

A critical evaluation and the identification of next teaching and learning steps focusing on a case study of an individual learner or a group of learners, based on an observed critical incident.

INTRODUCTION

An incident is said to be critical if it provides valuable information and has some underlying connotation. As a result of this, a critical incident is not something that can simply be taken at face value. It is something that must be investigated further to gain a deeper understanding of why the event has taken place and to try to either reproduce it or prevent it from happening again. Often, it is perceived that a critical incident is something bad, but this is not necessarily the case. It is an event that occurs during the duration of an event that is unplanned and, potentially, unexpected. Thus, it can be both positive and negative. For example, within the context of a classroom, this could be something as simple as pupils raising their hands to answer a question, which may display a conformation to the rules set out by the school and/or teacher. Critical incidents are advantageous because they allow people to reflect on, and evaluate, the various factors in the environment at the time of occurrence.

Some relevant information about the school observed shall be provided. Different methods of observation will be explored, and the most fitting will be selected to use. Both will give useful context about the appearance of the explored critical incident.

For this assignment, the focus shall lie on a specific critical incident (a few additional examples can be found in the **Appendices**). This critical incident will also be related to the four purposes of Donaldson's 'Successful Futures', a variety of literature and some theory that has been discussed in lectures with specific focus on AfL, Social Constructivism and Modelling. Everything considered will be a form of shaping future practice.

SCHOOL & CLASS CONTEXT

The school in which the observation took place will be referred to as 'School A' during this assignment and any pupils referred to will also be labelled to maintain confidentiality in following the BERA guidelines.

To gain a greater understanding of the critical incident, it is important to have some contextual information about the school. 'School A' is an English-medium school located in South Wales. The school has pupils in the age range 11 to 18 years old studying there. The catchment of the school comes from the surrounding areas, which are very affluent, and Estyn (2019) says that approximately four percent of the school are eligible for free school meals. Additionally, Estyn (2019) says roughly eight percent of the school have at least one special education need and about two percent have English as a second language. Furthermore, WalesOnline (2019) states that 'School A' is a green category school, which means that the school is very effective.

The class observed in **Appendix 1** was a top set, year 8 mathematics class in 'School A' and they were being introduced to a new topic. Though, the new topic had some links to previous topics. The class consisted of approximately thirty-two pupils and one teacher. The lesson took place in the first lesson of the day. It is also significant to note that in 'School A', the students appeared to be well behaved for the most part.

METHODOLOGY

When researching different models of observation, the text which had the greatest amount of attention paid to it was 'Critical Incidents in Teaching' by David Tripp. In the text Tripp outlines several ways of recording critical incidents. Tripp has experience in teaching, and at numerous points in the book he refers to his own experience in teaching. As a result of these reasons, it seems an appropriate book to read in-depth and a reliable source to mention. Another text referred to was 'How I Wish I'd Taught Maths' by Craig Barton. Barton too has a great deal of teaching experience and, again, uses his own teaching to support his views.

A method of observation that Tripp (1993) mentions is the use of 'Diagnostic Teaching', and he believes this method to be an approach to critical incidents that is interpretive for the most part. The idea of 'Diagnostic Teaching' is that interpretation of random events can lead the interpreter to the cause of said random events. This method of observation could be particularly useful, especially when it comes to the analysis of a critical incident. 'Diagnostic Teaching' should allow any critical incident to be looked at from all

angles, and hence it helps to form a critical incident quite naturally. Bias will theoretically be avoided through the use of 'Diagnostic Teaching' because it should prevent observers from having a one-dimensional viewpoint. However, as Tripp has said himself, it is very much an interpretive tactic when it comes to observing critical incidents. Due to this, using this method may lead to overthinking the critical incident and have a knock-on effect for analysing it. For example, when using this method, there might be the temptation to focus too much on what the different interpretations of the critical incident are rather than looking more into why the critical incident has happened. There also may be the temptation to ignore what information the critical incident gives at face-value, which is still a valid interpretation of the event.

There are limitations to observing lessons. When observing, Barton (2018) believes that people tend to follow something called 'The Confirmation Bias', which means that people generally have a fixed set of ideas and will search for anything that will confirm said ideas rather than looking at the bigger picture. This may mean that observers will not look for incidents that oppose their views. Though, as mentioned previously, using the 'Diagnostic Teaching' that Tripp (1993) suggested might be a useful way of combating this.

It is also important to note that the observation was a non-participant observation, which, within the context of a classroom, is when the pupils are aware of the observer's presence, but the observer has a passive role in the lesson. But Encyclopedia.com (2019) notes that this method is often criticised because the observer being in the lesson may cause people to behave in a different manner. This might mean that this form of observation does not give a true reflection of what the classroom is like. Although, several teachers have said that the pupils in 'School A' are familiar with observations.

