

1: Overall Abstract

Title of research

Primary Healthcare Reform and Financing Community Pharmacy services in Hong Kong

Problem under investigation

The Hong Kong Government has introduced the 'Primary Healthcare Blueprint' in 2022 to strengthen primary healthcare services, emphasizing prevention, early disease detection, and community-based care. Community Pharmacy service is one of the primary healthcare reform initiatives that the government is committed to promulgate services development, filling service gaps in current underdeveloped primary healthcare system.

Research Purpose statement

The purpose of this study research is to inform policy makers on policy implementation through investigation of existing international and local healthcare financing model and perception of practising community pharmacists on essential success and failure factors in proposing a sustaining and effective funding model for the new development of Community Pharmacy services initiative in Hong Kong.

Participant information

Comprehensive systematic review of international and local community pharmacy services financing models and cohorts of practicing community pharmacists from 18 districts in Hong Kong to participate in a structured survey on community pharmacy services, financing options, and essential success / improvement factors.

HKBM 7019 Critical Literature Review for Doctoral Research

Student : Chan Wai Kei Victoria
Student ID number: 2443211

Significance of study

This is a study to support evidence-based healthcare reform policy changes in the development of primary healthcare services in the Hong Kong communities. The comprehensive systematic review with validated evidence provides solid perspectives to policy maker on healthcare financing decision making. As community pharmacists being the major stakeholder of primary healthcare provision in the local community , this study adds new knowledge to real-world practical implications and financial management of the new development in community pharmacy services, providing data and evidence to support various funding options for these new development initiatives, and contributing to viable primary healthcare policy reform in Hong Kong.

Limitations in thinking about the qualitative approach in proposed research

For systematic review research methodology, there exists inherently limitations that may affect the validity of the review results as follows: research papers publication bias especially poor-quality research studies inclusion for review due to lack of available sources , heterogeneity nature of health financing studies, and limited scope for community pharmacy services financing in research evidence available for review.

Regarding qualitative research method of investigating community pharmacists perceptions, small sample sizes due to small pool of practicing community pharmacists, subjectivity in interpreting survey results, lack of standardization in synthesizing survey data makes aggregation of survey results and reproducibility of research difficult,

Keywords : *community pharmacy service, community pharmacist, primary healthcare, international healthcare financing models, public health funding, health policy reform*

2: Literature Review

Broad review of relevant field of studies

In December 2022, HKSAR government has published a Primary Healthcare Blueprint to formulate the direction of development and strategies for strengthening Hong Kong's primary healthcare system to address healthcare challenges in our society on ageing population and the increasing prevalence of chronic disease, with a view to enhancing the overall health and quality of life of Hong Kong citizens (HKSAR, 2022). In the blueprint, the core vision is to transform community pharmacies into accessible primary healthcare nodes within the district-based healthcare system, focusing on chronic disease management supports, disease prevention, and medication safety(HKSAR, 2022). In chapter 5 of the blueprint (page 81-83), community pharmacies role will be expanding in accessibility, primary healthcare services enhancements, and to provide medication management services at the district level for proximal services to public.

Existing Community pharmacies are mainly focusing retail sales of over-the-counter medicines, health supplements, and personal care products (HKSAR, 2022 p.32) and community pharmacists mainly dispense prescription drugs and provide advice on the use of medicines (SHPHK, 2020). Hong Kong public is also confused about pharmacies supervised by pharmacists and those retailers selling sundries, herbal and non-prescription medicinal products, posing risks to patient safety of undesirable responses (HK Consumer Council, 2015). Recent local researcher from University of Hong Kong has conducted an overview of community pharmacy services in Hong Kong which covers comprehensive views on pharmacists role and service practice scopes in primary healthcare, aligning the practice scopes with Primary Healthcare Blueprint (HKSAR, 2022) as well as proposing new practices development in providing medication services, community vaccination programs, chronic disease management, immunizations and preventative care in health screening services (So, 2024).

With these defined services scopes, how these services can be funded become an integral yet essential aspect to ensure current and expanded services continuity. Based on the search of evidence in local financing models for existing and prospective primary healthcare pharmacy services, little evidence can be found. In Hong Kong, while major funding source for

HKBM 7019 Critical Literature Review for Doctoral Research

Student : Chan Wai Kei Victoria
Student ID number: 2443211

pharmacy services are from government hospitals, all other services not fall under this funding model are paid by individual out-of-pocket with an absence of reimbursement coverage for community pharmacy services (So, 2024).

When searching for financial options for community pharmacy services internationally, researches and information resources found on this topic is enormous. Preliminary review of community pharmacy services financing models from four established countries, UK, Australia, Germany, and US; have been researched as the starting point to examine each model and rationale for funding community pharmacy services. NHS in the UK employs a mix of public tax-based and capitation payments models to subsidize pharmacy services (Anderson, 2020) while Australian government provides national health insurance coverage to provide reimbursements to pharmacies for services under universal coverage (Dineen-Griffin, 2020). These models provide cost financing model through broad coverage of pharmacy services at a contained cost. For Germany's financing model, community pharmacy services are funded under social health insurance funds with a mix of public and private insurance models in providing equitable access to pharmacy services (Eickhoff, 2021). US healthcare financing for pharmacy services heavily involved private health insurance with employer-sponsored plans as part of employee benefits and individual private coverage where pharmacies or patients claim reimbursements for pharmacy services utilized. This model provides fast and flexible services though coverage gaps and high costs can be devastating financial burden to citizens (Salgado, 2020).

In this preliminary literature review on financing models for community pharmacy services, search engines from Chinese University of Hong Kong Library, EBSCO, Proquest are used for textbooks and original researches sources. Local pharmacy society position paper and journal publications are searched as well. Local and international Government websites including World Health Organizations, conference websites, and newsletters are also accessed.

Indications of research gaps

Based on the initial assessment of the researched literature and articles reviewed, established financing options that provide fundings to support the promulgated Primary Healthcare reform in Hong Kong to develop community pharmacy services are spurious. With the new changes in community pharmacy services provision initiated by Hong Kong Government, reengineering of existing pharmacy services to support the restructuring also

adds to the question of financial sustainability of these new services in the longer term.

Further systematic analysis in the strengths and weaknesses of international community pharmacy services financing models with strong grades of recommendations and shed lights to applicability of these models in developing effective and efficient financial options that not only support community pharmacy services development but also improve existing healthcare financing system in Hong Kong for perpetuality.

With the reform in pharmacy services and financing options, key stakeholders engagement is critical to ensure success in restructuring and implementation of new services. Further research in opinions of local practicing community pharmacists on financial feasibility, operational pain points and critical success factors can give policy makers insightful information and feedbacks on managing this transformational change (Abdelouahab, 2021).

Research Methodologies adopted

Systematic Review is a structured approach to synthesizing evidence from multiple studies, which is also widely used in healthcare research to inform policy and practices (Goodyear-Smith 2019). It is “a review in which bias has been reduced by the systematic identification, appraisal, synthesis, and, if relevant, statistical aggregation of all relevant studies on a specific topic according to a predetermined and explicit method”¹. PRISMA-P Protocol with an elaborate checklist and guideline will be adopted to develop, conduct, and report systematic review of community pharmacy services financing models internationally and locally. (Shamseer, 2015).

For investigation on local practicing pharmacists perceptions on primary healthcare financing and community pharmacy services, cohorts of practicing community pharmacists from each district in Hong Kong will be recruited to participate in a structured survey with statistical comparison of quantitative data from Likert-type questionnaire, and qualitative thematic analysis of community pharmacists’ written responses to open-ended questions related to

¹MoherD, Cook DJ, Eastwood S et.al. Improving the quality reports of meta-analyses of randomized controlled trials: The QUOROM statement. Quality of reporting of meta-analysis. Lancet 1999; 354(9193) : 1896 - 900

HKBM 7019 Critical Literature Review for Doctoral Research

Student : Chan Wai Kei Victoria
Student ID number: 2443211

primary healthcare services including community pharmacy services, financing options, and essential success / improvement factors (GoodYear-Smith, 2019, Chapter 5 and 17) .

Research problem, purpose statements, and research questions

In an attempt to develop research knowledge on community pharmacy services and practice improvements to support reform in primary healthcare in Hong Kong, financing model for these services has far-reaching resources management implications critical to reform success. An efficient and stable financing model that ensure equitable yet easy accessible primary healthcare services is needed.

The purpose of this study research is to inform policy makers on policy implementation through investigation of existing international and local healthcare financing models as well as perceptions of practising community pharmacists on essential success and failure factors in proposing a sustaining and effective funding model for the new development of Community Pharmacy services initiative in Hong Kong.

The three questions that this research study addresses are:

1. What healthcare financing models best supports the changes in primary healthcare services affecting public and private healthcare service providers that stem from the recent development in Primary Healthcare system in Hong Kong?
2. How does the recent development in community pharmacy services affects practicing pharmacists and HK citizens' health seeking behaviour?
3. What are the changes and implications in existing healthcare financing structure, costing, fee and charges to HK citizens utilizing community pharmacy services upon restructuring of Primary Healthcare services in Hong Kong?

Further literature review is needed in the following areas to elaborate on the research topic:

- 1) Research Methodology protocols, study design, participants recruitment & sampling, including and exclusion criteria, outcome measurements, data analysis, research method limitations.

HKBM 7019 Critical Literature Review for Doctoral Research

Student : Chan Wai Kei Victoria
Student ID number: 2443211

- 2) Community pharmacy services delivery, outcomes, costing and pricing structure in Hong Kong and other countries.
- 3) Effects of AI / Technology in shaping community pharmacy services pricing and its financial implications to funding models and resources allocation.

