life within the classroom environment. While some critical incidents stand out as dramatic occurrences, many can appear to be mundane or trivial events that are part of the classroom routine. This is something I will have to take into consideration when observing a lesson and will affect my methods of data collection as I must ensure I am open to studying the seemingly insignificant moments of the classroom. It is only when we examine an incident closely, attempt to find an explanation for why it occurred, and analyse it in a wider context that it becomes critical. Tripp suggests that these incidents only become critical because someone sees them as such (2003) which is another important factor to remember during my analysis as my own personal bias and experience could ultimately affect how I focus on and evaluate these occurrences. I will also look at a range of opinions from academic literature which will enhance my study and help me gain other points of view. Critical incidents within an education setting are important tools in helping teachers reflect on their practice and develop good "control over professional development" (Tripp, 2003: 24) so I will also be using my chosen incident and areas I research around it as a way of identifying the next steps in my own teacher training.

Observation

- School & Class

The observation took place at a large comprehensive school located in South Wales. There are approximately 1400 students who attend, and 80 teaching staff are employed. Approximately 8% of pupils are ALN, and 7% receive Free School Meals. The school was rewarded a performance rating of 'Good' across all areas from ESTYN during their last inspection and the Welsh Government placed the school in the Green support category in the National School Categorisation System (WalesOnline, 2019).

The class I observed was a KS3 English class of 23 pupils of mixed to lower ability. It took place during 3rd period, after breaktime. It is important to note the time of the lesson as a

range of factors may have influenced the behaviour, mood, energy, and enthusiasm of the pupils that relates to the time of day. Examples of these factors include: How the pupils spent their breaktime; If they had anything to eat; What the weather was like and whether it influenced what they did during that time; How much sleep they had had during the previous night and how rested they felt up until this point.

An LSA was present in the class to help a small group of ALN pupils. Pupils were working towards producing a written opinion piece on what they had previously studied within the topic of 'Conspiracy Theories.' The pupils responded well and worked in pairs during a starter task involving putting key vocabulary into a sentence. The teacher elicited what the pupils had learned in previous lessons in order to activate prior knowledge, and the main activity was then explained. Lesson objectives and success criteria were displayed on the Interactive Whiteboard and clarified in detail by the teacher. Pupils could discuss their work in pairs but, overall, were encouraged to work alone and in silence. The teacher circled the class consistently throughout the lesson to ensure pupils understood the work and to give them a chance to ask questions as she passed.

- Methodology

The use of case studies to present how real-life situations link with abstract theories (Cohen, Manion & Morrison, 2007) has a variety of benefits when linked to teacher development. One of the strengths of creating a case study linked to a real-life class, school, or group of pupils is that incidents that may otherwise go unnoticed can be found, which can then have a positive impact on how staff or educators interpret it, causing them to strive for self-development and re-analyse outdated policies (Cohen, Manion & Morrison, 2007).

Observation is typically undertaken in a case study in order to analyse an individual or group in a real-life situation and generate a wider and more general meaning that applies to the larger society (Tripp, 2003). There are several observation strategies to consider when observing a lesson and it was essential that the advantages and disadvantages of each were weighed up in order to determine what would provide an accurate and useful account. This is especially important when it comes to finding critical incidents as detail is one of the key components (Tripp, 2003).

ESTYN recommends that observations last for at least 30 minutes (ESTYN, 2017) so, in this case, the entire 60-minute lesson was observed. While the pupils were aware of a surveillance taking place, this was carried out in a non-participant, naturalistic setting. This was favoured in order to avoid disturbing the normal, day-to-day routine. Although Gun Persson's study on the interactions between children showed that observations in a natural environment does not hinder a child's conduct (Newby, 2010), it should not be assumed that

this was the case for all pupils, as the Hawthorne effect demonstrates that being observed can have a strong influence on how subjects behave and on their productivity (Newby, 2010). This is also why preferred methods of video or audio recording to keep track of what happened were not implemented as, though it would have captured activity accurately, it may have proven to be distracting.

Instead, a touch-typed record of everything that occurred during the lesson was used, recording all teacher movements, speech, pupils' movements, behaviour, and interactions as they happened in a transcript style. This method, suggested by Lofland (Cohen, Manion & Morrison, 2007), was faster than writing by hand and it presented the opportunity to include a lot of detail while the observer kept watch of the classroom. This method also provided a transcript for later use in which to pick out incidents that may have seemed commonplace at the time but, upon later reflection, were noteworthy and interesting (Tripp, 2003).

One of the disadvantages of observing in this way, however, could have been that the sound of typing was a distraction to the pupils or teacher. There was also a missed chance to focus in on one learner from the very beginning and observe how they interacted with those around them and how they developed their own skills during the lesson.

An outline of the classroom seating plan was also sketched out, as recommended by Lincoln and Guba, in order to have a visual context of the classroom and the teacher movements on hand (1985). It further served as a useful tool in looking at how accessible the pupils' seating was to both the board and the teacher.

This method of sketching for data collection may also have had a disadvantage as it does not display how the pupils moved around during the lesson or include information about whether the seating plan was set by the teacher or the pupils themselves, both of which could have impacted their learning. Additionally, a sociogram could have been used to focus in on the friendships and exchanges between pupils. However, due to time constraints and the limitations it would have provided regarding the quality of the interactions rather than the quantity (Papatheodorou, Luff & Gill, 2011), this proved to be unsuitable.

- Critical Incident

Following an explanation of the opinion piece they were expected to write, all pupils were instructed to work in silence. After less than a minute, a few pupils began to whisper. This gradually turned into general chatter around the classroom. The teacher continued circling the room to help pupils who had questions. Within ten minutes, the general chatter had turned into loud conversations. Several pupils (including Pupil A) had stopped working and were now laughing and discussing incidents off topic.

Finally, the teacher addressed the class in response to the noise.