CRITICAL INCIDENT LINKED TO DONALDSON'S FOUR PURPOSES

Burnett IT Solutions (N.D.) says that Graham Donaldson has more than forty years of experience in education and has worked in schools, universities and other sectors. He has put forward several recommendations for education in Wales through the 'Successful Futures' report. So, it is valuable to bear the four purposes in mind while looking at the critical incident.

The critical incident that has been selected to study can be found highlighted in **Appendix 1**. It involved interactions between a girl, 'Pupil A', her peers that she was sat in front of, 'Group A', and her teacher, 'Teacher A'.

This incident could have a direct relation to several of Donaldson's Four Purposes. As an example, take into consideration the goal to create "ambitious, capable learners who

are ready to learn throughout their lives” (Donaldson, 2015). At face value, this incident might display a learner who has no drive or determination to learn. It may give the impression that Pupil A would rather take her friends’ answers than thinking about the solution herself, which, on the surface, could be put down to laziness. Of course, this theory opposes the said purpose and may suggest that peer-modeling is impractical, particularly when not done suitably.

Equally, Pupil A may be using Group A as a way to avoid facing her lack of understanding of the topic or set task. This then relates to her refusal to ask the teacher for help because she might be attempting to avoid the embarrassment that could come along with lack of comprehension. So, it possibly is a way of her protecting her own self-esteem, for if her problem is not identified, in her mind it could feel as though there is no problem present. This stance then opposes another of Donaldson’s Four Purposes as she might not be a “confident individual” (Donaldson, 2015) through hiding behind her friends’, apparently, greater level of understanding. This, again, gives a negative impression of peer-assisted learning.

Taking a more optimistic stance to this critical incident, it could be the case that the Pupil A feels more comfortable having her peers explain the questions to her. Through this she may be building “positive relationships based upon trust and mutual respect” (Donaldson, 2015). So far peer-modeling has seemed undesirable in relation to the Four Purposes. However, it may be the case that having peers carrying out explanations can create strong bonds between people for life.

Switching the focus to Group A, their contentment to help their peer might suggest that they are “capable learners” (Donaldson, 2015). Through peer-modeling they could be demonstrating that they “can explain the ideas and concepts they are learning about” (Donaldson, 2015). This will potentially have a positive impact on the confidence of all learners in this interaction because Group A are consolidating their understanding of the topic while attempting to bring Pupil A up to their level. If the learners are more confident, they may be more have more ambition to study the topic in more detail in the future, which again relates back to the Four Purposes.

LITERATURE REVIEW

The critical incident stated previously can be linked to a number of areas for research in education. The most glaring example appears to be AfL, specifically through peer-assisted learning with regards to the critical incident since Pupil A used Group A to help her. Also,

due to the fact that several social interactions took place, it will be interesting to look at Social Constructivism. Equally, because of Teacher A's insistence on following the examples set out on the board, it can be linked to modelling.

Some studies have found that AfL has a positive impact on the mentality of learners. For example, Black et al. (2003) conducted a great deal of research into AfL in schools. It was discovered that the effect the questioning techniques used for AfL were positive. Some schools found that students felt at ease providing answers to questions, even if they were wrong because their understanding was that incorrect answers were just as useful as correct ones. An important thing to know is that pupils were always expected to answer questions, even if their answer was 'I don't know'. It was also seen that pupils were happy for other pupils to look further into why the answers were wrong. This evidence may suggest that AfL is beneficial because it shows that pupils are mindful of their capabilities and are willing to collaborate with other pupils to develop their knowledge and understanding. The willingness to answer questions, even incorrectly, could be useful in creating confident individuals who are conscious that the teacher needs to be aware of what they know to help them move forward. Nevertheless, a limitation of this might be that pupils will regularly answer 'I don't know' when asked a question because they are in the know about its validity as an answer. It could be the case that they won't even think about the question posed and, if asked to answer, they just answer 'I don't know' because they know there will be no reprimand.

There are people who oppose the idea of AfL, particularly self and peer-assessment because it is often not done in a way that benefits the learner. Didau (2014) is quite critical of the use of AfL in schools, as he believes that both self and peer-assessment is frequently done to an inadequate standard. Nuthall (2007) also reinforces this through finding that pupils get around 80% of their feedback from each other, but 80% of said feedback is incorrect. This evidence implies that this form of assessment is commonly used within classrooms, however, it does not necessarily mean it is of any use. The inference may be that, while it is seemingly useful for pupils to critique their own and others' work, it may very well be the case that they do not have enough understanding of the topic in which they are assessing to leave any valuable feedback that will further develop anyone's understanding. Additionally, the idea that the feedback left is typically incorrect could lead to 'unlearning' by passing on erroneous ideas such as misconceptions and wrong answers. Despite this, it may be the case that learners are capable of leaving valuable feedback on both their own and their peers work. For example, if they are provided with a success criteria or if they are shown what good feedback looks like, errors may be avoided.

