

MA CAA History of Astrology
Module
Astrological Historiography
Notes
Nicholas Campion (with acknowledgements to Ken Miller)

*Please note – these are preliminary notes on the topic

Historiography is the writing (graphy) of history. Implicit in this word is the idea that history is something that historians write. In this sense, if the past is just recorded, the recorder is an archivist or antiquarian.

The term history has several meanings. For example, important events are often described as 'historical': witnesses to such events often talk of 'seeing history unfold', or 'witnessing history'. In some usages, anything old is a 'piece of history'. However, most historians would regard 'history' as being the interpretive discipline through which meaning is ascribed to past events. According to this usage, past event thus only becomes historical once it is subjected to the scrutiny of the historian. To describe the past without interpreting and analysing it is to be a chronicler rather than a historian. History as a discipline comes alive with the various interpretative frameworks used by the historian.

We can approach the problem of historiography through different perspectives.

1. We can explore the historiography of the historiography of astrology; that is, we can explore a range of theories in the writing of history, from initial hostility (Sarton) to cautious interest (Thorndike, Neugebauer, Pingree) to methodological neutrality (Curry). Imported from the Study of Religions, we find attitudes such as Wouter Hanegraaff's: 'Empirical research must be based on methodological agnosticism with regard to religious and philosophical "first principles", and must fully recognise the historicity of religious phenomena'.¹ In this sense if we study the history of astrology, we have to accept astrology as true within the world view of its practitioners, just as we would accept Christianity as true: no discussion of medieval Christianity ever begins with the question of whether God exists.

¹ Wouter Hanegraaff, "Empirical Method in the Study of Esotericism," *Method & Theory in the Study of Religion* Volume 7/2 (1995):

http://www.alpheus.org/html/articles/esoteric_history/Empirical%20method%20in%20the%20study%20of%20esotericism.pdf p. 99.

Arthur Versluis calls this a 'sympathetic empiricist approach'.²

2. Part of the study of the history of astrology is the use of astrology as a means of analysing history. Astrological Historiography is a term I devised in order to describe the tradition by which astrology is used as an interpretative framework.²

- Astrological historiography = the use of astrology to provide an analytical framework in the writing of history
- The history of astrological historiography = part of the history of astrology
- Main assumption: that history moves in phases (a) measured by celestial patterns or (b) analogous to seasons (= the 'Great Year')
- Distinctive technique: great conjunctions = periodic major aspects (chiefly conjunctions) of slow moving planets (traditionally Jupiter and Saturn, with addition of Uranus, Neptune and Pluto in modern astrology)

Frank Manuel: "our societies have from time to time constructed new pictures of the total meaning of historical existence, and these have almost always included predictions of things to come as well as a reduction of the whole of the past to an order. These efforts are what I call philosophies of history."³

We can examine the history of the relationship between historical and astrological studies, in view of the long association between the two both in the classical world and in Medieval, Renaissance and early modern Europe. There is evidence from the cuneiform texts that astrology and history emerged from common roots, at least in the ancient near east, both disciplines being, in essence, studies of what happens when time passes.

Historians are polarised between those who regard the past as objectively knowable (there is a real truth which historians can identify, given sufficient effort and attention to the evidence) on the one hand, and those who believe that the past can have no meaning or truth independent of the historian's own current set of opinions, on the other. The arguments of the former were put strongly by Geoffrey Elton, the latter by contemporary post-modernists. Most historians occupy a middle ground, keen to understand the past on its own terms but aware of their own role as interpreters. In this sense, history has learnt much from recent developments in anthropology which recognises that no person from one culture can study another free from the biases inherent in their own culture. In the sense that the past is another culture, of 'a foreign

2 <http://www.esoteric.msu.edu/VolumeIV/Methods.htm>. Volume IV, What is Esoteric? Methods in the Study of Western Esotericism By Arthur Versluis

² Campion, Nicholas., 'Astrological Historiography in the Renaissance: The Work of Jean Bodin and Louis Le Roy', in Kitson, Annabella (ed.) *History and Astrology: Clio and Urania Confer*, London: Unwin Paperbacks 1989, pp. 89-136.

³ Manuel, *Shapes of Philosophical History*, 137.

country' in Lowenthal's phrase,⁴ historians need to understand their place in contemporary culture before they can interpret the evidence of past cultures. The change of fashion in historical interpretation has led to its own history - the history of historiography, or the history of the writing of history.