Here is a transcript of the interaction that took place between the teacher and Pupil A during that time:

Teacher (to the whole class): This class doesn't seem to know what silence is.

[Silence falls]

Pupil A (laughing): S. I. L. E. N. C. E.

Teacher (looks at student, face pointed down, eyebrows raised, stern expression):

Pupil A (looking down): Sorry, Miss.

This is an interesting use of both verbal and non-verbal communication in order to enforce discipline. To restore silence, the teacher addressed the pupils as 'this class' rather than using the direct 'you.' The teacher also made a statement about the actions of the pupils rather than giving a command to be quiet. This would seem to imply that her pupils already know that how they're behaving is unacceptable and need a reminder about what is expected of them. This also suggests that the pupils are able to read between the lines of what the teacher is hinting at, which, in turn, offers a clue into the relationship between teacher and pupils. In order to understand what the teacher wanted, the pupils would have already gained some prior knowledge about expected behaviour in a classroom. This may have been through testing the boundaries of what happens when the rules are ignored – or watching someone else do it – and receiving the consequences.

In addition to this, when a pupil did ignore the verbal cue for silence, the teacher switched to direct, non-verbal communication to administer her point. The teacher's eyes met the pupil's and a displeased expression was displayed. The pupil was able to read the teacher's body language immediately, lowered his head in shame, and apologised. This, again, suggests that the pupil would already have gained prior knowledge about the consequences of disobeying the teacher's expectations and is able to read non-verbal cues that remind him of the rules.

The ability to communicate through verbal and non-verbal means is an essential component to understanding and connecting with those around us and forms a key part of Donaldson's 'Successful Futures' report. Developing a range of communication skills will ensure that these pupils are on track to becoming "healthy, confident individuals" (Donaldson, 2018: 30) who are able to form relationships with those whose social cues they can read – whether that be through body language or by reading between the lines of a statement – and develop empathy. The teacher in this incident is demonstrating the need for different forms of communication in order to connect and communicate efficiently with others. She successfully enforced discipline without having to give direct, verbal commands and the pupils responded to the variety of techniques she used.

While this approach appeared to be successful for this class, non-direct verbal and non-verbal communication techniques may be harder to deliver to pupils who have a difficult time understanding or picking up on social cues.

Literature Review

The use of communication and how students interact with others is a core part of the six areas of learning and experience in 'Successful Futures.' Developing the ability to learn other languages, being exposed to a wide range of literature, and utilising digital technologies are just a few of the ways educators are encouraged to help pupils develop their communication skills (Donaldson, 2018).

While the ability to grow in this way is stressed, non-verbal communication is also pointed out as a "crucial attribute" (Donaldson, 2018: 48) in pupils' development. Listening and knowing how to respond to non-verbal clues can be seen as a humanistic attribute as demonstrated by a group of public schools in New Mexico who added non-verbal understanding to their reading programs in an effort to encourage their pupils to develop self-awareness (Koch & Rickman, 2001). Humanistic education is a student-centred approach to learning developed in the 1940s based on the belief that pupils should be able to make their own choices about what subject is relevant to them (Bates, 2016). The teacher acts as more of a mediator of learning and takes into account every part of the learner's being, especially in regards to their emotional needs, as the learner develops a sense of self-control through their ability to choose their own activities (Aubrey & Riley, 2016). Koch and Rickman used these theories in their network of schools and believed that as pupils developed an understanding of their own non-verbal signals, self-awareness would increase and knowledge of what the best academic route for them would follow (2001).

These schools also stressed the importance of teachers being aware of the body language signals they convey to the class. Holmes argues that non-verbal communication has a greater impact on the classroom than the spoken word, emphasising that educators should bring their unconscious habits to the forefront of their mind and use their body to keep control of the class (2009). Neill and Caswell also stress the importance of the visual signs educators use, noting that a long gaze shows a close interest, which immediately impacts on how a pupil behaves (1993). Pupils interpret direct eye contact combined with slightly raised eyebrows as a signal of confrontation, though it is the position of the chin that establishes the message: A chin down offers a less forceful position but gives a warning, while a chin up gives the impression that the signaller is looking down their nose at the recipient (Neill & Caswell, 1993). This immediately stands to create friction between the teacher and pupil and disturb the intended hint the teacher is trying to employ. Newby suggests that these small non-verbal cues can have the opposite effect of what is intended, and that sustained eye contact can in fact come off as threatening and even offer hints of underlying stereotyping if directed at those from lower socio-economic backgrounds (Newby, 2014) so it is vital that teachers are aware of who their audience is.

On the other hand, Woolfolk's study found that the quality of pupils' work improved when teachers displayed body language that typically aligned with negative indicators, such as frowning and head-shaking, which could mean that this sign of enforced discipline is what creates structure for some pupils and drives them to work hard (Neill & Caswell, 1993). The incident displayed in Appendix 1 could be an example of this.

These learned interpretations of how to interpret non-verbal cues could also be seen as a form of classroom conditioning. Skinner is perhaps one of the most widely known figures in discussions of conditioning, particularly when we consider that using body language as a form of discipline can stem from intended operant conditioning. Skinner's theory that learners' behaviour is maintained by rewards or punishments (Gray & MacBlain, 2015) came from experiments of putting animals in a box that was fitted with levers. When the animal pressed one of the levers, it discovered that either water or food was produced (Slater, 2005). The animal quickly learned to associate the action with a reward or positive consequence and this occurrence came to be known as positive reinforcement (Day, 2016). Skinner also discovered that adding an unpleasant stimulus, such as a shock, to the end of the lever caused the same type of association and acted as a negative reinforcer (McLeod, 2018). These patterns of learning about the positive rewards that come as a result of some actions versus the negative consequences that follow others came to be known as operant conditioning and could be seen as what may have occurred during the incident noted in Appendix 1. Student A may have been conditioned to associate a teacher's stern look with

punishment through having seen what happens if that look is ignored. As a result, he apologised and did all he could to detract or reverse what was happening.