AfL through self and peer-assessment appears to have more of a focus on grading and less of a focus on feedback. Despite Wiliam having a vastly positive opinion of AfL, his view is that “the focus of peer assessment is often whether or not students give each other accurate grades” (Wiliam, 2018, p.156), which emphasises the impression given by Didau (2015) that AfL is often not done in a helpful way. While grades are generally important to students because of the validation they provide, it has often been said that, in fact, feedback which progresses learning is far more beneficial. For instance, in a study referred to in ‘Inside the Black Box: Raising Standards Through Classroom Assessment’ (Black and Wiliam, 2010, p.83). It could be the case that grades improve learners’ faith in themselves, or tells them they need to put more effort in, but feedback usually shows them where their learning can go next.

There is a fair amount of literature that suggests that exchanges between peers in learning has a positive impact on those involved. Burr (2003) believes that knowledge is maintained by socialisation, and that they go hand-in-hand. This may imply that knowledge and social skills develop simultaneously, meaning that both should be used if any cognitive development is to occur. Similarly, Henning, Weidner and Marty (2008) stated that the learning environment is a more relaxed and safer place for learners to be when they have a peer to interact with. It could be the case that peers have common issues, and thus, are more at ease when they have someone on the same level as them to talk through the issues with. This could help them build their knowledge together and at an appropriate pace. Another result of this may be that learners are more capable of gathering their thoughts on a manner because they are calmer, whereas being stressed could possibly cause thoughts to be clouded. Without being able to form thoughts clearly it might be difficult to develop knowledge and, hence, it would be unlikely for there to be a vast amount of cognitive development. Although, if there is a poor existing foundation of understanding there is the likelihood that the learners will be unable to concentrate on work, which could lead to discussions moving off-task.

Again, Vygotsky (1930), a pioneer of social constructivism, argues that social experience plays a major role in the development of humans, which may imply that cognitive development occurs vastly due to humans’ interactions with each other. Though, this could be limited by the fact that conversations are not always about something intellectually stimulating.

Tanner and Jones (2000) think that, within the context of a good mathematics lesson, teaching should include discussions between the teacher and pupils, but also between pupils and their peers. The inclusion of teachers within discussions theoretically reduces the

number of misconceptions that might appear if the people involved in the conversation consists only of pupils. However, it still paints peer interactions as being a vital part of a decent lesson. So, including the teacher in discussions will also hypothetically prevent pupils from going off-task.

Modelling is used frequently in education and is often viewed as a useful tool to be used. Riches (2019) believes that modelling is very powerful when used in a classroom, and that it gives students a point to aim for. Riches also thinks that modelling can be used to address misconceptions before they transpire but, conversely, has noted that a limitation of modelling is that teachers do not let students apply what they have learned from the use of modelling in an appropriate context. This information may display that modelling can be useful, but only when how the modelling is going to translate to the learners is kept in mind. It appears to be the case that modelling can become 'clinical' in the sense that learners will become more focused on following examples, rather than using modelling as a tool to gain a decent understanding of the work they are doing. However, giving learners something to aim for means they might have a clear structure to what they are doing. So, even if they do not fully understand the work, it might be the case that their thinking is clear, and hence, it may be easier for a teacher to pinpoint where the gaps in the learner's knowledge are.

Crockett (2019) affirms that there is a positive correlation between metacognition and effective modelling but views it as something that slows learning process when used improperly. Similarly to what has been suggested of Riches' work, this may be due to lack of explanation to expand understanding as a consequence of too much emphasis being placed on following a good example instead. Learners may get the impression that *knowing* how to answer questions has greater importance than *understanding* how to answer questions. Despite this, it is seemingly apparent that when modelling is done to an appropriate standard it provides learners with an awareness of the thinking that goes into answering questions. This awareness may mean that learners get a deep understanding of what they are doing.

Using worked examples in the classroom reduces the cognitive load of learners according to Barton (2018). Although a limitation of this is that it may reduce the amount of independent learning that arises in a classroom, it could be the case that learners simply cannot handle the amount of thinking that is required to solve a question autonomously, and thus require an example to follow. If learners are left to their own devices it might be the case that they suffer from cognitive overload and will be working outside of their ZPD. So, using models may be a 'scaffold' to help learners order their thought processes.

REFLECTION/EVALUATION & NEXT STEPS

After reading a range of literature, I have decided that I will use a variety of AfL techniques in my personal practice. I reached this decision because the works I have read with respect to AfL seem to have a predominantly positive view of AfL.