Until the seventeenth century astrology was part of the European historian's methodological toolkit. There were, on the one hand, those whose primary tool was astrology, and who took their cue from the Persian tradition, mediated through the astrologers of the Islamic world, Masha'allah and Abu Ma'shar, with significant input from Ptolemy's *Tetrabiblos*. On the other, there were those whose principle interest was in chronicling events, and for whom reference to the great conjunctions of Jupiter and Saturn or the appearance of comets provided a general context. One question for this module is therefore to inquire how astrology functions as a form of historiography

Discussion of astrology's role as an aide to the study of history necessarily involves theories of cyclical time, teleological perspectives (which assume a future outcome or purpose, towards which current events are heading) and prediction. In the west, theories of cyclical and teleological history are based in two texts, Plato's *Timaeus* and *Republic*. Prediction is generally considered to be outside historical studies by modern theorists, but it is a natural consequence of cyclical and teleological models.

The fundamental theoretical underpinnings of European Astrological Historiography is Plato's view of the planets as chronocrators (timers). The relevant quote from Plato is:

Wherefore, as a consequence of this reasoning and design on the part of God, with a view to the generation of Time, the sun and moon and five other stars, which bear the appellation of "planets" [i.e., 'wanderers'], came into existence for the determining and preserving of the numbers of Time.⁵

Apocalyptic traditions are also pertinent, following Plato's statement that the world would come to an end when all the spheres, that is all the stars and planets, return to the points of their creation.

The complete number of Time fulfils the Complete year when all the eight circuits with their relative speeds, finish together and come to a head, when measured by the revolution of the Same and the Similarly-moving. (*Timaeus* 39D).

⁴ Lowenthal, David, *The Past is a Foreign Country*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1985.

⁵ Plato, *Timaeus* 38C.

This, combined with Berossus' similar predictions and Old Testament warnings of the celestial omens which were to accompany the 'End of Days' resulted in a close connection between astrology and apocalyptic theories.

Platonic theory was adapted into the Persian 'conjunctural theory', in which history was divided into twelve periods of one thousand years by major Jupiter-Saturn conjunctions.

The theory of Renaissance Astrological Historiography was summed up by Eugenio Garin:

On the theoretical level one is dealing with the precise philosophy of history based on a conception of the universe, and characterized by consistent naturalism and a rigid determinism. On the practical level the acceptance of such a doctrine brings with it the attempt at an exact reading of the heavens to foresee the fates which await us, the one was always uncertain whether some kind of escape would be open to man into the area free from the contingencies which occur under the moon. The wisest of men is, then, he who reads human history and the stars; and some people hold that, precisely because the knowledgeable astrologer truly interprets the ways of the stars he, and only he, can establish that operative magic which allows one, by making use of the game of the heavenly configurations, to escape their harmful consequences, if they are foreseen in time.⁶ (my emphasis)

astrologers believed that "decisive historical crises, such as changes in the leadership of peoples and cultures, the advent or demise of religions, the establishment and the fall of kingdoms and empires: all this was ordered by the movements of the heavenly system."⁷

They also believed that "the theory of great conjunctions [of Jupiter/Saturn]... Which purport to be at the same time a rational interpretation of what is past and a prophecy of what is to come."⁸

Garin's view in determinism was repeated by Veenstra: "Eugenio Garin has drawn attention to the great importance of this astrological historicism which he does not hesitate to describe as a 'precise philosophy of history based on a conception of the universe, and characterized by consistent naturalism and a rigid determinism'."⁹

However, the source of "rigid astral determinism" Garin introduces is Abu Ma'ashar's *Introduction to Astrology* which he says "was widely circulated and read in humanist circles from the 14th to the 15th century. [It says]

⁶ Garin, Eugenio, *Astrology in the Renaissance: The Zodiac of Life*, London, Boston: Routledge, 1976, p. 16.

⁷ Garin, p. 16

⁸ Garin, p. 18.

⁹ Veenstra and Pignon, *Magic and Divination at the Courts of Burgundy and France*, 111.