Skinner, however, noted that this drive to escape punishment was more of a weakness to the education system rather than a strength, with pupils motivated by the need to avoid negative consequences rather than the will to learn (1972). Thorndike similarly believed that coercing pupils into something they'd rather not do as an attempt to induce interest in subjects should be used as a last resort and, even then, applied with extreme care (1929). He then posed the question of whether humanistic approaches such as giving the pupils more flexibility and ability to choose what they learn could be the solution, though he maintained that this was better achieved with pupils who showed an overall higher academic ability to begin with (1929).

A.S. Neill, the founder of Summerhill, a self-governing school in which the pupils have the freedom to choose their own educational path (Summerhill, 2019), argued that disciplining children produces not only hatred for the disciplinarian but also self-hatred within the child themselves for having had the desire to do or say the wrong thing (Darling, 1992). As a result, Summerhill's discipline policies relied on a teacher-and-pupil-led government where school rules were decided together, as were the punishments for breaking those rules (Neill, 1962). This system of removing adults as authoritarian figures is still in place today (Readhead, 2006), though Summerhill has not been without its critics. In 1999, OFSTED inspectors found that pupils in KS2 were making "insufficient progress," while pupils in KS3 and KS4 were underachieving across all subjects and demonstrating very low levels of numeracy and literacy due to a lack of supervision brought on by not attending lessons (OFSTED, 1999). However, OFSTED did admit that the communication involved in the school's democratic decision-making meant that most pupils were courteous and well-behaved, and held good standards in speaking and listening (1999), so perhaps educational environments where pupils and teachers are held as equal citizens do have their advantages.

Whilst all the pupils in the class observed in Appendix 1 responded to at least one of the teacher's techniques, pupils who struggle with methods of communication, whether verbal or non-verbal, may develop long-term problems in the classroom if ignored. For example, when working with ASD pupils, it is recommended that gestures and non-direct language be avoided altogether as they can often be misinterpreted or not understood at all (ASDinfoWales, 2017). On the other hand, EAL pupils may be more sensitive to body language if using non-verbal signs as tools for comprehension so it is vital that teachers

remain aware of how they present themselves in order to enhance the learning experience (Eryilmaz and Darn, 2019).

Differentiation, a tool largely pioneered by Dr. Carol Tomlinson, is a method of teaching that seeks to address all pupils in a classroom and provide them with the instruction they need as individuals (Wu, 2013). Tomlinson stresses the need for teachers to gather as much information about their pupils as possible in order to find out what is effective for everyone (Tomlinson and McTighe, 2006). In fact, Tomlinson maintains that communication stands to serve as a barrier – both academically and socially – in the classroom if differences and/or difficulties are not properly addressed (2005) so it is recommended that teachers not only observe pupils closely but take the opportunities to learn about them from parents/guardians and gather information on the pupils' interests and dreams (Tomlinson and McTighe, 2006). This route to differentiation is said to increase the learner's motivation and enhance the overall feeling of support from teacher to pupil (Tomlinson, 2015).

However, while differentiated instruction does have its benefits, there are still limitations that must be considered. One of the most frequently cited reasons for not differentiating in the classroom is that teachers often feel overwhelmed at the responsibility of preparing a wide range of resources within a narrow timeframe (Roberts and Inman, 2009). There is also limited research on the effects of differentiated learning on higher-ability and gifted pupils as research suggests that teachers focus most of their differentiated tasks and instructions on the pupils who struggle and have a pattern of underachieving (Hertberg-Davis, 2009).

To combat these issues, John Hattie emphasises that the focus of differentiation should not be on the content of the curriculum, but on the strategies and techniques the teachers use to deliver it (Hattie, 2008). Having the ability to communicate on a range of levels, whether verbal or non-verbal, is essential in allowing this to happen.

Reflection

Critical reflection is an essential element in analysing incidents within a case study. Without reflecting on what we have observed, we are unable to apply what we have learned to our own professional development.

The Draft Curriculum for Wales 2022 has set the ability to “interpret facial expressions and non-verbal cues” (Education Wales, 2019: 43) as one of its baseline outcomes during the first steps of progression. As I will be entering the teaching profession while Welsh schools are implementing changes to their schemes of work, it is vital that I carefully consider the use of communication in my class.

From my observation, I witnessed two uses of alternative communication: One use of non-direct; and one use of non-verbal. In both incidents, the pupils responded by altering their behaviour. After analysing these incidents and looking at the literature and research on communication in the classroom, it is clear that the relationship between the teacher and pupils plays a very important role in this.

First, as a teacher I must get to know my pupils as quickly as possible. Subtle non-verbal cues and non-direct hints may not work with pupils who have language or special education issues. When I begin teaching, it is imperative that I communicate with my subject mentor and/or the classroom teacher and investigate whether any pupils in the class have specific learning difficulties or needs. Later in my teaching career, communicating with previous teachers, liaising with the ALN coordinator, and having regular discussions with parents and guardians will also help me get to know my pupils.

It is also important that I, as a teacher, pay close attention to how non-verbal communication is applied in the classroom. For pupils to understand any non-verbal clues I give while enforcing discipline, I must make sure that they know what is expected of them in the classroom and what the consequences are if they push the boundaries. I must not assume that all pupils will have learned body language cues from their parents/guardians and previous teachers and, as a result, the stern 'teacher stare' may be a new concept for them. Instead of moving straight to a disciplinary action if a non-verbal cue is ignored, I intend to give the pupil another chance to change their behaviour by verbally explaining what they need to change. Eventually, through a form of conditioning, the pupil could begin to link my secondary verbal explanations to my primary non-verbal warnings.