Before reading any literature about AfL, I did not think that questioning was a particularly meaningful way of evaluating learners' understanding as is evident in **Appendix 1**. Having said that, I now plan to implement some questioning techniques as a form of AfL into my own practice. I intend to make sure the pupils I am teaching are comfortable answering questions, even if they are not sure of the answer as I believe this may improve both their academic performance and confidence because of the research Back et al. (2003) put into using questioning techniques for AfL and because of the famous saying 'you learn from your mistakes'. However, as highlighted in the literature review, I feel relatively skeptical towards the strength of 'I don't know' as an answer since it could mean that pupils will not be thinking about how they are going to respond.

I wish to utilise self-assessment and peer-assessment in my practice. Although, through reading some of Didau's work (2014, 2015) I feel like I am more conscious of how to conduct this in a useful way. For example, when it comes to self-assessment and peer-assessment, I may provide learners with a success criteria to follow in an attempt to prevent 'shallow' comments such as 'well done' and 'you could write neater'. Or I might even model what valuable feedback should look like to try to avoid 80% of the feedback being wrong as Nuthall (2007) urged. Also, because of Wiliam (2018) suggesting that there is too much of a focus on accurate grading rather than worded feedback, I would like to assist learners in concentrating less on grades and more on feedback. I might do this by purposely telling pupils not to give themselves or other pupils grades until they have had time to properly read and reflect on the worded feedback they have given themselves or have been given when using peer-assessment. In the case of the critical incident in **Appendix 1**, Group A helping Pupil A with the work was an indicator that they might have understood the task more than she did.

When I am teaching, I hope to not have the class working in silence. My belief prior to the reading I undertook was that social interactions within a classroom are beneficial and the literature I have read thus far has reinforced this belief. Nevertheless, I have accepted that it might be the case that allowing pupils to talk to each other in lessons may lead to them going off task and talking about topics irrelevant to the work they are doing. For example, in **Appendices 2 and 3** the lessons were interactive ones, but some of the pupils veered from the task that was set by the teacher. Though, the lesson observed in **Appendix 4** would oppose this. Also, I think it will be of great importance for me to also be a part of the

interactions, as Tanner and Jones (2000) proposed, in the hope that misconceptions will be reduced and that pupils will, with any luck, be comfortable to use my knowledge to their advantage.

The final area for research that I looked at some literature for was modelling. Again, I feel as though I will use modelling to my advantage in my practice. While Riches (2019) has indicated that modelling does not often allow for students to apply the knowledge received from modelling, I would like to combat this in my own practice. A way I may achieve this is by putting a greater amount of emphasis on relational teaching, since Skemp (1976) has put forward that relational understanding can be adapted more easily to new contexts and often allows information to be recalled more accurately. Similarly, again through applying strategies to develop relational understanding, I might be able to use modelling for more than just showing a good example, which was a limitation that Crockett (2019) highlighted. Also, like in **Appendix 1**, repeatedly telling students to follow an example does not necessarily mean they will.

CONCLUSION

Overall, a great deal has been covered for the duration of this critical evaluation. Several observations took place within School A (see **Appendices**) in an effort to identify a critical incident. Different methods of observations were touched on in the methodology, but it was decided to take a non-participant, 'Diagnostic Teaching' approach. This appeared to work well because several teachers in School A said that the pupils were accustomed to observations, and so, did not seem to behave in an unusual manner. Nonetheless, it was fascinating to think and read about different methods of classroom observation.

Relating the critical incident in **Appendix 1** to Donaldson's 'Successful Futures' was interesting for a number of reasons. Firstly, due to the fact that peer-assisted learning seems to oppose a number of the four purposes. But, also, since it lets ways to assist the learners with regard to the four purposes to begin to be thought of. As 'Successful Futures' is going to be put into effect in Wales in a few years, it was useful to start being mindful of the happenings within a classroom while having the four purposes in mind.

The literature review was particularly useful because a lot of the works read were from well-known figures in education. So, taking a critical stance towards the read literature meant that both the pros and the cons of everything suggested could be thought of. Since a fair amount of research went into the different literature looked at, it seemed what was looked at was reliable. It was beneficial as well to use the literature to reflect on and make

well informed decisions about how to use of AfL, social constructivism and modelling in future practice, while also considering that they may have a number of limitations.

Reference List

Barton, C. (2018) *How I Wish I'd Taught Maths*. Woodbridge: John Catt Educational Ltd.

Black, P. and Wiliam, D. (2010) 'Inside the Black Box: Raising Standards Through Classroom Assessment', *Kappan Magazine*, 92(1), pp. 81-90.

Black, P. et al. (2003) *Assessment for Learning*. Berkshire: Open University Press.

British Educational Research Association [BERA] (2018) *Ethical Guidelines for Educational Research* 4th Ed. London. <https://www.bera.ac.uk/researchers-resources/publications/ethicalguidelines-for-educational-research-2018> (Accessed: 13 October 2019).

