

Student Name	Nuria Carvalho
Student ID	2329357
Module	Problem Solving and Decision Making
Module Code	LCLM4004
Lecturer	Mubashir Qurashi
Assignment Title	Basil's Bakery – Individual Report

Table of Contents

Section	Page
Task 1: Overview of the case study and problem	3
Task 2: Two proposed solutions	4
Task 3: Evaluation of solutions and preferred option	5
Task 4: Risk analysis and feasibility	6
Task 5: Implementation plan and justification	7
Task 6: KPI, SMART objectives, monitoring and evaluation	8
Task 7: Key Findings	9
Reference List	10
Appendix 1: Grid Analysis	11
Appendix 2: Risk Analysis	12
Appendix 3: Implementation Plan	13–14
Appendix 4: KPI and SMART Objectives	15

Task 1: Overview of Case Study and Nature of the Problem

Basil's Bakery is an independent artisan bakery established in 2015 in a Coventry retail park, specialising in organic pastries, cakes and bread. Average sales in 2023–2025 remained approximately 25% below 2019 levels (UWTSD, 2026).

Neighbouring closures, redundancies and hybrid working reduced footfall while higher utility bills, rent, business rates and insurance increased Basil's operating pressure and organic ingredient costs remained unpredictable. Basil also lacks delivery and misses pre-order calls while baking.

Following Chevallier's (2016) distinction between framing and diagnosing a problem before selecting solutions, Basil's central problem is a mismatch between a footfall-dependent model and changed customer behaviour.

Task 2: Two Proposed Solutions

Solution A: Online pre-ordering and click-and-collect

- Introduce a simple mobile-friendly ordering system for a limited core menu, with pre-payment or payment on collection and fixed collection slots.
- This solution responds to customers who have asked to pre-order and reduces missed calls while Basil is baking.
- Order caps, cut-off times and a limited product range would protect production capacity and reduce waiting times.
- The system would create usable customer demand data before Basil commits to a more expensive delivery model.

Solution B: Limited local delivery trial

- Offer delivery within a small radius during selected time windows, using a third-party courier or local delivery partner so Basil can remain onsite.
- This could recover sales from former retail-park workers, nearby customers working from home and loyal customers who no longer visit the retail park regularly.
- A minimum order value and delivery charge could protect profit margins; the trial should begin on limited days rather than as a permanent full-service offering.
- The option has greater reach but also higher fees, coordination demands, quality control risks and dependence on external providers.

Following Proctor's (2018) approach to generating and evaluating alternatives and Adair's (2019) emphasis on defining objectives and feasible options, both solutions were developed before selecting the preferred option. Solution B offers greater customer reach, but Solution A is cheaper, faster and better aligned with Basil's limited capacity.

Task 3: Evaluation of the Two Solutions

Task 3a) Evaluation Table – Appendix 1

Task 3b) Evaluation Results and Preferred Solution

- Grid Analysis was selected instead of PMI because it compares alternatives against weighted criteria, reflecting the Kepner–Tregoe principle of prioritising decision objectives before scoring options (CMI, 2015b; MBA Tools, no date). Affordability, customer access and operational fit therefore received the highest weights because Basil faces rising overheads, reduced sales and limited capacity.
- Solution A scored 69, compared with 48 for Solution B.
- Although Solution B scored better for customer access (15 versus 10), Solution A scored higher for affordability (15 versus 5) and operational fit (15 versus 10), making Solution A the more balanced and practical first step.

Task 4a) Risk Analysis of Solution A – Appendix 2

Task 4b) Explanation of Risks and Feasibility

- The Risk Analysis suggests that the online pre-ordering and click-and-collect solution is feasible, with appropriate controls.
- The highest risks are low customer demand and orders exceeding production capacity, both scoring 12, which can be reduced through a small pilot, promotion, a limited menu, order caps, cut-off times and fixed collection slots.
- Financial feasibility will depend on whether additional sales cover platform fees and operating costs without creating excessive production pressure.
- Risk scores should be reviewed during the pilot and at six and twelve months as actual demand, workload and cost data become available, helping reduce judgemental bias and support evidence-based decisions (CMI, 2015a).