List of 20 references

1. HKSAR (2022). The Primary Healthcare Blueprint, Health Bureau, HKSAR Government, 19 December, 2022.
<https://www.primaryhealthcare.gov.hk/bp/en/>
2. Secretary of Health Interview on Primary Healthcare for Better Quality of Life, 2023. Internet accessed 21 July 2025.
<https://cps.hkfyg.org.hk/2023/03/29/primary-healthcare-for-better-quality-of-life/>
3. SHPHK (2020). Position Statement on Enhancing the Role of Pharmacists in Primary Care, The Society of Hospital Pharmacists of Hong Kong, 2020
4. HK Consumer Council (2015). Editorial, The Choice Magazine, Hong Kong Consumer Council, Issue 467, p.2, September 2015. Available at:
<https://www.consumer.org.hk/tc/issue/all?q=467>
5. So (2024). Primary Care Pharmacy – A Review of Current Situation and Future in Hong Kong, Hong Kong Pharmaceutical Journal, Volume 31, No.1 , January 2024
6. Peri (2007) The role of pharmacists in primary care, Peri J Ballantyne, BMJ 2007; 334. Available at :
<https://doi.org/10.1136/bmj.39213.660394.80>
7. Anderson (2020). Primary health care policy and vision for community pharmacy and pharmacists in England. Anderson C, Sharma R., Pharmacy Practice 2020 Jan-Mar;18(1):1870. Available at:
<https://doi.org/10.18549/PharmPract.2020.1.1870>

HKBM 7019 Critical Literature Review for Doctoral Research

Student : Chan Wai Kei Victoria
Student ID number: 2443211

8. Department of Health (2008). Pharmacy in England Building on Strengths – Delivering the Future [Internet]. Norwich: Department of Health. Available at :
<https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/media/5a7bff2340f0b645ba3c6108/7341.pdf>
9. Dineen-Griffin (2020) Primary health care policy and vision for community pharmacy and pharmacists in Australia. Dineen-Griffin S, Benrimoj SI, Garcia-Cardenas V. ,Pharmacy Practice 2020 Apr-Jun;18(2):1967. Available at:
<https://doi.org/10.18549/PharmPract.2020.2.1967>
10. Australian Government, Pharmacy Guild of Australia (2010). The Fifth Community Pharmacy Agreement Between the Commonwealth of Australia and the Pharmacy Guild of Australia. Canberra: Australian Government Department of Health. Available at:
https://www.aph.gov.au/-/media/02_Parliamentary_Business/24_Committees/244_Joint_Committees/JCPAA/44p/Report451/Chapter2.pdf?la=en&hash=57590FA287241DECFC0371360D1AFF254150297E
11. Eickhoff (2021) Primary healthcare policy and vision for community pharmacy and pharmacists in Germany. Eickhoff C, Griese-Mammen N, Mueller U, Said A, Schulz M. ,Pharmacy Practice 2021 Jan-Mar;19(1):2248. Available at:
<https://doi.org/10.18549/PharmPract.2021.1.2248>
12. Salgado (2020). Primary healthcare policy and vision for community pharmacy and pharmacists in the United States. Salgado TM, Rosenthal MM, Coe AB, Kaefer TN, Dixon DL, Farris KB ,Pharmacy Practice 2020 Jul-Sep;18(3):2160. Available at:
<https://doi.org/10.18549/PharmPract.2020.3.2160>
13. United States Government (2003). The Medicare Prescription Drug, Improvement and Modernization Act of 2003. United States. Available at: <https://www.congress.gov/108/plaws/publ173/PLAW-108publ173.pdf>
14. Abdelouahab (2021) The determinants of organizational change management success: Literature review and case study, Abdelouahab

HKBM 7019 Critical Literature Review for Doctoral Research

Student : Chan Wai Kei Victoria
Student ID number: 2443211

Errida, Abdelouahab Errida and Bouchra Lotfi, International Journal of Engineering Business Management Volume 13, 2021. Available at:
<https://doi.org/10.1177/18479790211016273>

15. McIntyre (2016) Health financing country diagnostic: a foundation for national strategy development. McIntyre D., Kutzin J. Geneva: World Health Organization; 2016 (Health Financing Guidance No. 1). Licence: CC BY-NC-SA 3.0 IGO. Available at:
<https://www.who.int/publications/i/item/9789241510110>
16. WHO (2025) Healthcare Financing. Website : World Health Organization. Available at: https://www.who.int/health-topics/health-financing#tab=tab_1, Accessed 27 July 2025.
17. Goodyear-Smith (2019) How to do Primary Care Research, Good-Year S, Mash R, 2019. ISBN : 9781138499591
18. Moher(1999) Improving the quality reports of meta-analyses of randomized controlled trials: The QUOROM statement. Quality of reporting of meta-analysis. MoherD, Cook DJ, Eastwood S et.al. Lancet 1999; 354(9193) : 1896 – 900. Available at:
[https://doi.org/10.1016/s0140-6736\(99\)04149-5](https://doi.org/10.1016/s0140-6736(99)04149-5)
19. EggerM, Davey Smith G, Altman D. Systematic Reviews in Health Care: Meta-analysis on context, 2nd Edition. London: BMJ Book, 2001. Print ISBN:9780727914880
20. Shamseer (2015) Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis Protocols (PRISMA-P) 2015: elaboration and explanation. Shamseer L, Moher D, Clarke M, Gherzi D, Liberati A, Petticrew M, Shekelle P, Stewart LA, the PRISMA-P Group. BMJ 2015;349:g7647. Available at: doi: [10.1136/bmj.g7647](https://doi.org/10.1136/bmj.g7647)

3. Annotated Bibliography

1. Gentles SJ, Charles C, Nicholas DB, Ploeg J, Mckibbon KA. Reviewing the research methods literature: Principles and strategies illustrated by a systematic overview of sampling in qualitative research. *Systematic Review* 2016;5(1). doi: 10.1186/s13643-016-0343-0.

- Annotation: This article reviews the methodologies for literature review on research methods by using a systematic overview of qualitative sampling as a case study. Key principles and strategies for conducting comprehensive literature reviews in research methodology is outlined.
- Interpretation/Evaluation: This paper gives a overview of the research method background and is a good resource for future designing and conducting qualitative research studies.

2. So S, Pak-Yin, Yung ;, et al. Primary care pharmacy -A review of current situation and future in hong kong. *Hong Kong Pharmaceutical Journal*, Volume 31, No.1 , January 2024

- Annotation: This article provides a comprehensive review of the current landscape of primary care pharmacy in Hong Kong. It examines the historical development, existing challenges, and future opportunities in the integration of pharmacy services within the primary healthcare system. The authors discuss policy frameworks, the roles of pharmacists, and innovative models that could enhance service delivery and patient outcomes. The paper also highlights international comparisons and considers how lessons from other healthcare systems may be adapted to Hong Kong's unique context.
- Interpretation/Evaluation: This review is a valuable resource for mapping the evolving role of pharmacists in primary healthcare in Hong Kong, setting the infrastructure for community pharmacy services framework in determining related costing, pricing, and funding requirements.

3. Piraux A, Angibaud M, Nizet P, et al. Factors influencing french community pharmacists' willingness to participate in research projects: A mixed method study. *BMC Primary Care*. 2023;24(1). doi: 10.1186/s12875-023-02163-w.

- Annotation: This study explores the motivators and barriers affecting French community pharmacists' engagement in research projects. Key

HKBM 7019 Critical Literature Review for Doctoral Research

Student : Chan Wai Kei Victoria
Student ID number: 2443211

factors such as perceived relevance, time constraints, organizational support, and professional recognition as influencing factors in pharmacists' willingness to participate are identified. Recommendations to enhance research participation within the pharmacy sector in France are discussed.

- Interpretation/Evaluation: The study gives reference to promote research culture in community pharmacy. Practical problems and enablers discussed are good suggestions to bridge the gap between clinical practice and research participation. However, applicability of this study to local Hong Kong culture and healthcare research environment is questionable.

4. Schriver M, Cubaka VK, Itangishaka S, Nyirazinyoye L, Kallestrup P. Perceptions on evaluative and formative functions of external supervision of rwandan primary healthcare facilities: A qualitative study. *PLoS ONE*. 2018;13(2). doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0189844.

- Annotation: This qualitative study investigates how external supervision is perceived in Rwandan primary healthcare facilities, focusing on both evaluative and formative functions.
- Interpretation/Evaluation: The study highlights the dual nature of supervision, exploring its potential to drive quality improvement and professional development within resource-constrained health systems. This is a good management paper however not fall within the context of my research topic.

5. Errida A, Lotfi B. The determinants of organizational change management success: Literature review and case study. *International Journal of Engineering Business Management*. 2021;13. doi: 10.1177/18479790211016273.

- Annotation: This article reviews the key factors influencing the success of organizational change management and presents insights from a relevant case study, illustrating practical applications of management principles within an engineering business context.
- Interpretation/Evaluation: This study highlights common obstacles faced by organizations, with findings that are valuable for professionals seeking to navigate organizational transformation. However, focus on engineering limits its application to my research.

HKBM 7019 Critical Literature Review for Doctoral Research

Student : Chan Wai Kei Victoria

Student ID number: 2443211

6. Melo AC, Trindade GM, Freitas AR, Resende KA, Palhano TJ. Community pharmacies and pharmacists in brazil: A missed opportunity. *Pharmacy Practice (Granada)*. 2021;19(2). doi: 10.18549/pharmpract.2021.2.2467.

- Annotation: This article examines the landscape of community pharmacies and the role of pharmacists in Brazil, highlighting significant gaps in service integration and utilization. The paper identifies structural, regulatory, and professional challenges that have contributed to missed potentials for community pharmacies contributions due to current policies gap.
- Interpretation/Evaluation: This research findings are based on Brazilian political context. The relevancy of community pharmacies issues in Hong Kong remains questionable.

7. Salgado TM, Rosenthal MM, Coe AB, Kaefer TN, Dixon DL, Farris KB. Primary healthcare policy and vision for community pharmacy and pharmacists in the united states. *Pharmacy Practice (Granada)*. 2020;18(3). doi: 10.18549/pharmpract.2020.3.2160.