Burnett IT Solutions (N.D.) *Donaldson Education Services Ltd*. Available at: <http://www.graham-donaldson.com/> (Accessed: 20/10/19)

Burr, V. (2003) *Social Constructivism* 2nd Ed. East Sussex: Routledge.

Crockett, B. (2019) 'Mastering Modelling', *Durrington Research School* [blog]. 25 January. Available at: <https://researchschool.org.uk/durrington/blog/mastering-modelling> (Accessed: 14 October 2019).

Didau, D. (2014) 'Why AfL might be wrong, and what to do about it' *Learning Spy* [blog]. 12 March. Available at: <https://learningspy.co.uk/myths/afl-might-wrong/> (Accessed: 11 October 2019).

Didau, D. (2015) *What if everything you knew about education was wrong?* Carmarthen: Crown House Publishing.

Donaldson, G. (2015) *Successful Futures*. Available at: <https://www.nasuwt.org.uk/uploads/assets/uploaded/ad5b4d73-76eb-462a-8ba00412eb6e572a.pdf> (Accessed: 17th October 2019).

Encyclopaedia.com (2019) *Non-Participant Observation*. Available at: <https://www.encyclopedia.com/social-sciences/dictionaries-thesauruses-pictures-and-press-releases/non-participant-observation> (Accessed: 16th October 2019).

Estyn (2019) *A report on [REDACTED] Comprehensive School*. Available at: [https://www.estyn.gov.wales/sites/www.estyn.gov.wales/files/documents/\[REDACTED\]%20Comprehensive%20School_0.pdf](https://www.estyn.gov.wales/sites/www.estyn.gov.wales/files/documents/[REDACTED]%20Comprehensive%20School_0.pdf) (Accessed: 13 October 2019).

- Henning, J.M., Weidner, T.G. and Marty, M.C. (2008) 'Peer Assisted Learning in Clinical Education: Literature Review', *Athletic Training Education Journal*, 3(Jul-Sep), pp.84-90.
- Nuthall, G. (2007) *The Hidden Lives of Learners*. Wellington: New Zealand Council for Educational Research.
- Riches, A. (2019) 'Effective teacher modelling', *SecEd* [blog]. 9 April. Available at: <http://www.sec-ed.co.uk/best-practice/effective-teacher-modelling/> (Accessed: 14 October 2019).
- Skemp, R.R. (1976) 'Relational Understanding and Instrumental Understanding', in *Mathematics Teaching*, pp. 20-26.
- Tanner, H. and Jones, S. (2000) *Becoming a Successful Teacher of Mathematics*. London: RoutledgeFalmer.
- Tripp, D. (1993) *Critical Incidents in Teaching*. London: Routledge.
- Vygotsky, L.S. (1930) *Mind and Society*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press
- WalesOnline (2019) '*The Real Schools Guide 2019*', 20th June. Available at: <https://www.walesonline.co.uk/news/local-news/██████████-comprehensive-school-7540632> (Accessed 13th October 2019).
- Wiliam, D. (2018) *Embedded Formative Assessment 2nd Ed*. Bloomington: Solution Tree Press.

APPENDICES

APPENDIX 1

OBSERVATION / FIELD NOTES

(Questions adapted from Fletcher Wood (2016))

Date: 26/09/19
Lesson details: - Mathematics, Year 8, Set 1 - Lesson 1
Classroom culture (Are the students focused on learning?) - Students working in silence - at face value appear to be focused - Frequent questions - asking for help about work - Slight chatter - mixture of random conversations and work-based conversations
Objectives (Is there a clear purpose to the lesson? How do the lesson activities promote that purpose?) - Lesson on fractions - expanding on previous work - Aims not said explicitly - briefly on board - Starter - fraction work from last lesson - Teaching done verbally and using projector/white board
Direction (Are the students clear about what they are doing and how to do it well?) - Silence implied students were completing the work - Hands up for questions - usually asking for help with work, sometimes to say they've finished - Good and bad answer modelled on board - misconceptions also modelled in bad answer
Access and challenge (Are all students able to engage in the lesson? Are all students challenged?) - Step-by-step modelling - clear for all - Task increases in difficulty - Extension exercise for students who finished the task - Several pupils finished task, suggests understanding - Common mistakes gone over on board
Assessment How does the teacher assess student understanding before, during and after the lesson? How is this used in their teaching? - Before - starter activity based on previous knowledge - During - circulating and scanning to help with issues and answering any questions about work asked - After - RAG (Red, Amber Green) for understanding, 1,2,3,4 for effort
Specifics / Critical Incidents

Are there particular telling moments and examples which it would be helpful to discuss?