It is important that I do not assume this will be the case for all pupils, though. As I've previously looked at in my literature review, some pupils may have difficulty picking up on non-verbal cues so, as a result, I will continually use verbal explanations and warnings in my classes that include students who may have language difficulties. Using direct communication to emphasise instruction and/or discipline will also ensure I am implementing one of the pedagogical principles outlined by Donaldson which is that a blend of teaching approaches should be executed in the classroom (2015).

I must also be conscious of what non-verbal signals I am giving off in the classroom even outside the subject of discipline. As Newby stressed, it is important to consider the different backgrounds and cultures of the pupils in the class. If not, a small gesture or expression may be misinterpreted and cause offence. In keeping with the new professional standards for teaching, this will mean I am able to differentiate both the materials and experiences in the classroom to ensure every pupil is not only challenged but supported.

It is also crucial to remember that while some form of conditioning for discipline be carried out and the negative consequences of an action be displayed, I also balance this with positive reinforcement such as verbal praise or a rewards system. Displaying too much negative reinforcement may drive pupils to work hard only to escape punishment, as Skinner claimed they would, so ensuring that pupils also experience positive reinforcement will help create a balanced learning environment.

This could help strengthen the relationship between myself and the pupils which, in turn, could ensure I am able to listen to their views and encourage them to reflect on their own development. Additionally, this would help the pupils feel open enough to suggest ways in which their own learning can be developed which is another important element of the new professional teaching standards.

Furthermore, as I was able to gain a deeper understanding of the importance of non-verbal and non-direct communication in the class from analysing an observed incident, this is a process I will strive to repeat during my teaching career – albeit using alternative methods of observation and analysis – in order to further my professional and personal development.

Conclusion

To conclude, the critical incident that was observed displayed two types of non-direct communication to enforce discipline. The successful uses of non-direct communication and body language suggest that some form of operant conditioning had taken place either in previous lessons with the same teacher or in the past with a parent/guardian or other teacher. Pupils had learned to spot non-direct cues as signals that their behaviour needed to change. If not, negative consequences would follow. This also suggests that the teacher had already formed a strong relationship with the pupils and knew that non-direct communication would be understood by all. Forming a relationship with pupils and knowing their strengths, interests, backgrounds, and difficulties seem to be essential to developing good professional judgement in the classroom. Without a sound knowledge of each pupil's abilities, the teacher is unable to implement learning strategies and methods of communication that enhance their experience.

Reflecting upon incidents that may appear to be trivial or everyday occurrences is a way to ensure the teacher keeps developing and also makes informed, research-based decisions towards their teaching, as outlined in the new professional standards. The observed incident in this case demonstrated that operant conditioning could be a successful tool in enforcing discipline in the classroom though it is vital that if non-direct, non-verbal communication is

used as a method of applying this that the teacher is aware of any pupils who are not able to interpret these signals accurately. This is where the use of differentiated instruction is important, as also cited in the professional teaching standards, as teachers must have the ability to be flexible with their methods and use a wide range of approaches to teaching.

References

- ASDinfoWales (2017) *Autism: A Guide for Mainstream Secondary Schools* Available at: <https://www.asdinfo.wales.co.uk/secondary-school> (Accessed: 19 October 2019)
- Aubrey, K. and Riley, A. (2016) *Understanding & Using Educational Theories* London: Sage Publications Ltd.
- Bandura, A. and Walters, R.H. (1963) *Social Learning and Personality Development* USA: Holt, Rinehart and Winston, Inc.
- Bates, B. (2016) *Learning Theories Simplified* London: Sage Publications Ltd.
- Bigge, M.L. and Shermis, S.S. (1992) *Learning Theories for Teachers* 5th Ed. New York: HarperCollins Publishers Inc.
- Cohen, L., Manion, L. and Morrison, K. (2007) *Research Methods in Education* 6th Ed. Oxon: Routledge
- Darling, J. (1992) 'A.S. Neill on Democratic Authority: a lesson from Summerhill?' *Oxford Review of Education*, 18(1), pp.45-57
- Day, R.K. (2016) 'B.F. Skinner, Ph.D. and Susan M. Markle, Ph.D.: The Beginnings' *Performance Improvement*, 55(1), pp.39-48
- Donaldson G. (2018) *Successful Futures* Available at: <https://gov.wales/successful-futures-review-curriculum-and-assessment-arrangements> (Accessed: 19 October 2019)
- Education Wales (2019) *Draft Curriculum for Wales 2022: April 2019* Available at: <https://hwb.gov.wales/draft-curriculum-for-wales-2022/a-guide-to-curriculum-for-wales-2022/> (Accessed: 27 October 2019)
- Eryilmaz, D. and Darn, S. (2019) 'Non-verbal Communication', *Teaching English* Available at: <https://www.teachingenglish.org.uk/article/non-verbal-communication> (Accessed: 19 October 2019)
- ESTYN (2017) *Supplementary Guidance: Lesson Observations and Learning Walks* Available at: <https://www.estyn.gov.wales/document/supplementary-guidance-lesson-observations-and-learning-walks> (Accessed: 27 October 2019)
- Gray, C. and MacBlain, S. (2015) *Learning Theories in Childhood* 2nd Ed. London: Sage Publications Ltd.
- Hattie, J.A.C. (2008) *Visible Learning: A Synthesis of over 800 Meta-Analyses Relating to Achievement* Oxon: Routledge

Hertberg-Davis, H. (2009) 'Myth 7: Differentiation in the Regular Classroom is Equivalent to Gifted Programs and Is Sufficient: Classroom Teachers Have the Time, Skill, and the Will to Differentiate Adequately', *Gifted Child Quarterly*, 53(4), pp.251-253 doi:

[10.1177/0016986209346927](https://doi.org/10.1177/0016986209346927)

Holmes, E. (2009) *The Newly Qualified Teacher's Handbook* 2nd Ed. London: RoutledgeFalmer

Koch, R. and Rickman, J.K. (1977) 'Nonverbal in a Humanistic Program' *Theory into Practice*, 16(3), pp.192-199

Lincoln Y.S. and Guba, E. G. (1985) *Naturalistic Inquiry* California: Sage Publications, Inc.