Task 5a) Implementation Plan – Appendix 3

Task 5b) Justification of Implementation Plan

- The plan is sequenced to reduce implementation risks: Weeks 1-3 cover planning, system configuration, testing and staff training before launch.
- A four-week pilot in Weeks 4-7 then provides evidence on sales, orders, customer feedback, waste and workload before Basil decides whether to continue or adjust the service.
- Six- and twelve-month reviews assess the 10% and 20% targets and longer-term feasibility.
- This follows action-planning guidance on clear tasks, responsibilities, deadlines and progress monitoring (Figma, no date).
- Basil leads business decisions, the platform provider supports technical setup, and bakery staff manage daily order preparation and collection.

Task 6a) KPI and SMART Objectives – Appendix 4

Task 6b) Monitoring and Evaluation of the KPI and SMART Objectives

- The KPI measures the percentage change in average weekly sales revenue against the four-week pre-launch baseline and is reviewed at the end of the four-week pilot, six months and twelve months.
- It is appropriate because effective performance measures should focus on factors critical to current and future success; for Basil, sales recovery is the central objective (Parmenter, 2020).
- The objectives are specific to increasing sales through pre-ordering and click-and-collect; measurable through the four-week baseline and staged 5%, 10%, and 20% targets; attainable through progressive growth; relevant to reduced sales and dependence on walk-in trade; and time-bound through the three review points. This applies Leak et al.'s (2025) approach of using SMART goals with measurable metrics to support evaluation.
- Basil will monitor weekly revenue, online orders, customer feedback, waste and workload.
- At each review, these measures will show whether targets have been achieved without creating unsustainable operational pressure and whether the service should continue or be adjusted.

Task 7) Key Findings

- Sales remained approximately 25% below 2019 levels, showing that Basil's dependence on walk-in trade no longer matches changing customer behaviour and demand for convenient ordering (UWTSD, 2026).
- Grid Analysis identified online pre-ordering and click-and-collect as the preferred solution, scoring 69 compared with 48 for local delivery because it offers stronger affordability and operational fit.
- The main risks, particularly low demand and orders exceeding capacity, are manageable through order limits, collection slots and ongoing review.
- The phased pilot and scheduled reviews allow Basil to monitor performance and adjust the service.
- If the 20% target is achieved sustainably, click-and-collect could be expanded before trialling Solution B.

Reference List

- Adair, J.E. (2019) *Decision making and problem solving: Break through barriers and banish uncertainty at work*. 4th edn. Kogan Page.
- Chartered Management Institute (2015a) *Developing decision making skills*. Checklist 277. Chartered Management Institute.
- Chartered Management Institute (2015b) *Rational decision-making: Kepner and Tregoe's model*. Checklist 015. Chartered Management Institute.
- Chevallier, A. (2016) *Strategic thinking in complex problem solving*. Oxford University Press.
- Figma (no date) *How to create an effective action plan*. Available at: <https://www.figma.com/resource-library/how-to-create-an-action-plan/> (Accessed: 14 August 2026).
- Leak, A.E., Lenaburg, L.A., Sciaky, E. and Aguirre Paden, M.O. (2025) 'Planning and proposing evaluations to support project success', *BMC Proceedings*, 18(Suppl 1), 31. doi: 10.1186/s12919-025-00344-2.
- MBA Tools (no date) *Grid analysis*. Available at: <http://mbatools.co.uk/Toolbox/DecisionMaking/gridanalysis.htm> (Accessed: 14 August 2026).
- Parmenter, D. (2020) *Key performance indicators: Developing, implementing, and using winning KPIs*. 4th edn. John Wiley & Sons.
- Proctor, T. (2018) *Creative problem solving for managers: Developing skills for decision making and innovation*. 5th edn. Routledge.
- University of Wales Trinity Saint David (2026) *LCLM4004 Problem Solving and Decision Making: Basil's Bakery case study* and Assignment 2 assessment brief [Unpublished internal module material]. University of Wales Trinity Saint David.

Appendix 1 – Task 3a: Grid Analysis of the Two Solutions

Scoring scale: 0 = poor, 1 = limited, 2 = good, 3 = very good. Weighted score = criterion weight × option score.

Criterion	Weight	Solution A		Solution B		Rationale / case evidence
		score	weighted	score	weighted	
Affordability / cost	5	3	15	1	5	Rising overheads make a low-cost first step essential.
Speed / ease of implementation	4	3	12	2	8	A quick response is useful, but disruption must remain limited.
Sales and customer access impact	5	2	10	3	15	Both options answer customer requests, but delivery has wider reach.
Fit with Basil's capacity	5	3	15	2	10	Pre-ordering best fits Basil's capacity because he must remain on site; outsourced delivery still requires coordination.
Low risk / compliance complexity	4	2	8	1	4	Pre-ordering has manageable GDPR/payment controls; delivery requires additional customer address data and third-party courier coordination, increasing compliance risks.
Demand data and scalability	3	3	9	2	6	Pre-orders reveal demand by product, day and collection time.
TOTAL			69		48	

Source: Adapted from MBA Tools (no date).