- Seen students laying it out wrong, so teacher said "lay it out like I've laid it out" - an example of modelling
- Praise for students who show good understanding
- Use of differentiation by outcome - same task, some pupils will get further than others but set expectation for everyone to get to at least question
- Pupil forgot pen, teacher lends "special pen", puts value on pen
- Swinging on chair, threat of being kept in at break, stopped instantly
- Pupil turning around to ask friends for help, teacher noticed asked if she needed help but the pupil said no so, again, the teacher said "lay it out like I've laid it out"

Model Beirniad Wedi Adfyfyrio (BWA) Assisted Reflective Conclusions (ARC) Model

Dyddiad/Date: 26/09/19

Digwyddiad critigol (Ffocws)/Critical Incident (focus): Pupil turning around to ask friends for help, teacher noticed and again said "lay it out like I've laid it out"

Profiad/ Experience	
Teimladau/ Feelings Beth yw eich teimladau ynghylch y profiad? "What are your feelings regarding the experience?"	- I felt as though the experience was useful for the pupil who turned around because they were willing to ask someone for help, even if it wasn't the teacher - It was a bit worrying that the pupil didn't seem confident enough to ask her teacher for help - Would the teacher's questioning have helped?
Cofio a Deall/ Remember and Understand Allwch chi restru'r agweddau ar y profiad dysgu a aeth yn dda? "Can you list the aspects of the learning experience that went well?" Pa elfennau o'r profiad dysgu oedd yn siomedig? "What were the elements of the learning experience that were disappointing?"	- The learning experience appeared to go well because the friends seemed to understand the work well and were enthusiastic about explaining it to the pupil - It was good that the teacher had examples to follow on the board, modelled well - It was disappointing that the pupil didn't utilise the teacher's knowledge when asked if help was needed
Gwerthuso a dadansoddi/ Evaluate and analyse Beth fyddwch chi'n cadw'r un fath i sicrhau dysgu ac addysgu effeithiol yn y dyfodol? "What will you keep the same to ensure effective teaching and learning in the future?" Beth oedd achos yr elfen siomedig bwysicaf? "What was the cause of the most important disappointing element?"	- I think modelling is useful, so I will make sure to model good answers - I think pupils talking to each other about work can help their understanding, so I will allow pupils to talk provided it's on-task - There could be a number of causes for the most disappointing element, e.g. the pupil may not have a good relationship with the teacher, the pupil may have thought she'd get into trouble for not understanding, the pupil might prefer the way peers explain, etc.
Casgliadau a chymau gweithredu/ Conclusions and actions Beth yw eich atebion posibl i'r materiau siomedig a nodwyd? "What are your possible solutions to the disappointing issues identified?" Beth ydych yn mynd i'w wneud nesaf? "What will you do next?"	- Making it clear that it's okay to not understand the work, that's the point of having a teacher - Build strong relationships with students so that they feel comfortable asking for help - Keep modelling - Make sure there are interactions between both pupils and myself, and pupils with other pupils
Y profiad newydd / Transformed experience	

APPENDIX 2



OBSERVATION / FIELD NOTES

(Questions adapted from Fletcher Wood (2016))

Date: 02/10/19
Lesson details: • I.C.T., Year 8 • Lesson 1
Classroom culture (Are the students focused on learning?) • Pupils allowed to talk provided about work • Some pupils at back of classroom talking loudly - not about task, doing minimal work • Some pupils choose to work individually in silence on the task
Objectives (Is there a clear purpose to the lesson? How do the lesson activities promote that purpose?) • Carried on from previous lesson • Aims of the lesson given verbally • Screens off when teacher talking - modelling, use to help with the task • Teacher circulates, keep people on task, helps one-to-one questions
Direction (Are the students clear about what they are doing and how to do it well?) • Some questions about the task • Most students engaged with work and don't ask any questions • One group at back off-task, said confused about what they've got to do
Access and challenge (Are all students able to engage in the lesson? Are all students challenged?) • No extension task - ongoing task, pupils did not finish because it rolls over into several lessons
Assessment How does the teacher assess student understanding before, during and after the lesson? How is this used in their teaching? • Before - how much of the task was completed previous lesson • During - circulating, people asking questions • After - how far students got with task this lesson
Specifics / Critical Incidents Are there particular telling moments and examples which it would be helpful to discuss? • Chatter at back of classroom - later told teacher that they were confused about the work • Half class worked with each other while talking, other half worked in silence and independently • Similar questions came up - teacher stopped the lesson and went to board to explain the issue



Model Beirniad Wedi Adfyfyrio (BWA) Assisted Reflective Conclusions (ARC) Model

Dyddiad/Date: 02/10/19

Digwyddiad critigol (Ffocws)/Critical incident (focus): When the same question kept coming up, the teacher went to the board to explain.