- Annotation: This article provides an overview of the policy landscape and future vision for community pharmacy and pharmacists in the United States. The paper examines key challenges and opportunities facing the profession, including integration with broader healthcare teams, reimbursement models, and the push for expanded clinical services in community settings.
- Interpretation/Evaluation: The study offers valuable insight into the shifting priorities and strategic direction of community pharmacies in the U.S., highlighting efforts to reimagine pharmacists' contributions to primary healthcare. The specific context of the U.S. healthcare system limits applicability of its findings to Hong Kong with different health system structures and regulatory environments. Discussions on financing issues are also preliminary.

8. Kondic AM, Trygstad T, McDonough R, Osterhaus M. Scaling community pharmacy transformation with the 'flip the pharmacy' implementation model: Program origins. *Innovative Pharmacy*. 2020;11(3). doi: 10.24926/iip.v11i3.3399.

- Annotation: This article presents the origins and foundational concepts of the 'Flip the Pharmacy' implementation model, which aims to transform community pharmacy practice beyond traditional dispensing roles. By

HKBM 7019 Critical Literature Review for Doctoral Research

Student : Chan Wai Kei Victoria
Student ID number: 2443211

outlining the program's structure, objectives, and initial outcomes, the authors highlight strategies for scaling change across pharmacies, emphasizing patient care processes and integration with broader healthcare systems.

- Interpretation/Evaluation: The paper offers a valuable case study in pharmacy practice transformation, demonstrating the feasibility and impact of systematic implementation frameworks. Professional aspects of change management are well discussed but financial implications are less focused.

9. Sepp K, Cavaco AM, Raal A, Volmer D. Profession driven improvement of the quality of pharmacy Practice—Implementation of community pharmacy services quality guidelines in estonia. *Healthcare*. 2021;9(7). doi: 10.3390/healthcare9070804.

- Annotation: This article explores the profession-driven initiatives aimed at enhancing the quality of pharmacy practice in Estonia, specifically through the development and implementation of community pharmacy service quality guidelines. This study emphasizes the importance of quality assurance and continuous improvement within community pharmacies to better serve public health needs.
- Interpretation/Evaluation: The paper offers a valuable account of how profession-led quality standards can drive practice improvement in community pharmacy settings. The emphasis on quality assurance is broadly relevant for advancing community pharmacy practice though financing is not focused.

10. Amariles P, Ceballos M, Gonzalez-Giraldo C. Primary health care policy and vision for community pharmacy and pharmacists in colombia. *Pharmacy Practice (Granada)*. 2020;18(4). doi: 10.18549/pharmpract.2020.4.2159.

- Annotation: The paper provides a comprehensive overview of Colombia's approach to advancing the role of community pharmacists within the context of primary health care reform. The authors highlight efforts to enhance the clinical role of pharmacists and describe policy measures designed to support this transition.
- Interpretation/Evaluation: Importance of policy alignment and interprofessional collaboration for successful integration of community pharmacy services is highlighted. The findings offer relevant lessons for

HKBM 7019 Critical Literature Review for Doctoral Research

Student : Chan Wai Kei Victoria
Student ID number: 2443211

Hong Kong in considering similar reforms, although specific contextual factors unique to Colombia may limit generalizability.

11. Hermansyah A, Wulandari L, Kristina SA, Meilianti S. Primary health care policy and vision for community pharmacy and pharmacists in indonesia. *Pharmacy Practice (Granada)*. 2020;18(3). doi: 10.18549/pharmpract.2020.3.2085.

- Annotation: This article examines the primary health care policy landscape and vision for community pharmacy and pharmacists in Indonesia. The paper addresses challenges and opportunities for expanding pharmacists' clinical responsibilities, as well as strategies to align pharmacy services with broader health care reforms.
- Interpretation/Evaluation: The emphasis on policy alignment and the challenges of implementation provide valuable insights for jurisdictions considering similar reforms. However, regulatory frameworks and health system structures may limit the direct applicability of these findings to settings in Hong Kong.

12. Al-taani GM, Ayoub NM. A baseline survey of community pharmacies' workforce, premises, services and satisfaction with medical practitioners in jordan. *International Journal Clinical Practice*. 2021;75(9). doi: 10.1111/ijcp.14487.

- Annotation: This article presents a baseline survey examining the workforce, infrastructure, range of services, and the level of satisfaction among community pharmacists with medical practitioners in Jordan.
- Interpretation/Evaluation: While the survey establishes a clear picture of the current state, discussions could be enhanced by deeper analysis of service expansion and integration, particularly in financing, interprofessional relations and patient care outcomes.

13. Eickhoff C, Griesse-Mammen N, Mueller U, Said A, Schulz M. Primary healthcare policy and vision for community pharmacy and pharmacists in germany. *Pharmacy Practice (Granada)*. 2021;19(1). doi: 10.18549/pharmpract.2021.1.2248.

- Annotation: This article explores the evolving role of community pharmacists within Germany's primary healthcare system. It outlines recent policy initiatives aimed at enhancing integration, expanding pharmacists' responsibilities, and reducing healthcare costs.

HKBM 7019 Critical Literature Review for Doctoral Research

Student : Chan Wai Kei Victoria
Student ID number: 2443211

- Interpretation/Evaluation: The German experience illustrates the critical importance of policy support and clear legislative frameworks for empowering pharmacists in primary care. Healthcare costing approach maybe a good inspiration to Hong Kong's reform financing.

14. Dineen-Griffin S, Benrimoj SI, Garcia-Cardenas V. Primary health care policy and vision for community pharmacy and pharmacists in australia. *Pharmacy Practice (Granada)*. 2020;18(2). doi: 10.18549/pharmpract.2020.2.1967.

- Annotation: This article explores Australia's framework for integrating community pharmacy into primary health care, emphasizing strategies for expanding pharmacists' roles in patient care and optimizing medication management.
- Interpretation/Evaluation: While this discussed integrated models offer valuable guidance for other jurisdictions such as Hong Kong in community pharmacy development, optimization to Hong Kong context requires further in depth situation analysis.

15. Airaksinen M, Toivo T, Jokinen L, et al. Policy and vision for community pharmacies in finland: A roadmap towards enhanced integration and reduced costs. *Pharmacy Practice (Granada)*. 2021;19(1). doi: 10.18549/pharmpract.2021.1.2288.

- Annotation: This article discusses Finland's policy direction and vision for community pharmacies, charting a strategic roadmap aimed at strengthening the integration of community pharmacies within the broader healthcare system.
- Interpretation/Evaluation: The Finland's approach, which balances enhanced professional responsibility for pharmacists with a focus on reducing healthcare expenditures, offers a valuable reference for jurisdictions like Hong Kong. A thorough local context analysis would be essential to adapt and optimize such models for Hong Kong's unique requirements.

16. Yong FR, Hor S, Bajorek BV. Considerations of australian community pharmacists in the provision and implementation of cognitive pharmacy services: A qualitative study. *BMC Health Services Research*. 2021;21(1). doi: 10.1186/s12913-021-06838-x.

HKBM 7019 Critical Literature Review for Doctoral Research

Student : Chan Wai Kei Victoria
Student ID number: 2443211

- Annotation: The findings highlight the practical challenges and professional opportunities that come with implementing cognitive pharmacy services in Australia. Key enablers include supportive policy frameworks, ongoing professional development, and interprofessional collaboration, while challenges often stem from workflow constraints, reimbursement structures, and resource limitations.
- Interpretation/Evaluation: The Australian experience offers valuable insights for Hong Kong, emphasizing the necessity for tailored support systems and policy alignment to fully realize the benefits of expanding pharmacists' roles in patient-centered care.

17. Sepp KM, Tuula A, Bobrova VM, Volmer D. Primary health care policy and vision for community pharmacy and pharmacists in estonia. *Pharmacy Practice (Granada)*. 2021;19(2). doi: 10.18549/pharmpract.2021.2.2404.

- Annotation: This article provides an overview of Estonia's policy landscape and the envisioned future for community pharmacy within the country's primary health care sector. It highlights ongoing reforms intended to strengthen the integration of pharmacists into multidisciplinary care teams and improve patient access to pharmaceutical services.
- Interpretation/Evaluation: Estonia's strategic efforts to integrate community pharmacists into primary care demonstrate a forward-thinking approach serves as a potential model for Hong Kong.

18. Hermansyah A, Wulandari L, Kristina SA, Meilianti S. Primary health care policy and vision for community pharmacy and pharmacists in indonesia. *Pharmacy Practice (Granada)*. 2020;18(3). doi: 10.18549/pharmpract.2020.3.2085.

- Annotation: This article examines Indonesia's primary health care policy and its vision for the evolving role of community pharmacies and pharmacists. The authors discuss recent reforms aimed at reinforcing the integration of pharmacists into the primary care framework, highlighting policy initiatives, barriers to implementation, and the potential for greater pharmacist involvement in patient care and medication management.
- Interpretation/Evaluation: Indonesia's approach illustrates the complexities of advancing community pharmacy practice in a rapidly developing health system.

HKBM 7019 Critical Literature Review for Doctoral Research

Student : Chan Wai Kei Victoria
Student ID number: 2443211

19. Dineen-Griffin S, Benrimoj SI, Garcia-Cardenas V. Primary health care policy and vision for community pharmacy and pharmacists in australia. *Pharmacy Practice (Granada)*. 2020;18(2). doi: 10.18549/pharmpract.2020.2.1967.

- Annotation: This article explores the evolving role of community pharmacists within Australia's primary health care system. It delves into recent policy initiatives aimed at expanding pharmacists' responsibilities, highlighting both the opportunities and ongoing challenges of integrating pharmacists into interdisciplinary care teams. The authors discuss how supportive regulatory frameworks, continuous professional education, and alignment with national health priorities are shaping the future of community pharmacy practice in Australia.
- Interpretation/Evaluation: For Hong Kong, this research's tailored approach—one that invests in workforce development and fosters systemic collaboration—will be critical for realizing the full potential of community pharmacy in advancing patient-centered care.