Celestial determinism is unalterable; all human choices impossible.” And yet even here he reports that in the margin of a Paris manuscript someone wrote *‘beware, this discourse is harsh.’*¹⁰

Albertus Magnus (d.1280) rationalised the use of astrology for ‘elections’, which would include political ‘elections’. According to Smoller:

To preserve human free will, Albert drew a clear demarcation between man's body and his soul. The soul received its essence wholly from the first cause and hence was not like the other inferior substances. Human reason and will were thus free from stellar control, although a man who did not resist the flesh would be swept along by the stars. Having dealt with the objection that astrology denies man's freedom of will, Albert endorsed not just the divinatory practice of casting nativities but some more operative aspects of astrology as well. He approved of electing propitious hours to begin an undertaking and even of engraving astrological images on gems and minerals to work marvels. In the *Speculum Astronomiae* he went so far as to say that **it was rash and working against the freedom of the will not to elect astrologically propitious times for one's actions.**¹¹

Pierre d'Ailly (1350-1420) thought “history proves the truth of astrology, and astrology revealed the broad patterns of history. A person equipped with a thorough knowledge of both could use the stars to predict the future course of events.”¹² In his historical works he “offered empirical evidence of astrology's truth and gave examples of its relevance to other disciplines.”¹³

D'Ailly had three broad goals with regards to his historical writings, “first, he sought to establish astrology's place as a science useful to the fields of chronology and history. Second, he hoped that the evidence of his astrological history would confirm the use of the stars to examine the future and the present.”¹⁴ Thirdly he hoped to use astrological narrative to understand traditional Christian history.

He wrote that “astrology can eliminate predictions of abundant or scarce harvests, or even of acts proceeding from human free will. Naturally, in both cases the astrologers can offer only conjectures, for neither the weather nor human actions can be forecast with certainty.”¹⁵ That said, “to the believer in astrology, an incorrect prediction indicated a faulty calculation or failure to

¹⁰ Veenstra., 20–21.

¹¹ Smoller, *History, Prophecy, and the Stars*, 30.

¹² Smoller, p. 61

¹³ Smoller p. 75.

¹⁴ Smoller, p. 61.

¹⁵ Smoller, p. 64

consider all the celestial influences; prognostications could also be wrong due to the unpredictable actions of man's free will or of God."¹⁶

D'Ailly's astrology sought to demonstrate how the planets' influences in history illustrated "the patterns of human destiny. Through astrology, he sought to understand the crisis of his own age and to establish its place in the chronology of the Apocalypse set out by Scripture. Only by understanding precisely the rhythm of the stars could he hope to know it is only time was to see the beginning of a new astrologically determined era, the world's final one, or if that change belongs to a more distant time."¹⁷ In his own way he was doing what Collingwood explains is the value of history, namely that "it teaches us what man has done and thus what man is."¹⁸

Although astrology ceased to be an acceptable historiographical tool amongst most western historians during the 17th century, astrological historiography has remained a part of astrological culture. In that respect two developments are of interest

1. The 'outer' planets, Uranus, Neptune and Pluto, were added to the Persian system of Jupiter-Saturn conjunctions.
2. New Age ideology and Aquarian Age schemes have been added to traditional apocalyptic systems,

In other respects the underlying assumptions can be considered similar to those of the first-fourth centuries.

The study of astrological historiography requires

- An understanding of contemporary debates on the nature and function of history
- An engagement with theories of history as dominated by patterns, including cyclical waves, epochs, and teleological perspectives.
- A consideration of astrology's traditional role as a historiographical tool.
- An understanding of the complexity involved in the construction of historical meaning.
- A recognition that all theories of the past are based on contested evidence.

The following questions might be considered:

- Does astrology provide a credible philosophy of history?: one problem here would be how one judges the word 'credible'.
- To what extent is the theory of progress central to astrological ideas of history?
- What part did Persian conjunctional theory play in medieval historiography?
- To what extent do ideas about the coming Age of Aquarius rely on theories of human improvement through progress?

¹⁶ Smoller, p. 83.

¹⁷ Smoller, p. 77.

¹⁸ Collingwood, *Idea of History (The)*, 10.

Astrology as Political Science

The use of astrology to interpret the past is closely bound up with the use of astrology to analyse politics. This venture is conventionally one of the four branches of medieval astrology (the others being nativities, elections (the use of astrology to auspicious moments to initiate action) and interrogations (now horary astrology, the interpretation of horoscopes calculated for the moment that questions are asked)).