Profiad/ Experience	
Teimladau/ Feelings <i>Beth yw eich teimladau ynghylch y profiad?</i> <i>"What are your feelings regarding the experience?"</i>	- I believe it's important to deal with common misconceptions/issues by addressing the whole class because it, in theory, will eradicate the problem - I feel like it was good for the teacher to wait until the question came up several times before going to the board because it might not have been a common issue
Cofio a Deall/ Remember and Understand <i>Allwch chi restru'r agweddau ar y profiad dysgu a aeth yn dda?</i> <i>"Can you list the aspects of the learning experience that went well?"</i> <i>Pa elfennau o'r profiad dysgu oedd yn siomedig?</i> <i>"What were the elements of the learning experience that were disappointing?"</i>	- Students appeared to have a better understanding once the teacher had gone through the question on the board, so this went well - Some students were talking through the teacher's explanation and later had to tell the teacher they were confused about the work
Gwerthuso a dadansoddi/ Evaluate and analyse <i>Beth fyddwch chi'n cadw'r un fath i sicrhau dysgu ac addysgu effeithiol yn y dyfodol?</i> <i>"What will you keep the same to ensure effective teaching and learning in the future?"</i> <i>Beth oedd achos yr elfen siomedig bwysikaf?</i> <i>"What was the cause of the most important disappointing element?"</i>	- I think modelling is useful because it shows students what a 'good' answer should look like, I will use modelling to aid my teaching - Could be due to a number of reasons, such as lack of interest in the task
Casgliadau a chamau gweithredu/ Conclusions and actions <i>Beth yw eich atebion posibl i'r materiau siomedig a nodwyd?</i> <i>"What are your possible solutions to the disappointing issues identified?"</i> <i>Beth ydych yn mynd i'w wneud nesaf?</i> <i>"What will you do next?"</i>	- Waiting for silence to demonstrate may be a way of preventing chatter while modelling - Make sure everyone is paying attention before going over common questions - Try to make the work as engaging as possible so students will be interested in worked examples
Y profiad newydd / Transformed experience	

APPENDIX 3



OBSERVATION / FIELD NOTES

(Questions adapted from Fletcher Wood (2016))

Date: 26/09/19
Lesson details: • Art, Year 8 • Lesson 2 • After breaktime
Classroom culture (Are the students focused on learning?) • Pupils seem restless (because just had break?) • Settles down and focuses on work • Told to work in silence for a while because too much talking and off task
Objectives (Is there a clear purpose to the lesson? How do the lesson activities promote that purpose?) • Drawing eyes - developing on circles from previous lesson • Taken step-by-step on projector by teacher • Pupils use teacher example to draw own eye • Use mirrors to see their eyes/shape of eyes/shading of eyes etc.
Direction (Are the students clear about what they are doing and how to do it well?) • Modelled on board • Told what equipment needed • Emphasis on heaviness of pencil for shading
Access and challenge (Are all students able to engage in the lesson? Are all students challenged?) • All students doing same task
Assessment How does the teacher assess student understanding before, during and after the lesson? How is this used in their teaching? • Circulating and scanning to see that pupils on task and how they cope • Supporting pupils who need help • Pupil missed previous lesson - gave one-to-one help to get them up to speed
Specifics / Critical Incidents Are there particular telling moments and examples which it would be helpful to discuss? • Thanking students for silence, not acknowledging bad behaviour/loudness • Students praising each other's work, e.g. "yours is really good" • Teacher addressing pupils saying "I can't do it" by saying "I want negative talk to stop, you're all doing great" • Word with disruptive pupil outside of classroom

Model Beirniad Wedi Adfyfyrio (BWA) Assisted Reflective Conclusions (ARC) Model

Dyddiad/Date: 26/09/19

Digwyddiad critigol (Ffocws)/Critical incident (focus): Teacher addressing pupils saying "I can't do it" by saying "I want negative talk to stop, you're all doing great"