20. Pharmd KP, American B. Alternative payment approaches for advancing comprehensive medication management in primary care. *Pharmacy Practice (Granada)*. 2020;18(4). doi: 10.18549/pharmpract.2020.4.2238.

- Annotation: This article discusses innovative payment models designed to support comprehensive medication management (CMM) services within primary care. Limitations of traditional fee-for-service structures and propose alternative reimbursement strategies that incentivize pharmacists' involvement in optimizing medication use and improving patient outcomes are discussed.
- Interpretation/Evaluation: The exploration of alternative payment approaches underscores the critical role financial incentives play in integrating pharmacists more fully into primary care teams. This sheds insights to adopting such forward-thinking models could facilitate the sustainable expansion of pharmacist-led CMM services and help align incentives with broader health system goals in Hong Kong.

21. Amariles P, Ceballos M, Gonzalez-Giraldo C. Primary health care policy and vision for community pharmacy and pharmacists in colombia. *Pharmacy Practice (Granada)*. 2020;18(4). doi: 10.18549/pharmpract.2020.4.2159.

- Annotation: This article presents Colombia's primary health care policy and its vision for the future of community pharmacy and pharmacists.

HKBM 7019 Critical Literature Review for Doctoral Research

Student : Chan Wai Kei Victoria
Student ID number: 2443211

- Interpretation/Evaluation: The Colombian model emphasizes the value of interprofessional collaboration and progressive policy, offering key lessons for Hong Kong seeking to strengthen community pharmacy's contribution to primary care.

22. Gastelurrutia MA, Faus MJ, Martinez-Martinez F. Primary health care policy and vision for community pharmacy and pharmacists in Spain. *Pharmacy Practice (Granada)*. 2020;18(2). doi: 10.18549/pharmpract.2020.2.1999.

- Annotation: This article examines Spain's approach to integrating community pharmacists into primary health care, outlining regulatory developments, professional roles, and recent policy shifts.
- Interpretation/Evaluation: Highlights Spain's challenges and successes in enabling pharmacists to take on expanded responsibilities, including medication management, health promotion, and collaborative care initiatives within the broader health system are good lessons for Hong Kong to consider adopting similar strategies prospectively.

23. Hansen RN, Nørgaard LS, Hedegaard U, et al. Integration of and visions for community pharmacy in primary health care in Denmark. *Pharmacy Practice (Granada)*. 2021;19(1). doi: 10.18549/pharmpract.2021.1.2212.

- Annotation: This article explores Denmark's experience with integrating community pharmacists into the primary health care system, discussing policy initiatives, collaborative practices, and the evolving professional roles of pharmacists as they contribute to patient care and health outcomes.
- Interpretation/Evaluation: Denmark's proactive and structured model demonstrates the value of embedding pharmacists within multidisciplinary primary care teams. The Danish experience highlights the importance of clear policy direction and interprofessional cooperation, offering actionable insights for Hong Kong.

24. Hoffmann-Eubanks B, Kondic AM, Isetts BJ. Alignment of community pharmacy foundation grant funding and the evolution of pharmacy practice in the United States of America. *Pharmacy*. 2019;7(2). doi: 10.3390/pharmacy7020063.

- Annotation: This article examines how community pharmacy foundation grant funding has influenced and supported the ongoing development

and transformation of pharmacy practice in the United States. The study explores trends in funding priorities and the impact of grants on advancing innovative pharmacy services.

- Interpretation/Evaluation: This paper gives good insights through analysis of grant allocation and its correlation with practice evolution highlights the strategic role of targeted funding in driving progress within community pharmacy. Rationalization of the funding strategies can be applicable to Hong Kong.

25. Westerlund T, Marklund B. Community pharmacy and primary health care in sweden - at a crossroads. *Pharmacy Practice (Granada)*. 2020;18(2). doi: 10.18549/pharmpract.2020.2.1927.

- Annotation: This article explores Sweden's recent policy changes, professional roles, and the challenges and opportunities facing Swedish community pharmacists as they adapt to changing expectations in health service delivery.
- Interpretation/Evaluation: The Swedish experience reveals a sector at a pivotal juncture, where community pharmacists are being called upon to expand their clinical and collaborative roles. Financing model seems to be missing in this paper.

26. Ribeiro N, Mota-Filipe H, Guerreiro MP, Costa FA. Primary health care policy and vision for community pharmacy and pharmacists in portugal. *Pharmacy Practice (Granada)*. 2020;18(3). doi: 10.18549/pharmpract.2020.3.2043.

- Annotation: This article reviews Portugal's strategies for integrating community pharmacists into primary health care, emphasizing policy developments, ongoing reforms, and the vision for pharmacists' roles in supporting patient care and public health initiatives.
- Interpretation/Evaluation: The Portuguese experience, similar to other similar models for enhancing pharmacist-led care, lacks financing models in ensuring financial strength for sustainable change.

27. Martinez-Mardones F, Ahumada-Canale A, Gonzalez-Machuca L, Plaza-Plaza JC. Primary health care pharmacists and vision for community pharmacy and pharmacists in chile. *Pharmacy Practice (Granada)*. 2020;18(3). doi: 10.18549/pharmpract.2020.3.2142.

HKBM 7019 Critical Literature Review for Doctoral Research

Student : Chan Wai Kei Victoria
Student ID number: 2443211

- Annotation: This article discusses the roles, developments, and policy directions shaping the integration of pharmacists into primary health care in Chile. It reviews reform initiatives, professional expectations, and the vision for pharmacists' contribution to patient care within the evolving Chilean healthcare.
- Interpretation/Evaluation: While this article discusses progress in role development and policy support, it suggests that further structural and financial strategies are needed to ensure long-term sustainability and effective implementation—insights that could inform similar transitions in other health systems, including Hong Kong.

28. Henman MC, Bpharm MCH. Primary health care and community pharmacy in Ireland: A lot of visions but little progress. *Pharmacy Practice (Granada)*. 2020;18(4). doi: 10.18549/pharmpract.2020.4.2224.

- Annotation: This article examines the state of primary health care and community pharmacy in Ireland, highlighting the contrast between policy visions and the limited progress observed in pharmacy practice.
- Interpretation/Evaluation: In Ireland, the vision for an expanded role for community pharmacists is well explained ; but the lack of tangible progress illustrates systemic obstacles that hinder advancement, including financial costs and resources allocations.

29. Uzor KJ, Olarewaju ML, Asishana TK, Effiong A, Amaechi AU. The impact of inflation on medicine prices in Nigeria: A comparative analysis of public and private pharmacies. *Pan African Medical Journal*. 2024;49. doi: 10.11604/pamj.2024.49.56.45188.

- Annotation: This article by Uzor et al. examines the effects of inflation on medicine prices in Nigeria, offering a comparative analysis between public and private pharmacies.
- Interpretation/Evaluation: The study provides data-driven insights into how rising costs impact medicine accessibility and affordability in different sectors of the Nigerian pharmaceuticals. Significant disparities in medicine pricing between public and private pharmacies are major drivers for pharmacy fundings and that also heavily affected by inflationary pressures. This is very relevant in the analysis of a community pharmacy financing model that taken into considerations inflationary factor for Hong Kong.

HKBM 7019 Critical Literature Review for Doctoral Research

Student : Chan Wai Kei Victoria
Student ID number: 2443211

30. Armando PD, Uema SA, Vega EM. Integration of community pharmacy and pharmacists in primary health care policies in argentina. *Pharmacy Practice (Granada)*. 2020;18(4). doi: 10.18549/pharmpract.2020.4.2173.

- Annotation: The article highlights the progress made in Argentina towards embedding community pharmacists within the primary health care system, driven by supportive policy changes and professional advocacy. It reviews recent policy initiatives, professional developments, and the evolving expectations for pharmacists' roles in the primary care landscape.
- Interpretation/Evaluation: This article also discussed ongoing reform challenges, the need for sustainable financial frameworks and further recognition of pharmacists' roles as essential healthcare providers. A good review paper on pros and cons for financing healthcare .

31. Finkelstein RJ, Parker CP, Levy BT, Carter BL, Kennelty K. Development of a centralized, remote clinical pharmacy service to enhance primary care. *Pharmacy Practice (Granada)*. 2021;19(1). doi: 10.18549/pharmpract.2021.1.2348.

- Annotation: This article by Finkelstein et al. explores the establishment of a centralized, remote clinical pharmacy service designed to support and enhance primary care delivery.
- Interpretation/Evaluation: Relevancy of this paper to community pharmacy financing is minimal and outside the research scope.

32. Anderson C, Sharma R. Primary health care policy and vision for community pharmacy and pharmacists in england. *Pharmacy Practice (Granada)*. 2020;18(1). doi: 10.18549/pharmpract.2020.1.1870.

- Annotation: The article explores the development of primary health care policy in England with a focus on the envisioned role of community pharmacies and pharmacists and refining the current framework for integrating pharmacists into primary care.
- Interpretation/Evaluation: The article discusses persistent barriers to full implementation, including financial constraints, resource allocation, and the need for sustainable funding mechanisms. These insights are highly relevant for comparisons with other international models and strategies for financing community pharmacy services.

HKBM 7019 Critical Literature Review for Doctoral Research

Student : Chan Wai Kei Victoria
Student ID number: 2443211

33. Abu Assab M, Hasan HE, Alhamad H, et al. Financial indicators utilization among community pharmacists: A comprehensive study for pharmacy management. *PLoS ONE*. 2024;19(3). doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0299798.