McLeod, S. (2018) 'Skinner – Operant Conditioning' *Simply Psychology* Available at: <https://www.simplypsychology.org/operant-conditioning.html> (Accessed: 16th October 2019)

Neill, A.S. (1962) *Summerhill* London: Victor Gollancz Ltd.

Neill, S. and Caswell, C. (1993) *Body Language for Competent Teachers* London: Routledge

Newby, P. (2014) *Research Methods for Education* 2nd Ed. Oxon: Routledge

OFSTED (1999) *Summerhill School Standard Inspection* Available at: <https://reports.ofsted.gov.uk/provider/27/124870> (Accessed 18 October 2019)

Papatheodorou, T., Luff, P. and Gill, J. (2011) *Child Observation for Learning and Research* Essex: Pearson Education Limited

Readhead, Z.N. (2006) 'Summerhill today', in Vaughan, M. (ed.) *Summerhill and A.S. Neill* Berkshire: Open University Press

Roberts, J. and Inman, T.F. (2009) *Strategies for Differentiating Instruction: Best Practices for the Classroom* 2nd Ed. USA: Prufrock Press Inc.

Skinner, B.F. (1972) *Cumulative Record* USA: Meredith Corporation

Slater, L. (2005) *Opening Skinner's Box* New York: W.W.Norton

Summerhill (2019) *About Summerhill*. Available at: <http://www.summerhillschool.co.uk/about.php> (Accessed: 18 October 2019)

Thorndike, E.L. (1929) *Elementary Principles of Education* New York: MacMillan

Tomlinson, C. (2015) 'Teaching for Excellence in Academically Diverse Classrooms', *Society*, 52(3), pp.203-209. doi: [10.1007/s12115-015-9888-0](https://doi.org/10.1007/s12115-015-9888-0)

Tomlinson, C. and McTighe, J. (2006) *Integrating Differentiated Instruction and Understanding by Design: Connecting Content and Kids* Alexandria: ASCD

Tomlinson, C.A. and Strickland, C.A. (2005) *Differentiation in Practice: A Resource Guide for Differentiating Curriculum, Grades 9-12* Alexandria: ASCD

Tripp, D. (2002) *Critical Incidents in Teaching* London: Routledge

WalesOnline, 2019 [REDACTED] School Available at:

[https://www.walesonline.co.uk/\[REDACTED\]](https://www.walesonline.co.uk/[REDACTED]) (Accessed: 27 October 2019)

Wu, E. H. (2013) 'The Path Leading to Differentiation: An Interview with Carol Tomlinson', *Journal of Advanced Academics*, 24(2), pp. 125–133. doi: 10.1177/1932202X13483472.

OBSERVATION / FIELD NOTES

(Questions adapted from Fletcher Wood (2016))

Date: 26/09/19
Lesson details: KS3 class. 23 pupils. Mixed ability. LSA is present for several ALN pupils. English: 'Conspiracy Theories' topic. Starter is a recap on vocabulary used in a previous lesson. Main activity is writing an opinion piece on conspiracy surrounding Princess Diana's death.
Classroom culture (Are the students focused on learning?) Most pupils very focused on the tasks and activities given. A small group of pupils flipped a bottle and stopped working altogether until the teacher stopped them. All eyes on teacher while she addressed the entire class.
Objectives (Is there a clear purpose to the lesson? How do the lesson activities promote that purpose?) Learning objectives were displayed on the overhead projector and broken down into simple explanations from the teacher. Success criteria sheets were handed out to each pupil and explained in detail by the teacher. Pupils were made aware of what they needed to include in their essay from each point on the SC sheet. Teacher also suggested ways to increase their levels by pointing out the extra elements of the higher levels.
Direction (Are the students clear about what they are doing and how to do it well?) Most pupils have their heads down and are writing. Some pupils stopping the teacher as she is circling to ask questions. Some questions appear to be from pupils unsure of certain aspects of their writing. Others appear to be from pupils needing extra reassurance.
Access and challenge (Are all students able to engage in the lesson? Are all students challenged?) Differentiation: ALN students given a separate worksheet with more accessible information and word bank boxes. Some sections highlighted. Pupils who finished activities before the rest of the class were given an extra task by the teacher.
Assessment How does the teacher assess student understanding before, during and after the lesson? How is this used in their teaching? Teacher is moving around the class to check on pupils' progress. Giving example answers to the whole class while explaining activities.



Teacher is addressing common questions and confusions to the whole class. Teacher stops all the pupils from working in order to focus on her explanation. Teacher is eliciting information from students during explanation rather than telling them straight away (Activating Prior Knowledge).

Specifics / Critical Incidents

Are there particular telling moments and examples which it would be helpful to discuss?

Teacher using one-to-one instruction with pupils who have asked for extra help and is bending down to their level to help. Maintaining eye contact.

Teacher uses hands to gesture and emphasise meaning during explanations.

Some students flipping a bottle during activity. Very restless. Not working at all.

Teacher asking the class, "What are we doing?" in a strong, authoritative voice when noise level raised. Class immediately fell silent.

Teacher asked a student, "Do I have to send you out?" when the student continued to play with bottle while teacher was talking.

Teacher used "Tri, dau, un" for whole class silence.

Teacher used non-direct and non-verbal communication for discipline:

"This class doesn't seem to know what silence is."

"S-I-L-E-N-C-E." (Teacher stare) "Sorry, Miss."

Teacher held out bin in front of student who was chewing gum. No direct communication. Student spat out the gum, understanding the context.