Until the seventeenth-century mundane astrology was usually known as the study of 'Revolutions' - i.e., the revolutions of Jupiter and Saturn around the earth which together were seen as the main timers of history. The use of the term revolution to describe political upheavals is derived from the astrological meaning.

The Sun's ingress into Aries was also known as a 'Revolution'. (William Ramesey, *Astrology Restaurata or Astrology Restored: Being an Introduction to the General and Chief Part of the Language of the Stars*, London 1653, p. 218).

The Latin term Mundi - world - was used to describe the application of astrology to the world from the eleventh century onwards (the 'first' medieval astrological text was Gerbert D'Auvergne's *Liber Planetis at Mundi Climatibus*, c. 1010-1027), though the technical term 'mundane astrology' first appears in the nineteenth century.

By the seventeenth-century, the study of Revolutions was also known as 'Astrologia Munda': Book 4 of Ramesey's *Astrology Restaurata* was titled 'ASTROLOGIA MUNDA or Astrology In it's PURITY BEING A Short but Compendious INTRODUCTION to the ludging of the ANNUAL or YEARLY REVOLUTIONS OF The WORLD; by which, AS ALSO ECLIPSES, Great CONIUNCTIONS, COMETS AND BLAZING STARS Are ludged (by the ordinary Course and Order of NATURE)'

I am also grateful to Lee Lehman for pointing out that Morinus, astrologer to Louis XIII of France referred to "annua mundi revolutio" (*Astrologica Gallica*, page 709), so this was probably the early usage: for an Aries Ingress, or some other annual chart, and the word 'mundi' was then most likely generalized to the whole study of the field.

Mundus is a translation of the Greek word 'Kosmos', meaning 'world-order' probably first used by either the philosopher Parmenides or Pythagoras. It can also be translated as 'adornment', the root of the modern 'cosmetic'. As Pliny (AD 23/4 - 79) wrote:

The Greeks have designated the world by a word that means 'ornament', and we have given it the name of mundus, because of its perfect finish and grace. For what could be more beautiful than the heavens which contain all beautiful things? Their very names make this

clear: Caelum (heavens) by naming that which is beautifully carved; and Mundus (world), purity and elegance.¹⁹

Applications

Traditionally mundane astrology had two main functions -

1. to understand the past and

2. to predict the future

but perhaps these are both working towards a single third function -

3. to manage the present

Charles Carter wrote that

The aim then of Political Astrology is the study of all that pertains to the life of a politically incorporated body, or nation. It must comprehend the cultural and intellectual life, the religious life, the economic, and so forth.²⁰

Mundane (or political) astrology then becomes the predictive wing of astrological historiography's interpretation of the past. Prediction becomes the means to manage the future and this shape history's development to a number of aims, perhaps to avoid future crisis, or to provide personal advantage

Reading

Secondary Sources

Ben-Zaken, Avner, 'The Heavens of the Sky and the Heavens of the Heart: The Ottoman Cultural Context for the Introduction of Post-Copernican Astronomy', *The British Journal for the History of Science*, Vol. 37, No. 1 (Mar., 2004), pp. 1-28.

JSTOR

Campion, Nicholas., 'Astrological Historiography in the Renaissance: The Work of Jean Bodin and Louis Le Roy', in Kitson, Annabella (ed.) *History and Astrology: Clio and Urania Confer*, London: Unwin Paperbacks 1989, pp. 89-136.

Campion, Nicholas, *The Great Year: Astrology, Millenarianism and History in the Western Tradition*, London: Penguin 1994, 'Introduction: History, Time and Ritual', pp. 1-34.

MACAA ON-LINE LIBRARY

The book is available second-hand on-line, but the price varies considerably.

¹⁹ Pliny, *De Natura Rerum*, Book 2, III, 8.

²⁰ Charles Carter, *An Introduction to Political Astrology*, London: L.N.Fowler 1951, p. 13.

Campion, Nicholas, 'Prophecy, Cosmology and the New Age Movement: the extent and nature of contemporary belief in astrology', PhD thesis, University of the West of England 2004, chaps 2 and 3.

MACAA ON-LINE LIBRARY

Campion, Nicholas, *A History of Western Astrology*, Vol 1. The Ancient World, London: Continuum, 2009 (first published as *The Dawn of Astrology: A Cultural History of Western Astrology*, London: Continuum, 2008, Vol. 2, The Medieval and Modern Worlds, London: Continuum, 2009.