- Annotation: This paper presents a comprehensive analysis of how community pharmacists utilize financial indicators to manage pharmacy operations effectively. The study highlights the importance of financial data in decision-making processes, budgeting, and sustaining profitability within community pharmacies.
- Interpretation/Evaluation: These findings are highly relevant to my research topic especially on financial resilience of community pharmacies.

34. Khatib R, Goundrey-Smith S. The connected community pharmacy: Benefits for healthcare and implications for health policy. *Frontier in Pharmacology* 2018;9. doi: 10.3389/fphar.2018.01352.

- Annotation: The "connected community pharmacy," emphasizes technological integration within pharmacies can provide significant benefits for healthcare delivery and policy. Advancements in electronic health records, pharmacy management systems, and enhanced communication with other healthcare professionals, are keys to improve patient outcomes.
- Interpretation/Evaluation: This paper is relevant to my research topic around community pharmacy financing and practice transformation, as it illustrates how investment in digital infrastructure and interoperability can enhance the value and efficiency of pharmacy services.

35. Jackson JK, Chaar BB, Kirkpatrick CM, Scahill SL, Mintrom M. A qualitative evaluation of the Australian community pharmacy agreement. *Pharmacy*. 2023;11(6). doi: 10.3390/pharmacy11060188.

- Annotation: This article provides a qualitative assessment of the Australian Community Pharmacy Agreement, focusing on perspectives of stakeholders on its implementation, effectiveness, and areas for future improvement. It gives insights into how this agreement shapes pharmacy practice, funding structures, and service delivery models in Australia.
- Interpretation/Evaluation: The study has good discussions on community pharmacy financing, especially in contexts where policy frameworks and government agreements significantly influence practice.

HKBM 7019 Critical Literature Review for Doctoral Research

Student : Chan Wai Kei Victoria
Student ID number: 2443211

36. Meyerson BE, Ryder PT, Richey-Smith C. Achieving pharmacy-based public health: A call for public health engagement. .

- Annotation: This paper advocates for a greater integration of public health principles and collaborations within pharmacy practice, highlighting the potential for community pharmacies to serve as pivotal access points for public health services and to form partnerships for better integrations.
- Interpretation/Evaluation: Good overview of primary healthcare community pharmacy services but lacks financial discussion nor funding models mentioned.

37. Hermansyah A, Sainsbury E, Krass I. Multiple policy approaches in improving community pharmacy practice: The case in Indonesia. *BMC Health Service Research*. 2018;18(1). doi: 10.1186/s12913-018-3258-8.

Annotation: This article discusses how Indonesia has implemented a range of policy strategies to improve the practice of community pharmacy through analyzing several governmental approaches, such as regulatory reforms, financial incentives, and professional development programs, aimed at elevating service quality and integrating community pharmacies into the broader healthcare system.

Interpretation/Evaluation: This good work is significant for research on pharmacy practice transformation. Insights on interplay of multiple policy levers—regulation, funding, and training to promote the importance of a coordinated, systemic approach for advancing community pharmacy services. Its focuses on financial resilience and practice evolution, especially in low- and middle-income settings, are good information for policy review to bridge further disparity in this population group.

38. Leiter AM, Theurl E. Determinants of prepaid systems of healthcare financing: A worldwide country-level perspective. *International Journal of Health Economics & Management*. 2021;21(3):317. doi: 10.1007/s10754-021-09301-w.

- Annotation: This article analyzes the global determinants influencing the adoption of prepaid healthcare financing systems at the country level. It explores various socioeconomic, political, and health system factors that shape the prevalence and structure of prepaid models, such as insurance schemes and other collective payment mechanisms. The study provides comparative insights into how different nations structure healthcare

HKBM 7019 Critical Literature Review for Doctoral Research

Student : Chan Wai Kei Victoria
Student ID number: 2443211

financing through prepayment systems, aiming to achieve broader health coverage and financial risk protection for their populations.

- Interpretation/Evaluation: The work is highly relevant for my research focused on community pharmacy financing, as it covers the foundational impact that health financing models have on the sustainability and transformation of pharmacy practice.

39. Hoffmann-Eubanks B, Kondic AM, Isetts BJ. Alignment of community pharmacy foundation grant funding and the evolution of pharmacy practice in the united states of america. *Pharmacy*. 2019;7(2). doi: 10.3390/pharmacy7020063.

- Annotation: This article examines the relationship between community pharmacy foundation grant funding and the dynamic evolution of pharmacy practice in the United States. The paper explores patterns of grant allocation and provides insight into the strategic priorities that have shaped the growth and transformation of the profession.
- Interpretation/Evaluation: The study provides sound evidence on the role of foundation funding in fostering progressive change within community pharmacy practice. Relevant paper to my research topic on pharmacy service funding to ensure sustainable transformation.

41. Dodson SE, Ruisinger JF, Howard PA, Hare SE. Community pharmacy-based medication therapy management services: Financial impact for patients. .

- Annotation: This article investigates the financial implications of medication therapy management (MTM) services provided by community pharmacies, focusing specifically on how these services affect patient out-of-pocket costs and potential savings.
- Interpretation/Evaluation: The study offers valuable insights for research on the economic dimension of community pharmacy service especially in patient's perspectives. Strong evidence in supporting the integration and expansion of such services in community pharmacy practice is observed.

42. Roller J, Pfeiffer A, Humphries C, et al. Community pharmacy recruitment for practice-based research: Challenges and lessons learned. *Pharmacy*. 2023;11(4). doi: 10.3390/pharmacy11040121.

HKBM 7019 Critical Literature Review for Doctoral Research

Student : Chan Wai Kei Victoria
Student ID number: 2443211

- Annotation: This article looks into the process of recruiting community pharmacies for participation in practice-based research initiatives, highlighting the practical barriers encountered and the strategies employed to overcome them. The authors discuss the issues involved : engaging busy pharmacy teams, navigating regulatory requirements, and building effective partnerships between researchers and practitioners.
- Interpretation/Evaluation: This study is particularly relevant for my research as it emphasizes the importance of tailored recruitment strategies and collaborative frameworks, and providing actionable recommendations for my pharmacists survey to foster a culture of research and evidence-based advancement in pharmacy.

43. Mcmillan SS, Chan H;, Hattingh LH. Australian community pharmacy harm-minimisation services: Scope for service expansion to improve healthcare access. *Pharmacy*. 2021;9(2). doi: 10.3390/pharmacy9020095.

- Annotation: This article explores the harm-minimisation services provided by Australian community pharmacies. Existing initiatives such as needle and syringe programs, opioid substitution therapies, and other pharmacist-led interventions aimed at reducing drug-related harm. The paper discusses barriers to service expansion, including regulatory challenges, stigma, and resource constraints, and highlights strategies to overcome these obstacles.
- Interpretation/Evaluation: The study provides robust evidence of the important community pharmacies services in harm reduction. Financing and funding models for harm-minimisation services are not addressed.

44. Yong FR, Hor S, Bajorek BV. Considerations of Australian community pharmacists in the provision and implementation of cognitive pharmacy services: A qualitative study. *BMC Health Services Research*. 2021;21(1). doi: 10.1186/s12913-021-06838-x.

- Annotation: This qualitative study explores the views and experiences of Australian community pharmacists regarding the provision and implementation of cognitive pharmacy services. The authors identify key factors influencing the uptake of these services, including professional motivation, perceived patient needs, operational challenges, and the broader healthcare environment.
- Interpretation/Evaluation: The paper presents insights into the practical realities of expanding cognitive pharmacy services in community settings.

HKBM 7019 Critical Literature Review for Doctoral Research

Student : Chan Wai Kei Victoria
Student ID number: 2443211

Its focus on enablers and obstacles to service implementation provides evidence that supports the need for tailored strategies and policy frameworks.

45. Baker S, Hijazi M, Nandakumar AK. Innovative approaches to HIV/AIDS financing: Lessons learned from the sustainable financing initiative (SFI). *BMC Health Services Research*. 2025;24(S1). doi: 10.1186/s12913-025-12529-8.

- Annotation: This article examines the outcomes and practical insights gained from the Sustainable Financing Initiative (SFI) in supporting innovative financing approaches for HIV/AIDS programs. Implementation strategies, challenges faced, and lessons learned throughout the initiative, with emphasis on sustainability, stakeholder engagement, and adaptability across healthcare systems are reviewed.
- Interpretation/Evaluation: This work adds more information on the economic models underpinning community pharmacy services, especially regarding sustainable funding mechanisms and collaborative frameworks. This is a good article with genuine validity and practical context especially suggestions on robust community pharmacy financing strategies for policy development.

46. Wu J, Niu H, Duan S, et al. Current status of pharmacists in community pharmacies in china in the health management of chronic respiratory diseases. *BMC Public Health*. 2025;25(1). doi: 10.1186/s12889-025-22272-8

- Annotation: This article investigates the role and current practices of community pharmacists in China regarding the health management of chronic respiratory diseases. It explores pharmacists' involvement in patient education, medication management, and collaboration with other healthcare professionals. Key barriers and facilitators influencing pharmacists' engagement are discussed, including training, policy support, and systemic challenges.
- Interpretation/Evaluation: This research discusses the expanding scope of community pharmacy practice in chronic respiratory diseases.

HKBM 7019 Critical Literature Review for Doctoral Research

Student : Chan Wai Kei Victoria
Student ID number: 2443211

47. Yan J. Medical insurance integration and spatial effects in china: Evidence from quasi-natural experiments and linked administrative data. *BMC Health Services Research*. 2025;25(1). doi: 10.1186/s12913-025-12946-9.

- Annotation: This article analyzes the integration of medical insurance schemes in China and examines the spatial effects of these reforms using quasi-natural experiments and linked administrative data.
- Interpretation/Evaluation: The study highlights on various insurance programs can affect healthcare access, equity, and resource allocation across different regions in china through advanced ced statistical and spatial analysis. Relevance of this paper to my research topic is not established.