Model Beirniad Wedi Adfyfyrio (BWA) *Assisted Reflective Conclusions (ARC) Model*

Dyddiad/Date: 26/9/19

Digwyddiad critigol (Ffocws)/Critical incident (focus): Non-verbal communication to enforce discipline

Profiad/ Experience	
Teimladau/ Feelings <i>Beth yw eich teimladau ynghylch y profiad?</i> "What are your feelings regarding the experience?"	Overall, the pupils in the class seemed to respond well to the teacher's instructions and enforced discipline. Everyone's eyes focused on the teacher while instruction was being given and the pupils fell silent when they were reminded of how they should be behaving. Most pupils talked a little to their friends but still appeared to be working and knowing exactly what was expected of them. The teacher seemed to have developed a good relationship with the pupils as they were comfortable with her when she approached to check their work and many were not afraid to ask questions.
Cofio a Deall/ Remember and Understand <i>Allwch chi restru'r agweddau ar y profiad dysgu a aeth yn dda?</i> "Can you list the aspects of the learning experience that went well?" <i>Pa elfennau o'r profiad dysgu oedd yn siomedig?</i> "What were the elements of the learning experience that were disappointing?"	The instruction of each activity was made clear and pupils were open to providing their answers to the whole class when asked. Differentiation was successfully implemented in a subtle way so that all pupils were challenged and given helping tools. Discipline was enforced through non-verbal and non-direct communication. All pupils responded to some element of this. One pupil didn't begin his work until the teacher appeared nearby and reassured him that what he thought he had to do was correct. This may have been the need for extra reassurance rather than lack of understanding. A couple of pupils were flipping a bottle in class and had to be told several times to stop. They ignored the teacher the first time they were told.
Gwerthuso a dadansoddi/ Evaluate and analyse <i>Beth fyddwch chi'n cadw'r un fath i sicrhau dysgu ac addysgu effeithiol yn y dyfodol?</i> "What will you keep the same to ensure effective teaching and learning in the future?" <i>Beth oedd achos yr elfen siomedig bwysicaf?</i> "What was the cause of the most important disappointing element?"	I would like to develop a good rapport and relationship with my pupils so that they feel comfortable enough to ask me any additional questions if my instructions aren't clear enough. Developing a good relationship would also ensure I know how to use my body language to enforce discipline and emphasise elements of instruction. I would also like to use success criteria handouts and explain them in small, simple statements so that all pupils know what to include in their work and what is expected of them. Pupils who were briefly distracted from their work may not have been interested in the topic. There also may have been outside factors such as tiredness contributing to restlessness.

Casgliadau a chamau gweithredu/ <i>Conclusions and actions</i> <i>Beth yw eich atebion posibl i'r materiaon siomedig a nodwyd?</i> <i>"What are your possible solutions to the disappointing issues identified?"</i> <i>Beth ydych yn mynd i'w wneud nesaf?</i> <i>"What will you do next?"</i>	Perhaps ensuring pupils are interested in the topic would stop them from becoming restless. Getting to know what the pupils' interests are and creating lessons surrounding these topics may stop them from being distracted. Enforcing consequences that come after ignoring warnings could also ensure that pupils listen to instructions when told what not to do. I could explain the consequences of bad behaviour to my pupils so that they are more aware of why it is important not to ignore warnings.
Y profiad newydd / <i>Transformed experience</i>	



OBSERVATION / FIELD NOTES

(Questions adapted from Fletcher Wood (2016))

Date: 26/09/19

Lesson details:

KS3 class. 27 pupils. Mixed ability.

Art: Positive and negative space in art/Black and white shading or colouring

Classroom culture

(Are the students focused on learning?)

Many pupils focused on their work when sat down but most spent a significant amount of time standing in line to speak to the teacher. All pupils spent their time in line talking to their friends. Circles forming in queue. Some students cutting in to the front of the queue making the wait longer for others.

Some pupils playing with money on the tables rather than focusing on their work.

Some pupils at the back of the class stopped working halfway through the lesson and talked for the remainder. One took out their phone.

Objectives

(Is there a clear purpose to the lesson? How do the lesson activities promote that purpose?)

Learning objectives displayed for entire lesson on overhead projector.

Direction

(Are the students clear about what they are doing and how to do it well?)

21 of the 27 pupils lined up in front of the teacher's desk to have the teacher check their work and help them improve. Pupils were not finished with work when they had spoken with the teacher so they were not showing completed work. All seemed to need extra help.

Access and challenge

(Are all students able to engage in the lesson? Are all students challenged?)

Girl on crutches let in to the class first to get settled before everyone else. Allowed to remain seated while other pupils standing behind chairs waiting for permission from teacher to sit.

Teacher giving the pupils the freedom to approach her during activity time. "If you're struggling, don't sit there and wait for inspiration to come. Come and talk to me."

Assessment

How does the teacher assess student understanding before, during and after the lesson? How is this used in their teaching?

Teacher trying to Activate Prior Knowledge by eliciting from the pupils what they have been working on. Eliciting key phrases and techniques they have been using and still need to use in their work today.

Teacher uses modelling to demonstrate what the pupils need to do. Holding up an example piece.

Teacher giving each pupil one-on-one attention when pupils are at the front of the queue.



Specifics / Critical Incidents

Class started late due to the pupils being in assembly.

Girl on crutches let into the class first to get settled before everyone else.

Boys and girls separated. Boys sitting on one table across the class. Girls sat on the other. No seating plan. Pupils have implemented this themselves.

A few pupils sitting with their back to the teacher and the overhead powerpoint. Did not turn around to look at the teacher while she was speaking. Did not turn around to look at the Learning Objectives displayed.

Teacher said, "Can you button it?" to a pupil. Casual, informal phrasing showing a good rapport between teacher and pupils.

Pupil standing over teacher chewing gum very openly.

Teacher told pupils playing with money, "Boys, if you have spare money to play with, I'll have it" – Showing good rapport again rather than shouting or being overly strict.

Pupils at the back of the class, far away from the teacher, not doing any work. Talking.

Taking out phones.