The significant sources are scattered throughout these books.

Cramer, Frederick, 'Some Recent European Publications on Ancient Pseudo--Science and Its Adversaries', *Isis*, Vol. 38, No. 3/4 (Feb., 1948), pp. 194-197
JSTOR

Curry, Patrick 'Astrology on Trial, and its Historians: Reflections on the Historiography of 'Superstition'', *Culture and Cosmos*, Autumn/Winter 2000, Vol. 4 no 2, pp. 47-56.

MACAA ON-LINE LIBRARY CULTURE AND COSMOS

Martinón-Torres, Marcos, 'The Archaeology of Alchemy and Chemistry in the Early Modern World: An Afterthought', *Archaeology International*, Vol. 15, 2012.

<http://www.ai-journal.com/article/view/ai.1508/293>

North, John, 'Astrology and the Fortune of Churches', in *Stars, Minds and Fate: Essays in Ancient and Medieval Cosmology*, London, The Hambledon Press 1989, pp. 59-89.

PDF

Garin, Eugenio, *Astrology in the Renaissance: The Zodiac of Life*, London, Boston: Routledge, 1976

Smoller, Laura Ackerman, *History, Prophecy, and the Stars: The Christian Astrology of Pierre d'Ailly, 1350-1420*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1994.

Kennedy, E.S.; Pingree, David, *The Astrological History of Masha'Allah*, Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press 1971.

Almost impossible to obtain but useful if you can find a copy in a library.

Pingree, David, *The Thousands of Abu Ma'shar*, Warburg Institute, London 1968

Almost impossible to obtain but useful if you can find a copy in a library.

In addition other sources from History of Astrology Module reading lists.

Primary Sources

A word needs to be said about the use of astrological material. This provides the raw data for any written assignment requiring analysis of astrological practices and claims. You can use any astrology text as long as it is relevant to the period or question you are writing about as long as such sources are used as indications of astrological opinions, and NOT used as historical references – that is, NOT used to make statements about history.

Vital modern sources include the work of Dane Rudhyar but remember that any on-line astrological text is a primary source. It is then part of your task to assess its importance or significance.

16th and 17th century English almanacs and prophetic texts are available via EEBO (Early English Books Online), which is accessible via ATHENS.

Modern astrological works are available in print second hand or on-line. It is up to you to search these out.

Plato, *Republic*, 2 Vols., trans. Paul Shorey, Cambridge Mass., London: Harvard University Press 1937, esp. Book 10.

<http://classics.mit.edu/Plato/republic.11.x.html>

Significant for the theoretical framework on which medieval and Renaissance astrological historiography was based.

Plato, *Timaeus*, trans. R.G.Bury, Cambridge Mass., London: Harvard University Press 1931.

<http://classics.mit.edu/Plato/timaeus.html>

Significant for the theoretical framework on which medieval and Renaissance astrological historiography was based.

Ptolemy, Claudius, *Tetrabiblos*, trans. F.E.Robbins, Cambridge Mass., London: Harvard University Press, 1940, esp. Book I.

The foundation of the practical framework on which medieval and Renaissance astrological historiography was based.

Reading - Historiography:

The literature on historiography is extensive. At present you are not expected to delve into this in detail. However, should you wish to pursue it, the following are advised:

Collingwood, R.G., *The Idea of History*, Oxford: Clarendon Press 1946.

Collingwood is now considered old-fashioned but his work provides a classic framework for understanding astrological historiography

Evans, Richard J., *In Defence of History*, Cambridge: Granta, 1997.

This perhaps the clearest of recent books on the theory of history. It is a recommended book for this module and should inform, your understanding of the subject.

Foucault, Michel, *The Archaeology of Knowledge*, London: Routledge, 2002, Introduction.

GOOGLE BOOKS

Manuel, Frank E., *Shapes of Philosophic History*, London, Stanford CA: Stanford University Press 1965.

(NB out of print; available second-hand through www.abebooks.com)

Valuable context for understanding astrological historiography

Bentley, Michael, *Modern Historiography*, London: Routledge, 1999.

Bury, J.B., *The Idea of Progress: An Inquiry into its Growth and Origins*, London: MacMillan 1932.

The foundation for academic study of progress as a theory of history.