48. Mohamed Ibrahim O, Al Mazrouei N, Elnour AA, et al. Randomized controlled trial parallel-group on optimizing community pharmacist's care for the elderly: The influence of WhatsApp-email delivered clinical case scenarios. *PLoS ONE*. 2024;19(10). doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0308448

- Annotation: This article presents the findings of a randomized controlled parallel-group trial designed to enhance community pharmacists' clinical care for elderly patients through the use of clinical case scenarios delivered via WhatsApp and email. The study investigates digital communication tools' effectiveness in improving pharmacists' knowledge, confidence, and decision-making abilities in managing elderly care scenarios.
- Interpretation/Evaluation: The trial's robust methodology and focus on real-world digital engagement give strong and credible evidence of integrating technology into pharmacist education, supporting broader adoption of such strategies for ongoing professional competence and improved population health outcomes. Relevancy of this paper to my research topic is under review.

.49. Khanna M, Loevinsohn B, Pradhan E, et al. Decentralized facility financing versus performance-based payments in primary health care: A large-scale randomized controlled trial in nigeria. *BMC Medicine* 2021;19(1). doi: 10.1186/s12916-021-02092-4.

- Annotation: This article reports the results of a large-scale randomized controlled trial comparing decentralized facility financing with

HKBM 7019 Critical Literature Review for Doctoral Research

Student : Chan Wai Kei Victoria
Student ID number: 2443211

performance-based payments in the context of primary health care in Nigeria. The study evaluates the impact of these two financing models on primary care outcomes, with a focus on service delivery, resource allocation, and facility-level decision-making.

- Interpretation/Evaluation: The study offers valuable evidence on the effectiveness of decentralized and performance based financing strategies in primary health care. The randomized controlled design adds validity and reliability of the outcomes, making this article a significant source for understanding financing reforms in health systems.

50. Adunlin G, Pan K. Pharmacy students' attitudes and perceptions toward financial management education. *Healthcare*. 2022;10(4). doi: 10.3390/healthcare10040683.

- Annotation: This article explores the perspectives and attitudes of pharmacy students regarding financial management education within their curriculum. Through surveys and analysis, the authors identify gaps in students' financial literacy and highlight the perceived importance of incorporating robust financial management training into pharmacy programs.
- Interpretation/Evaluation: The research states the need for enhanced financial education among pharmacy students and for educators to strengthen pharmacy education and better prepare students for the practical financial challenges they will encounter in their careers. Relevance to research topic is not applicable.

Total Word Counts : 7405

HKBM 7019 Critical Literature Review for Doctoral Research

Student : Chan Wai Kei Victoria
Student ID number: 2443211

HKBM 7019 Critical Literature Review for Doctoral Research

Student : Chan Wai Kei Victoria

Student ID number: 2443211



APPENDIX GA36d

LEVEL 7 ASSESSMENT SPECIFICATION

Student name:		Student ID number:	
Programme:	DBA		
Module:	Critical Literature Review for Doctoral Research		
Module code:	HKBM7019	Contribution to Overall Module Assessment (%):	100%
Lecturer:	Dr Tamara Savelyeva	Internal Verifier:	Dr Alice Te
Assignment Title:	Report	Word count (or equivalent):	7,500 words (+/-10%)
Submission deadline:	28 July 2025	Return date of provisional marks & written feedback:	28 August 2025 (Tentative)
Submission method:	All written assessments, where practical and possible, must be submitted via Turnitin unless otherwise instructed by the Lecturer. (Please DO NOT put this assessment specification into Turnitin or it will match many similarities with other students' submissions.) Alternative submission method (if applicable): Late submission of the assessment will result in a late penalty mark: Work which is submitted up to 1 week late will be capped at 50% for the first attempt and will be awarded a mark of 0% for re-assessment. Late submission penalties may be lifted only if there is an approved extenuating circumstances claim. Work submitted more than 1 week late will be considered as a non-submission and will not be marked. The work may be considered as a submission for reassessment if offered by an Examining Board or if there is an approved extenuating circumstances claim.		
Academic honesty / referencing:	Academic honesty is required. In the main body of your submission you must give credit to authors on whose research and ideas your work is based. Append to your submission a reference list that indicates the books, articles, etc. that you have used, cited or quoted in order to complete this assessment.		

HKBM 7019 Critical Literature Review for Doctoral Research

Student : Chan Wai Kei Victoria

Student ID number: 2443211

Module Learning Outcomes (from module syllabus)

Upon the successful completion of this module, the student should be able to:

- Undertake an advanced and systematic search and review of literature on a specific topic in business, administration, and management studies;
- Engage in comprehensive critiques and understanding of trends in the analysis of literature related to your research;
- Critically engage in current debates relates to business, administration, and management theory;
- Synthesise extant literature to form conclusions about the current state of knowledge and research in a field; Identifying gaps in knowledge and using this to generate and hone your own research aims and objectives.

TASK DESCRIPTION

Use of Generative AI in Assessment

(Lecturer to indicate Yes or Not against each element)

RESEARCH	For this assessment, you can use Generative AI to support you in research, including searching for bibliography, using tools to summarise, compare and interrogate materials.	Yes ☐ No ☒
STRUCTURE	For this assessment, you can use Generative AI to support you in structuring your submission, including creating a draft argument structure, identifying parts and headings, etc.	Yes ☐ No ☒
PROOFREADING	For this assessment, you can use Generative AI to check your own text/creation for grammatical and syntactical mistakes, including rephrasing of your own work within specific standards.	Yes ☒ No ☐
WRITING	For this assessment, you can use Generative AI to create text for submission.	Yes ☐ No ☒
CREATIVE	For this assessment, you can use Generative AI to create creative materials, such as images.	Yes ☐ No ☒
PROGRAMING	For this assessment, you can use Generative AI to create and check code.	Yes ☐ No ☒
NONE	For this assessment, you are not allowed to use any type of Generative AI support. This includes research support, structure support, writing/proofreading support and creative support.	Yes ☐ No ☒

HKBM 7019 Critical Literature Review for Doctoral Research

Student : Chan Wai Kei Victoria
Student ID number: 2443211

The Report will include three components: 1. An overall abstract; 2. Literature Review; and 3. Annotated Bibliography. Students are not expected to conduct an actual research project. Instead, students shall identify a relevant, ethical, and authentic topic for their Report.

1. Overall abstract (~1000 words)

In this component of the Report students are required to formulate a topic of their qualitative research paper and summarize their main points, which should include: Title of your research (typically no more than 12 words); Problem under investigation; Research purpose statement; Participant information; Essential features of the study design, approach, and methods; Significance of the study; Limitations in thinking about the qualitative approach employed in the proposed research; Listing of 5-7 keywords.

2. Literature Review (~4,000 words)

You are asked to write a preliminary literature review on your chosen research topic. The goal is to facilitate the development of a literature review to identify and explore a specific research topic in your field of studies. Ideally, critical literature review will assist your dissertation writing at the later stage of the program and contribute directly to your ongoing research project.

The Literature Review should include: A broad overview of the relevant field of studies; Critical analysis and examination of key concepts and theoretical groundings; methodologies adopted; Indications of the research gaps in the field; Draft research problem and purpose statements & questions (PPS & Q) of your study; List of at least 20 references for the literature sources cited in this part of the Report. Clear structure an argumentation throughout the paper is essential.

3. Annotated Bibliography (~2,500 words)

You will be asked to write an annotated bibliography of at least 50 literature sources, which are relevant to your research. Each bibliography source shall be accompanied with a description of its key points and usability for your topic of study.

The bibliography should include both recent journal articles and the classic sources that investigate seminal concepts within your field of studies. Ideally the bibliography shall be a real and practical working document, which could contribute your thesis writing. Your analysis of trustworthiness /reliability/ validity of literature sources, as well as their relevance, currency, reliability and spread of perspectives are essential.

On use of AI such as ChatGPT:

AI tools are not permitted except for grammatical checking (see p. 2 for details). Students must clearly state the use of AI at the start of their report and provide a detailed description of the following:

- 1) What AI tool was used and how it was engaged
- 2) Where in the report text the AI was utilized or its results were incorporated
- 3) Assessment of the quality and usefulness of the AI tool used in the report paper

This requirement serves the purpose of both students' and instructor's learning.

FORMATTING AND LAYOUT REQUIREMENTS

Your writing shall follow an academic format suitable for thesis and academic paper writing. Please note the following when completing your written assignment:

1. **Writing:** Written in UK English in an appropriate business/academic style
2. **Focus:** Focus only on the tasks set in the assignment
3. **Formatting:**
 - Size.* A4 paper
 - Font.* Times New Roman or Arial fonts, size 12
 - Margins.* Normal. 2,54-centimetre space at each edge
 - Line space.* 1,5-centimetre line space
 - Pagination.* Page numbers are located in the top right corner
4. **Document format:** **Microsoft Word** (.docx)
5. Ensure the assignment specification (Page 1) is attached to your assignment
6. Provide a bibliography using Harvard referencing
7. Format the assignment in **Harvard citation and referencing style**, unless otherwise approved by the instructor.
8. Refer to the **UWTSd References Guide** in .pdf:
Link: https://uwtsd.ac.uk/media/uwtsd-website/content-assets/documents/library-and-learning-resources/infoskills/Harvard-eng_v.1.2.pdf
QR code:



9. **Research:** Research shall use reliable and relevant sources of information e.g. academic books and journals that have been peer reviewed.

The expected use of a range of information sources: academic books, peer reviewed journal articles, professional articles, press releases and newspaper articles, reliable statistics, company annual reports and other company information. **Use of AI tools not permitted except for grammatical checking (see p.2 for details). Students are required** to provide a statement of their use of AI in their report paper, including the 3-point description of the type of AI, extend of AI use, and effectiveness of AI application (see p.3 for details)

An overall mark out of 100 for the whole course will be awarded according to generic assessment criteria as stated in the student feedback form (please refer to p. 6-12).