Model Beirniad Wedi Adfyfyrio (BWA) *Assisted Reflective Conclusions (ARC) Model*

Dyddiad/Date: 26/9/19

Digwyddiad critigol (Ffocws)/Critical incident (focus): Accessibility in classroom for pupil on crutches

Profiad/ Experience	
Teimladau/ Feelings <i>Beth yw eich teimladau ynghylch y profiad?</i> "What are your feelings regarding the experience?"	The pupils in the class seemed interested in the subject and eager to show their work to the teacher and ask for help. There was a relaxed atmosphere in the class as pupils could speak to each other while they worked, though the teacher had to remind them to keep the noise level down on a few occasions. The teacher used informal language with the pupils and joked around with them on occasion showing that a good rapport had been built.
Cofio a Deall/ Remember and Understand <i>Allwch chi restru'r agweddau ar y profiad dysgu a aeth yn dda?</i> "Can you list the aspects of the learning experience that went well?" <i>Pa elfennau o'r profiad dysgu oedd yn siomedig?</i> "What were the elements of the learning experience that were disappointing?"	The pupils seemed to understand what they needed to do. Most waited in a queue to ask the teacher for ways in which they could improve their work, implying that many of them had high levels of motivation. The teacher demonstrated a very good relationship with the pupils. Most felt comfortable enough to ask her for help and she spoke in a casual way with them and shared jokes. One pupil on crutches was given accessibility to the classroom before other pupils so that she could settle and not feel crushed in a crowd. The teacher sat near her for most of the lesson so that the pupil didn't have to get up if she needed help. Some of the pupils stopped doing any work halfway through the lesson. The queue of pupils to see the teacher blocked the teacher's vision to them. They talked through the remainder of the class and one pupil took out their phone.
Gwerthuso a dadansoddi/ Evaluate and analyse <i>Beth fyddwch chi'n cadw'r un fath i sicrhau dysgu ac addysgu effeithiol yn y dyfodol?</i> "What will you keep the same to ensure effective teaching and learning in the future?" <i>Beth oedd achos yr elfen siomedig bwysicaf?</i> "What was the cause of the most important disappointing element?"	Developing a good rapport with pupils will ensure they feel comfortable enough to ask me questions about anything they need help with. Ensuring pupils who have accessibility issues have full support of the teacher and their way around the class will guarantee they are not limited in the learning environment. Pupils seemed to take advantage of the queue forming and blocking the teacher's vision of the whole class off. As a result, they stopped working and were able to talk without being noticed.

Casgliadau a chamau gweithredu/ <i>Conclusions and actions</i> <i>Beth yw eich atebion posibl i'r materiaon siomedig a nodwyd?</i> <i>"What are your possible solutions to the disappointing issues identified?"</i> <i>Beth ydych yn mynd i'w wneud nesaf?</i> <i>"What will you do next?"</i>	Ensuring that I have a good view of the entire classroom throughout the whole lesson could help pupils taking advantage of not being monitored. Finding a position to sit or having a queue facing in a different direction so that the teacher can still see the seated pupils could make sure this isn't repeated. Providing pupils with work they are interested in and happy to work on even when not monitored may also be a solution to pupils who stop working and lack motivation.
Y profiad newydd / <i>Transformed experience</i>	

OBSERVATION / FIELD NOTES

(Questions adapted from Fletcher Wood (2016))

Date: 26/09/19
Lesson details: KS5 class. 18 pupils. History: Presenting as a political party during the Reichstagwahlen.
Classroom culture (Are the students focused on learning?) Pupils who had already presented focused on the groups presenting and reacting accordingly. Some took notes. Pupils who had not yet presented had their eyes down and were focused on touching up their own presentations.
Objectives (Is there a clear purpose to the lesson? How do the lesson activities promote that purpose?) Learning objectives are explained to the pupils at the beginning of class. All pupils are taking notes in line with the outcomes of the lesson.
Direction (Are the students clear about what they are doing and how to do it well?) Pupils are clear on what they need to present and are well prepared. Each pupil knows when it is their turn to speak and what they should be saying. All listening attentively to other pupils giving their presentations. Showing respect. Clapping after each group has finished.
Access and challenge (Are all students able to engage in the lesson? Are all students challenged?) All pupils very engaged in lesson. Asking challenging questions to each group after they have presented in order to test their knowledge. All pupils seem to display a similar ability.
Assessment How does the teacher assess student understanding before, during and after the lesson? How is this used in their teaching? Teacher taking notes during presentations and asking pupils questions about what they have presented. Also asking other pupils who are listening questions to ensure everyone understands and is concentrating on what is being said.
Specifics / Critical Incidents Some pupils not paying attention to the presentations. Working on their own, not looking up. Positive reinforcement from the teacher after each presentation, and whilst whole class packing up.

Model Beirniad Wedi Adfyfyrio (BWA) *Assisted Reflective Conclusions (ARC) Model*

Dyddiad/Date: 26/9/19

Digwyddiad critigol (Ffocws)/Critical incident (focus): Lack of whole class focus on presentations