Appendix 2 – Task 4a: Risk Analysis – pre-ordering and click-and-collect

Risk	Likelihood 1–5	Impact 1–5	Risk factor	Prevention Plan	Contingency Plan
Low customer demand	3	4	12	Promote the pilot in-store and online and survey existing customers	Review feedback and adjust promotion, menu or collection times
Ordering or payment system failure	2	4	8	Select a reliable platform, test it before launch and keep a manual backup	Inform customers, contact the provider and temporarily accept orders manually
Customer data or payment information is mishandled	2	5	10	Use appropriate UK GDPR, access-control and payment-security measures	Investigate the incident, contact the provider and follow data-breach procedures
Online orders exceed production capacity	3	4	12	Use a limited menu, order caps, cut-off times and collection slots	Pause orders, contact customers and offer refunds or later collection

Source: CMI (2015a).

Appendix 3 – Task 5a: Implementation Plan – pre-ordering and click-and-collect

Problem: Reduced sales and missed customer orders caused by dependence on walk-in trade and unanswered telephone calls.

Solution: Online pre-ordering and click-and-collect.

TASK	WHAT	WHEN	WHO	DONE
1	Plan the pilot by selecting a limited online menu, prices, order limits, cut-off times, payment options and collection slots.	Week 1	Basil	
2	Compare and select an affordable, mobile-friendly ordering platform with secure payment processing, data-protection controls and technical support.	Weeks 1–2	Basil with support of the platform provider	
3	Configure the platform by adding product descriptions, prices, allergen information, collection times, order confirmations and customer contact details.	Week 2	Basil and the platform provider	
4	Test the complete ordering process using sample orders. Train bakery staff to check orders, prepare products, label collections, process refunds and use manual backup procedures.	Week 3	Basil and bakery staff	
5	Launch and promote a four-week pilot through signs in the bakery, social media and messages to existing customers. Monitor orders and customer problems daily.	Weeks 4–7	Basil and bakery staff	

TASK	WHAT	WHEN	WHO	DONE
6	Review the KPI against the 5% pilot sales-growth target. Assess sales, online order numbers, average order value, customer feedback, waste and workload. Decide whether to continue or adjust the service.	End of Week 7	Basil	
7	Review the KPI against the 10% six-month sales-growth target. Assess sales, online orders, average order value, customer feedback, waste and workload, and adjust the service if required.	6 months	Basil	
8	Review the KPI against the 20% twelve-month sales-growth target. Assess whether growth is sustainable and decide whether to continue, expand click-and-collect availability or further develop the service.	12 months	Basil	

Source: Figma (no date).

Appendix 4 – Task 6a) KPI and SMART Objectives

Key Performance Indicator: Percentage change in average weekly sales revenue compared with the four-week pre-launch baseline, with targets of at least 5% by the end of the pilot, 10% by six months and 20% by twelve months.

Specific	Measurable	Attainable	Relevant	Time-bound
Increase Basil's average weekly sales revenue through the online pre-ordering and click-and-collect service, using staged growth targets over twelve months.	Compare average weekly sales revenue with the same four-week pre-launch baseline. Target at least 5% growth by the end of the pilot, 10% by six months and 20% by twelve months. Online order numbers and average order value will also be recorded to help explain performance.	The initial 5% target is achievable because the pilot uses a limited menu, order caps and fixed collection slots, reducing pressure on production. A 10% increase by six months allows time for customer adoption and improvements to the service. A 20% increase by twelve months is more ambitious but remains realistic because it would still leave sales around 10% below 2019 levels.	The objective directly addresses Basil's reduced sales, dependence on walk-in customers and missed pre-orders. The staged targets also support longer-term recovery by progressively reducing the gap between current sales and 2019 levels while testing whether the service remains operationally sustainable.	Achieve at least a 5% increase by the end of the four-week pilot in Week 7, 10% by six months and 20% by twelve months, compared with the same pre-launch baseline.

Source: Leak et al. (2025); Parmenter (2020).