HKBM 7019 Critical Literature Review for Doctoral Research

Student : Chan Wai Kei Victoria

Student ID number: 2443211

GUIDANCE FOR STUDENTS IN THE COMPLETION OF TASKS

NOTE: The guidance offered below is linked to the five generic assessment criteria overleaf.

1. Engagement with Literature Skills

Your work must be informed and supported by scholarly material that is *relevant* to and *focused* on the task(s) set; you should make use of scholarly reviews and primary sources, as appropriate (for example, refereed research articles and/or original materials appropriate to the discipline). You should provide evidence that you have accessed a wide *range* of sources, which may be academic, governmental and industrial; these sources may include academic journal articles, textbooks, current news articles, organisational documents, and websites. You should consider the *credibility* of your sources; academic journals are normally highly credible sources while websites require careful consideration/selection and should be used sparingly. Any sources you use should be current and up-to-date, mostly published within the last five years or so, though seminal/important works in the field may be older. You must provide *evidence* of your research/own reading throughout your work, using correctly a suitable referencing system, including in-text citations in the main body of your work and a reference list at the end of your work.

Guidance specific to this assessment: Students should be referenced using the Harvard referencing style, with one combined list of references at the end of the document. At least 50 credible and relevant sources should be cited across the Report, including all its three parts: 1. Abstract, 2. Literature Review, and 3. Annotated Bibliography.

2. Knowledge and Understanding Skills

At level 7, you should be able to demonstrate a systematic understanding of knowledge, and a critical awareness of current problems and/or new insights, much of which is at, or informed by, the forefront of your academic discipline, field of study or area of professional practice, with a comprehensive understanding of techniques applicable to your own research or advanced scholarship. Your work must demonstrate your growing mastery of these concepts, principles, current challenges, innovation and insights associated with the subject area. *Knowledge* relates to the facts, information and skills you have acquired through your learning. You demonstrate your *understanding* by interpreting the meaning of the facts and information (knowledge). This means that you need to select and include in your work the contemporary concepts, techniques, models, theories, etc. appropriate to the task(s) set. You should be able to explain the theories, concepts, etc. meaningfully to show your understanding. Your mark/grade will also depend upon the *extent* to which you demonstrate your knowledge and understanding; ideally each should be complete and detailed, with comprehensive coverage.

Guidance specific to this assessment: Students should demonstrate knowledge and understanding as stated in the learning outcomes of the Module and specified in the Generic Assessment Criteria on p. 8–12.

3. Cognitive and Intellectual Skills

You should be able to: evaluate critically current research and advanced scholarship in the discipline; evaluate methodologies and develop critiques of them and, where appropriate, to propose new hypotheses; deal with complex issues both systematically and creatively to make sound judgements in the absence of complete data. Your work must contain evidence of logical, analytical thinking, evaluation and synthesis. For example, to examine and break information down into parts, make inferences, compile, compare and contrast information. This means not just describing what! But also justifying: Why? How? When? Who? Where? At what cost? At all times, you must provide justification for your arguments and judgements. Evidence that you have reflected upon the ideas of

1. Practical Skills

At level 7, you should be able to demonstrate originality in the application of knowledge, together with a practical understanding of how established techniques of research and enquiry are used to create and interpret knowledge in the discipline. This includes acting autonomously in planning and implementing tasks at a professional or equivalent level, originality in tackling and solving problems, and decision-making in complex and unpredictable contexts or situations.

You should be able to demonstrate mastery of the leading edge subject-related concepts and ideas as they relate to real world situations and/or particular contexts. How do they work in practice? You will deploy models, methods, techniques, and/or theories, in those contexts or circumstances, to assess current situations, perhaps to formulate plans or plausible, justifiable recommendations to solve problems, or to propose new models, or to create artefacts, which may be innovative and creative, thereby demonstrating your understanding of how the boundaries of knowledge are advanced through research and/or application. This is likely to involve, for instance, the use of real world artefacts, examples and cases, the application of a model within an organisation and/or benchmarking one theory or organisation against others.

Guidance specific to this assessment: Students should demonstrate their skills to identify and analyse suitable and relevant literature review sources and use appropriate Harvard referencing style throughout the Report.

2. Transferable Skills for Life and Professional Practice

Your work must provide evidence of the qualities and transferable skills necessary for postgraduate-level employment in circumstances requiring sound judgement, personal responsibility and initiative in complex and unpredictable professional environments. This includes demonstrating: the independent learning ability for continuing professional development to advance existing skills and acquire new competences of a professional nature that will enable you to assume significant responsibility within organisations; that you can initiate and complete tasks, projects and procedures, whether individually and/or collaboratively, to a professional level; that you can use appropriate media to effectively communicate information, arguments and analysis in a variety of forms for a variety of audiences; fluency of expression; clarity and effectiveness in presentation and organisation. Work should be coherent and well-structured in presentation and organisation.

Guidance specific to this assessment: The three parts of the Report should be combined into one document written in UK English in an appropriate business/academic style. The final report should be one single document with a title page and its three parts clearly labelled.

HKBM 7019 Critical Literature Review for Doctoral Research

Student : Chan Wai Kei Victoria

Student ID number: 2443211

STUDENT FEEDBACK FORM

This section details the *extent* to which the assessment criteria are demonstrated by you, which in turn determines your mark. The marks available for each category of skill are shown. Lecturers will use the space provided to comment on the achievement of the task(s), including those areas in which you have performed well and areas that would benefit from development/improvement.

Generic Assessment Criteria	Marks available	Marks awarded
1. Engagement with Literature Skills		
	20	
2. Knowledge and Understanding Skills		
	20	
3. Cognitive and Intellectual Skills		
	25	
4. Practical Application Skills		
	25	
5. Transferable Skills for Life and Professional Practice		
	10	

Assessment Mark (Assessment marks are subject to ratification at the Exam Board. These comments and marks are to give feedback on module work and are for guidance only until they are confirmed.)	Late Submission Penalties (tick if appropriate)		%
	Up to 1 week late (50% Max)		
	Over 1 week late (0%)		

HKBM 7019 Critical Literature Review for Doctoral Research

Student : Chan Wai Kei Victoria
Student ID number: 2443211

HKBM 7019 Critical Literature Review for Doctoral Research

Student : Chan Wai Kei Victoria

Student ID number: 2443211

GENERIC ASSESSMENT CRITERIA

Level 7

In accordance with the Framework for Higher Education Qualifications, at the end of Level 7 students should be able to demonstrate: a systematic understanding of knowledge, and a critical awareness of current problems and/or new insights, much of which is at, or informed by, the forefront of their academic discipline or area of professional practice; a comprehensive understanding of techniques applicable to their own research or advanced scholarship; originality in the application of knowledge, together with a practical understanding of how established techniques of research and enquiry are used to create and interpret knowledge in the discipline; conceptual understanding that enables the student to evaluate critically current research and advanced scholarship in the discipline to evaluate methodologies and develop critiques of them and, where appropriate, to propose new hypotheses. They will be able to deal with complex issues both systematically and creatively, make sound judgements in the absence of complete data, and communicate their conclusions clearly to specialist and non-specialist audiences. They will demonstrate self-direction and originality in tackling and solving problems, and act autonomously in planning and implementing tasks at a professional or equivalent level to continue to advance their knowledge and understanding, and to develop new skills to a high level. They the qualities and transferable skills necessary for employment requiring the exercise of initiative and personal responsibility; decision-making in complex and unpredictable situations/professional environments; and the independent learning ability required for continuing professional development.

Level 7	FAIL	FAIL	MARGINAL FAIL	SATISFACTORY (Pass)	GOOD to VERY GOOD (Merit)	EXCELLENT (Distinction)	EXCEPTIONAL (Distinction)
Category	0-29%	30-44%	45-49%	50-59%	60-69%	70-84%	85-100%
Engagement with literature (including current research, referencing, academic conventions and academic honesty)	Little or no evidence of reading and/or reliance on inappropriate sources. Views and findings mostly unsupported and	Poor engagement with essential reading. No evidence of wider reading. Reliance on inappropriate sources, and/or	Engagement with a very limited range of relevant and credible sources. Some omissions and minor errors.	Engagement with an appropriate range of research-informed literature, including sources	Engagement with a wide range of research-informed literature, including sources	Engagement with an extensive range of relevant and credible literature, informed by the latest research. Consistently	Exceptional engagement with an extensive range of relevant and credible literature, informed by the latest research.