Profiad/ Experience	
Teimladau/ Feelings <i>Beth yw eich teimladau ynghylch y profiad?</i> "What are your feelings regarding the experience?"	The pupils were very well prepared for their presentations and displayed a lot of enthusiasm throughout the whole class, including towards the end when ballots were given out to vote. Each group demonstrated strong subject knowledge when they stood up to present and were happy to answer questions. The teacher moved around the room and changed seats as each new group began to present.
Cofio a Deall/ Remember and Understand <i>Allwch chi restru'r agweddau ar y profiad dysgu a aeth yn dda?</i> "Can you list the aspects of the learning experience that went well?" <i>Pa elfennau o'r profiad dysgu oedd yn siomedig?</i> "What were the elements of the learning experience that were disappointing?"	Pupils demonstrated strong enthusiasm for the subject and had shown that they could do their own research and present their findings to their classmates. The teacher demonstrated a good relationship with the pupils. All listened closely to his feedback and instructions. The teacher's subject knowledge was also very strong and well-prepared as he was able to ask for further information from the pupils to test their research. If the pupils were unsure, the teacher was ready to clarify. Some pupils who had not yet presented were putting the finishing touches to their presentations and not paying attention to what was happening in front of them.
Gwerthuso a dadansoddi/ Evaluate and analyse <i>Beth fyddwch chi'n cadw'r un fath i sicrhau dysgu ac addysgu effeithiol yn y dyfodol?</i> "What will you keep the same to ensure effective teaching and learning in the future?" <i>Beth oedd achos yr elfen siomedig bwysicaf?</i> "What was the cause of the most important disappointing element?"	Ensuring pupils are studying topics they enjoy and can be trusted to look into further outside of the classroom may help to develop this level of enthusiasm. Pupils may have not had time to practice their presentations together and were unsure about timings and what they needed to say. Perhaps some felt unprepared or nervous about speaking in front of a class.
Casgliadau a chamau gweithredu/ Conclusions and actions <i>Beth yw eich atebion posibl i'r materiaon siomedig a nodwyd?</i> "What are your possible solutions to the disappointing issues identified?" <i>Beth ydych yn mynd i'w wneud nesaf?</i> "What will you do next?"	Ensuring pupils have time to practice their presentations together may help them stay focused on what is in front of them instead of worrying about what they are about to do. Setting pupils a task to make notes and think of one question each to ask the presenting group may also help them focus on what is being explained to them.

Y profiad newydd / *Transformed experience*

OBSERVATION / FIELD NOTES

(Questions adapted from Fletcher Wood (2016))

Date: 03/10/19
Lesson details: KS4 class. 21 pupils. English: Inferring from texts and videos on the topic of 'Knife Crime.'
Classroom culture (Are the students focused on learning?) Pupils were engaged in the short film. Some needed encouragement to start writing but were then focused. Pupils wrote in silence.
Objectives (Is there a clear purpose to the lesson? How do the lesson activities promote that purpose?) Learning objectives displayed at the beginning of class. Teacher also asked pupils to repeat what the purpose of the lesson was after they had watched the short film.
Direction (Are the students clear about what they are doing and how to do it well?) 'Steps to Success' displayed on the overhead projector. Also printed on handouts given to pupils. Teacher provided an explanation of each step to success and gave examples of how to achieve them.
Access and challenge (Are all students able to engage in the lesson? Are all students challenged?) Pupils very interested in short film. Asking questions to the teacher and listening to what others have to say. Pupils asked to read out example answers to questions. Many volunteering to read out loud. One pupil using coloured glasses to help with her Dyslexia.
Assessment How does the teacher assess student understanding before, during and after the lesson? How is this used in their teaching? Teacher circling the room monitoring what pupils are writing. Eliciting information from pupils rather than telling them. Using RAG system to assess what vocabulary pupils need help with.
Specifics / Critical Incidents One pupil using coloured glasses to help assist with any difficulties related to Dyslexia. Student-led discussion. Teacher taking notes from students making suggestions about a topic. Other students taking notes from their peers too.

Model Beirniad Wedi Adfyfyrio (BWA) *Assisted Reflective Conclusions (ARC) Model*

Dyddiad/Date: 03/10/19

Digwyddiad critigol (Ffocws)/Critical incident (focus): Differentiation

Profiad/ Experience	
Teimladau/ Feelings <i>Beth yw eich teimladau ynghylch y profiad?</i> "What are your feelings regarding the experience?"	The pupils displayed enthusiasm and interest for the subject. Pupils were all focused and engaged in the short film they watched which helped spark their interest in the article they later read. Pupils were respectful towards each other and listened to other opinions.
Cofio a Deall/ Remember and Understand <i>Allwch chi restru'r agweddau ar y profiad dysgu a aeth yn dda?</i> "Can you list the aspects of the learning experience that went well?" <i>Pa elfennau o'r profiad dysgu oedd yn siomedig?</i> "What were the elements of the learning experience that were disappointing?"	Pupils were interested in the subject and asked the teacher a lot of questions that elaborated on what they had seen and read. Teacher let other students answer these questions if they had an opinion. The teacher demonstrated a good relationship with the pupils. Pupils were respectful towards everyone in the room and listened attentively to what the teacher said. Success criteria was explained in an accessible way with the teacher giving examples and suggestions of how pupils could achieve this. One pupil who needed coloured lenses to help with her Dyslexia did not receive materials on coloured paper. The learning objectives and success criteria were also displayed with black text on white paper.
Gwerthuso a dadansoddi/ Evaluate and analyse <i>Beth fyddwch chi'n cadw'r un fath i sicrhau dysgu ac addysgu effeithiol yn y dyfodol?</i> "What will you keep the same to ensure effective teaching and learning in the future?" <i>Beth oedd achos yr elfen siomedig bwysicaf?</i> "What was the cause of the most important disappointing element?"	Breaking down success criteria and giving examples of how to achieve these steps will be a useful tool to help pupils understand what level they are expected to achieve. Finding topics that keep pupils interested will also help keep them engaged in the work. The pupil who needed coloured lenses to read and help with her Dyslexia worked well with no problems. However, if she had forgotten to bring her coloured lenses, coloured materials and powerpoint presentations were not available and would have been hard for her to access and work with.
Casgliadau a chamau gweithredu/ Conclusions and actions <i>Beth yw eich atebion posibl i'r materiaon siomedig a nodwyd?</i> "What are your possible solutions to the disappointing issues identified?" <i>Beth ydych yn mynd i'w wneud nesaf?</i> "What will you do next?"	Ensuring pupils with difficulties related to Dyslexia receive coloured background paper in case they forget to bring the tools that help them to school. Ensuring that everything displayed on a Powerpoint has a coloured background to ensure the text is accessible to anyone with reading difficulties.
Y profiad newydd / Transformed experience	