Profiad/ Experience

Teimladau/ Feelings <i>Beth yw eich teimladau ynghylch y profiad?</i> "What are your feelings regarding the experience?"	- I think praise is important for building confidence in students - I like that the teacher responded to the students' self-criticism
Cofio a Deall/ Remember and Understand <i>Allwch chi restru'r agweddau ar y profiad dysgu a aeth yn dda?</i> "Can you list the aspects of the learning experience that went well?" <i>Pa elfennau o'r profiad dysgi oedd yn siomedig?</i> "What were the elements of the learning experience that were disappointing?"	- I feel like the praise would help students be more confident - Students appeared to be more comfortable showing their work after the praise - Students seemed to be more engaged with the task after the praise - I feel as though there was nothing particularly negative about this critical incident
Gwerthuso a dadansoddi/ Evaluate and analyse <i>Beth fyddwch chi'n cadw'r un fath i sicrhau dysgu ac addysgu effeithiol yn y dyfodol?</i> "What will you keep the same to ensure effective teaching and learning in the future?" <i>Beth oedd achos yr elfen siomedig bwysicaf?</i> "What was the cause of the most important disappointing element?"	- I would like to use as much praise as possible in the future to help students become more confident - I feel like it is useful to use when pupils don't feel capable of completing the work
Casgliadau a chamau gweithredu/ Conclusions and actions <i>Beth yw eich atebion posibl i'r materiaon siomedig a nodwyd?</i> "What are your possible solutions to the disappointing issues identified?" <i>Beth ydych yn mynd i'w wneud nesaf?</i> "What will you do next?"	I didn't feel like there were any disappointing issues, but I intend to use praise as much as possible, without overdoing it
Y profiad newydd / Transformed experience	

APPENDIX 4

OBSERVATION / FIELD NOTES

(Questions adapted from Fletcher Wood (2016))

Date: 02/10/19
Lesson details: - Welsh, Year 8, Set 1&2 - Lesson 3
Classroom culture (Are the students focused on learning?) - Allowed to talk about work - Pupils seem on-task - Lots of hands up to answer questions - appear to be engaged in lesson
Objectives (Is there a clear purpose to the lesson? How do the lesson activities promote that purpose?) - Aims given both on the board and verbally - Mixture of independent and pair work - promote speaking of Welsh - Translation of worksheets based on example given on board
Direction (Are the students clear about what they are doing and how to do it well?) - Verbal instruction given to the students - Key words left on board to help translations - Teacher helps translate one sentence
Access and challenge (Are all students able to engage in the lesson? Are all students challenged?) - Pupils have same task - Lots of pupils finished task before end of lesson - Extension task to write about a holiday in Welsh - given verbally
Assessment How does the teacher assess student understanding before, during and after the lesson? How is this used in their teaching? - Stopped periodically in the lesson to ask for translations from people - At the end of lesson asked some pupils to say some sentences related to the work in Welsh
Specifics / Critical Incidents Are there particular telling moments and examples which it would be helpful to discuss? - Pupils greeted at door at start of lesson - Some pupils confused about task - said "it's not made very clear" - Pupils explaining the work to each other - Pupil at front turning around and shouting to other pupils across the room - not about work - Pupil had hand up, teacher didn't see, so pupil put hand down and didn't end up asking for help - Pupil got right answer, was impressed and turned to friends to reveal - Pupil left seat to approach teacher to ask a question



Model Beirniad Wedi Adfyfyrio (BWA) Assisted Reflective Conclusions (ARC) Model

Dyddiad/Date: 02/10/19

Digwyddiad critigol (Ffocws)/Critical Incident (focus): Pupil had hand up, teacher didn't see, so pupil put hand down and didn't end up asking for help

Profiad/ Experience

Teimladau/ Feelings Beth yw eich teimladau ynghylch y profiad? "What are your feelings regarding the experience?"	It was a shame to see a pupil who gave up on asking for help from the teacher because they seemed confused about the work and probably needed some help
Cofio a Deall/ Remember and Understand Allwch chi restru'r agweddau ar y profiad dysgu a aeth yn dda? "Can you list the aspects of the learning experience that went well?" Pa elfennau o'r profiad dysgu oedd yn siomedig? "What were the elements of the learning experience that were disappointing?"	- It was disappointing that the student didn't want to wait until the teacher say their hand up - It could've been the case that the student had thought more about the question and no longer needed help with the work?
Gwerthuso a dadansoddi/ Evaluate and analyse Beth fyddwch chi'n cadw'r un fath i sicrhau dysgu ac addysgu effeithiol yn y dyfodol? "What will you keep the same to ensure effective teaching and learning in the future?" Beth oedd achos yr elfen siomedig bwysicaf? "What was the cause of the most important disappointing element?"	The cause of the disappointing element may have been because the student wasn't engaged enough with the work to care about waiting for the teacher, or the student may have figured out the answer to what they wanted to ask
Casgliadau a chamau gweithredu/ Conclusions and actions Beth yw eich atebion posibl i'r materiau siomedig a nodwyd? "What are your possible solutions to the disappointing issues identified?" Beth ydych yn mynd i'w wneud nesaf? "What will you do next?"	- I aim to make sure all students know I have time to explain questions to them, if they are waiting for me, I will acknowledge their hand being up and say I'll be with them next - The previous bullet point is also a potential solution to the incident - A solution could be asking other students who understand to explain the task too



Prifysgol Cymru
Y Drindod Dewi Sant
University of Wales
Trinity Saint David

Yr Athrofa
Addysg a'r Dyniaethau
Education and Humanities

Y profiad newydd / *Transformed experience*