HKBM 7019 Critical Literature Review for Doctoral Research

Student : Chan Wai Kei Victoria

Student ID number: 2443211

Level 7	FAIL	FAIL	MARGINAL FAIL	SATISFACTORY (Pass)	GOOD to VERY GOOD (Merit)	EXCELLENT (Distinction)	EXCEPTIONAL (Distinction)
Category	0-29%	30-44%	45-49%	50-59%	60-69%	70-84%	85-100%
	non-authoritative. Referencing conventions used incoherently or largely absent.	indiscriminate use of sources. Heavily reliant on information gained through class contact. Inconsistent and weak use of referencing.	Referencing conventions evident though not always applied accurately or consistently.	retrieved independently. Some over-reliance on texts. Referencing may show minor inaccuracies or inconsistencies.	retrieved independently. Selection of relevant and credible sources. Very good use of referencing, with no/very few inaccuracies or inconsistencies.	accurate application of referencing.	High-level referencing skills consistently and professionally applied.
Knowledge and understanding (A systematic, conceptual understanding of knowledge, and a critical awareness of current problems and/or new insights, much of which is at, or informed by, the forefront of the discipline; a comprehensive understanding of techniques applicable to their own research)	Major gaps in knowledge and understanding of the subject matter is not systematic. Substantial inaccuracies. No awareness of current problems, insights or the latest research and/or advanced scholarship within the discipline.	Gaps in knowledge, with only superficial systematic understanding. Some significant inaccuracies and/or irrelevant material. No critical awareness of current problems, insights, or latest research within the discipline.	Limited knowledge and systematic understanding of the concepts and principles within the subject area, which to some marginal extent, is informed by current research and scholarship. Some critical awareness of current problems and/or new insights, but	Knowledge is accurate and reasonably detailed. A systematic understanding of the field of study informed by, to some extent, current research and scholarship. A critical awareness of current problems and/or new insights though this may be under-developed occasionally.	Knowledge has a well-defined focus, which is reasonably extensive, coherent and detailed, with a critical awareness of current problems and/or new insights. Exhibits good understanding of the breadth and depth of contemporary and established views, and the	Excellent mastery of a complex and specialised area of knowledge. A systematic, excellent understanding of the concepts of the subject informed by current research and scholarship. Highly critical awareness of current problems and/or new insights. A critical,	Exceptional mastery of a complex and specialised area of knowledge. An exceptionally critical awareness of current problems and/or new insights. An outstanding understanding of the concepts of the subject, well-informed by current research and scholarship. A critical,

HKBM 7019 Critical Literature Review for Doctoral Research

Student : Chan Wai Kei Victoria

Student ID number: 2443211

Level 7	FAIL	FAIL	MARGINAL FAIL	SATISFACTORY (Pass)	GOOD to VERY GOOD (Merit)	EXCELLENT (Distinction)	EXCEPTIONAL (Distinction)
Category	0-29%	30-44%	45-49%	50-59%	60-69%	70-84%	85-100%
			often under-developed.		work is, at least in part, well-informed by current research and scholarship.	awareness of how the boundaries of knowledge are advanced through research.	sophisticated and nuanced awareness of how the boundaries of knowledge are advanced through research.
Cognitive and intellectual skills (Critical evaluation of current research and methodologies and develop critiques of them and, where appropriate, to propose new hypotheses; make sound judgements in the absence of complete data.)	Wholly or almost wholly descriptive work. Little or no evaluation or critique or attempt at a systematic approach. Failure to develop arguments, leading to illogical or invalid judgements. Unsubstantiated generalisations, made without use of credible evidence.	Largely descriptive work, with superficial use of critical evaluation of research and methodologies. Absent or weak development of hypotheses and judgements. Information accepted uncritically, uses generalised statements made with scant evidence and unsubstantiated opinions. Ideas	Limited attempt at critical evaluation/ critique of current research and methodologies, tending towards description. Limited attempt to propose new hypotheses. Can deal with complex issues but not systematically or creatively. Some evidence to support emerging	Some critical evaluation/ critique of current research and methodologies, though slightly underdeveloped in places. Proposes adequate but limited new hypotheses, where relevant. Can deal with complex issues but not fully systematically or creatively. Ability to make	Sound critical evaluation/ critique of current research and methodologies, Proposes new hypotheses, where appropriate. Can deal with complex issues systematically and with some creativity. Ability to make sound judgements based on data (that may be incomplete)	Excellent critical evaluation/ critique of current research and methodologies, Proposes innovative hypotheses, where appropriate. Can synthesise complex issues systematically and creatively. Ability to investigate contradictory or incomplete information and	Exceptional critical evaluation/ critique of current research and methodologies, Proposes innovative hypotheses, where appropriate. Exemplary systematic and creative synthesis of complex issues. Ability to investigate contradictory or

HKBM 7019 Critical Literature Review for Doctoral Research

Student : Chan Wai Kei Victoria

Student ID number: 2443211

Level 7	FAIL	FAIL	MARGINAL FAIL	SATISFACTORY (Pass)	GOOD to VERY GOOD (Merit)	EXCELLENT (Distinction)	EXCEPTIONAL (Distinction)
Category	0-29%	30-44%	45-49%	50-59%	60-69%	70-84%	85-100%
		sometimes illogical and contradictory.	judgements but these may be underdeveloped or with a little inconsistency / mis-interpretation. May assert rather than argue a case.	judgements based on data (that may be incomplete) but with some tendency to assert/state opinion rather than argue on the basis of reason and evidence.		make strong, persuasive, arguments and sophisticated judgements.	incomplete information and make strong, persuasive, arguments and sophisticated, nuanced, judgements. Potential for journal publication or doctoral research.
Practical skills (Originality / creativity in the application of knowledge, tools and techniques and in tackling and solving problems in complex and unpredictable professional situations; practical use of established techniques of research and enquiry to create	Limited or no use of methods, materials, tools and/or techniques. Little or no appreciation of the context of the application. Limited understanding of the application of theory to practice or making	Rudimentary application of methods, materials, tools and/or techniques but without consideration and competence. Flawed appreciation of the context of the application. Weak understanding of	An awareness and mostly appropriate application of well-established methods, materials, tools and/or techniques, with occasional errors. Basic appreciation of the context of the application. Theoretical	An appropriate application of standard methods, materials, tools and/or techniques. Clear appreciation of the context of the application. Mainly consistent, accurate and logical application of	A very good application of a range of methods, materials, tools and/or techniques. Very good consideration of the context of the application, with perceptive insights. Can identify problems and propose appropriate	An advanced application of knowledge, methods, materials, tools and/or techniques. The context of the application is well considered, and insightful. Can identify complex problems and propose excellent	Exceptional application skills in complex, unpredictable, contexts, drawing skilfully on the latest research within the discipline. Can identify complex problems and propose sophisticated, original solutions.

HKBM 7019 Critical Literature Review for Doctoral Research

Student : Chan Wai Kei Victoria
Student ID number: 2443211

Level 7	FAIL	FAIL	MARGINAL FAIL	SATISFACTORY (Pass)	GOOD to VERY GOOD (Merit)	EXCELLENT (Distinction)	EXCEPTIONAL (Distinction)
Category	0-29%	30-44%	45-49%	50-59%	60-69%	70-84%	85-100%
and interpret knowledge in the discipline.)	appropriate links between the two. Very weak problem-solving skills in complex and unpredictable contexts.	the application of theory to practice, with only occasional evidence of making appropriate links between the two. Weak problem-solving skills in complex and unpredictable contexts.	knowledge and understanding applied in practice, but not always making logical links between the two. Can identify problems and propose basic solutions without fully appreciating the complexity of unpredictable contexts.	theory to practice, making appropriate links between the two. Can identify problems and propose mostly appropriate solutions in complex and unpredictable contexts, with elements of originality.	solutions in complex and unpredictable contexts. Evidence of originality and creativity.	solutions. An excellent grasp of techniques applicable to own research or advanced scholarship. Shows originality in application of knowledge and techniques, and of how established techniques of enquiry create and interpret knowledge in the discipline.	An outstanding application of techniques applicable to own research or advanced scholarship. Shows originality in application of knowledge and techniques, and of how established techniques of enquiry create and interpret knowledge in the discipline with assimilation and development of cutting edge processes and techniques.
Transferable skills for life and professional practice	Communication medium is inappropriate or misapplied. Work is poorly structured,	Communication medium is poorly designed and/or not suitable for the audience.	Can communicate in a suitable medium but with some room for improvement.	Can communicate effectively in a suitable format, but may have minor errors.	Can communicate well, confidently and consistently in a suitable format.	Can communicate professionally confidently and consistently in a suitable format.	Can communicate with an exceptionally high level of professionalism.

HKBM 7019 Critical Literature Review for Doctoral Research

Student : Chan Wai Kei Victoria

Student ID number: 2443211

Level 7	FAIL	FAIL	MARGINAL FAIL	SATISFACTORY (Pass)	GOOD to VERY GOOD (Merit)	EXCELLENT (Distinction)	EXCEPTIONAL (Distinction)
Category	0-29%	30-44%	45-49%	50-59%	60-69%	70-84%	85-100%
(Exercise of self-direction, autonomy and personal responsibility; plan and implement tasks at a professional level; independent learning; use appropriate media to communicate effectively and professionally to a variety of audiences; fluency of expression; systematic approach; clarity and effectiveness in presentation and organisation.)	disorganised and/or confusingly expressed. Very weak use of language and/or very inappropriate style. Little or no evidence of autonomy (or collaboration, where relevant) in the completion of tasks. Little or no evidence of the skills required in professional, postgraduate employment.	Work is poorly presented in a disjointed manner. It is loosely, and at times incoherently, structured, with information and ideas often poorly expressed. Weak use of language and/or inappropriate style. Weak independent initiative (or collaboration, if relevant). Limited evidence of the skills required in professional, postgraduate employment.	Mostly ordered presentation and structure in which relevant ideas / concepts are reasonably expressed. Work may lack coherence in places. Can work as part of a team, but with limited involvement in group activities. Demonstrates some but not all of the basic skills required in professional, postgraduate employment, with some areas of minor weakness.	Mostly coherent, organised work, in a suitable structure and is for the most part clearly expressed. Can work effectively independently and/or as part of a team, with clear contribution to group activities. Demonstrates the skills required in professional, postgraduate employment, with some areas of strength and some of minor weakness.	Work is coherent, fluent, well-structured and organised. Can work very well autonomously and/or as part of a team, with a good contribution to group activities. Demonstrates comprehensive professional, postgraduate employment skills.	Work is coherent, very fluent and is presented professionally. Can work autonomously with initiative. Where relevant can work professionally within a team, showing leadership skills as appropriate, managing conflict and meeting obligations. Demonstrates excellent professional, postgraduate employment skills and a strong appetite for further development.	Work is remarkably coherent, very fluent and is presented professionally. Can work outstandingly well and professionally within a team, showing advanced leadership skills. Demonstrates exemplary professional, postgraduate employment skills and a strong appetite for further development.

HKBM 7019 Critical Literature Review for Doctoral Research

Student : Chan Wai Kei Victoria
Student ID number: 2443211

THIS DOCUMENT IS ALSO AVAILABLE IN WELSH