Butterfield, Herbert, *The Whig Interpretation of History*, London: Norton Library 1965 [1931].

The origin of the study of 'Whiggishness', the name given by Butterfield to the idea that one particular culture or set of ideas is bound to triumph in history.

The theory that western liberal values, or socialism or science, or bound to triumph, are all 'Whiggish'.

Carr, E.H., *What is History?*, Harmondsworth, Middlesex: Pelican 1970 [1961].

An important work on the theory of history.

Cassirer, Ernst and Paul Kristeller, *The Renaissance Philosophy of Man*, Chicago, 1956.

Valuable for the understanding of astrological historiography

Cohn, Norman, *The Pursuit of the Millennium*, London: Paladin 1970.

Established millenarianism as a recognisable philosophy of history.

Elton, Geoffrey, *The Practice of History*, Sydney, Fontana, 1969 [1967].

An important work on the theory of history.

Marwick, Arthur, *The New Nature of History*, London: Palgrave, 2001.

An important work on the theory of history.

Tosh, John, *The Pursuit of History*, London: Longman, 1991.

An important work on the theory of history.

JSTOR

JSTOR, as you know is a treasure trove of possible sources. At this stage you are encouraged and expected to begin to search out material. The following constitutes a selection of articles you might consult, and which suggest different directions for research.

The usual injunction about time management should be repeated: you are not expected to study for more than 20 hrs per week during the module.

Versluis, Arthur, 'What is Esoteric? Methods in the Study of Western Esotericism'

<http://www.esoteric.msu.edu/VolumeIV/Methods.htm>

Review: Philosophy and Pseudo-Philosophy

Reviewed work(s): Philosophy of Religion by Hugh Doherty

Lilly's Astrology by Zadkiel

Buddhism in Tibet by Emil Schlagintweit

JSTOR

First Principles by Herbert Spencer

Anthropological Review, Vol. 3, No. 10 (Jul., 1865), pp. 185-196

JSTOR

N. T. Bobrovnikoff

Reviewed work(s): The Royal Art of Astrology by Robert Eisler

Encyclopedia of Astrology by Nicholas De Vore

Isis, Vol. 40, No. 1 (Feb., 1949), pp. 79-81

JSTOR

Review: [untitled] Review: [untitled]

Richard Kremer

Reviewed work(s): Horoscopes and History. by J. D. North

A History of Western Astrology. by S. J. Tester

Speculum, Vol. 65, No. 1 (Jan., 1990), pp. 206-209

JSTOR

Wayne Shumaker

Reviewed work(s): Astrology in the Renaissance: The Zodiac of Life by

Eugenio Garin; Carolyn Jackson; June Allen; Clare Robertson

JSTOR

Brian P. Copenhaver

Reviewed work(s): English Almanacs, 1500-1800: Astrology and the Popular Press by Bernard Capp

Church History, Vol. 49, No. 4 (Dec., 1980), pp. 467-468

JSTOR

Karel Werner

Reviewed work(s): The Circle of Stars: An Introduction to Indian Astrology by Valerie J. Roebuck

Bulletin of the School of Oriental and African Studies, University of London, Vol. 56, No. 3 (1993), pp. 645-646

William A. Lessa

Reviewed work(s): Astrology and Alchemy: Two Fossil Sciences by Mark Graubard

American Anthropologist, New Series, Vol. 56, No. 6, Part 1 (Dec., 1954), pp. 1162-1163

JSTOR

Review: Astrology: Fad, Fiction or Forecast? Review: Astrology: Fad, Fiction or Forecast?

H. Krips

Reviewed work(s): Cosmic Clocks by M. Gauquelin

Erkenntnis (1975-), Vol. 14, No. 3 (Nov., 1979), pp. 373-392

JSTOR

* K. V. Snedegar

Reviewed work(s): Courting Disaster. Astrology at the English Court and University in the Later Middle Ages by Hilary M. Carey

The English Historical Review, Vol. 110, No. 437 (Jun., 1995), pp. 710-711

JSTOR

Robert E. Lerner

Reviewed work(s): History, Prophecy, and the Stars: The Christian Astrology of Pierre d'Ailly, 1350-1420 by Laura Ackerman Smoller

The Journal of Religion, Vol. 76, No. 4 (Oct., 1996), pp. 655-656

JSTOR