

A critical evaluation and the identification of next teaching and learning steps focusing on a case study of an individual learner or a group of learners, based on an observed critical incident.

The aim of this case study is to critically evaluate an observed incident which is identified during one of four class observations. This critical incident will be evaluated by reviewing the literature which closely relates to it. The methodology used for this study is a non-participant observational case study using observational framework questions for consistency.

The Critical Incident which was identified during this study was the use of extrinsic rewards in the form of praise and merits in order to promote motivation and participation. There will be links and thoughts on how this can fit in with Donaldson's four principles (2015).

Donaldson is one of the key developers of the new curriculum for Wales.

The Literature review will look at the behaviourist theory and how rewards promote a desired behaviour. This leads on then to the use of extrinsic rewards; their benefits and the concerns researchers and practitioners have with them. The review then goes on to look at the more desired intrinsic reward ideas and the use of growth mind set in the classroom. The review will aim to provide some understanding on how students benefit from becoming independent learners who are ambitious and able to challenge themselves and be knowledgeable capable learners, this relates back to Donaldson once again.

The critical incident and literature review will go on to be evaluated and reflected upon to inform future teaching practice and the Donaldson principles are being met by these ideas. It will also reflect on how it is necessary to continue to grow in our reflective and evaluative practices in order to grow our pedagogy and meet the Professional standards for teaching (Education Wales, 2018)

The observations for this critical incident case study took place in a school which under the Bara guidelines both the school and the individuals are to remain anonymous and all specific information kept confidential. (Bera, 2018)

The School demographic is a 11-18 English medium school which mostly has a white British pupil base, with only 2% of the school pupils using English as a second language. The School has a high level of achievements with over 87% achieving the English and Maths

threshold at level 2 and over 99% achieving the level 3 threshold. (My Local School, 2018) according the Estyn report (2019) the school has a lower than average percentage of students receiving free school meals with 4% of students eligible to receive them were the nation average is 16.4%. There is also a lower than average percentage of students with an additional learning need. This percentage is nearly 8% of students were the national average is 19.2%.

Four separated lessons were observed during this study with a class size of 30 pupils in each class. The classes observed were all mixed ability across year 8.

The School has a good observation culture therefore this should allow the observational case study to view a natural lesson as students were less likely to act different while unknown people were in the classroom. All the lessons had a strong positive culture with no major behavioural incidents. The School has a good ethos of challenging student to their full potential and students are in majority of cases very motivated.

The methodology used for this critical incident evaluation is a non-participant observational case study research model. For the purpose of this study, a 'Critical incident' is identified by Tripp as an incident that does not have to be something which we would perceive as dramatic but rather it could be something that appears to be a 'typical' event at first glance but something which than could be "*rendered critical through analysis*" (2012, p.25)

The collection of data is qualitative in style, with a set of questions to create a framework aimed to focus the attention of the researcher. The Questions used to structure the observation have been designed by Harry Fletcher-Wood in his book "*Ticked off*" (2016). The set of questions look at things like: classroom culture, objectives of the lesson, Direction given to pupils and their understanding of the lesson and activities, the accessibility and challenges levels for the students, Assessment for learning during the lesson and anything else which is specific to the lesson that could be useful to talk about and analyse. These are identified under the title of "*what am I looking for in this observation?*" (Fletcher-Wood,2016, p.125) see Appendix 1 to 4

This is a small-scale study because it only considers four separate classroom observations. The case study approach allows several incidents to be recognised during the observation rather than identifying that just one specific incident took place. The advantages of the Case study approach are that it can take a holistic approach to a small-scale study in a natural setting (Denscombe, 2014).

The disadvantages to this form of approach is that finding can be too generalised and therefore the credibility of the research can be questionable. The research using a case

study often reflects on the processes observed rather than an outcome therefore there is no measurable result. This is seen as a 'soft data' because it is interpretative and qualitative in the findings (Denscombe, 2014).

The systematic observation method and Tripp's 'critical incident' (Tripp, 2012) approach used looks at how interactions in the setting occurs and has been mostly used within the educational classroom. (Denscombe, 2014; Tripp, 2012) Tripp mentions that some teachers find it difficult to identify what they should look out for in the observation (2012). Therefore, Systematic observation are used. This is a direct observational method which collects evidence through the sight of the observer. This can lead itself to the observer interpretation and furthermore it has been seen that the human mind will filter out information as it is processed therefore this can lead to different findings from different observers. In both looking for a critical incident and using the systematic observational method there is a need for this to be reduced as much as possible in order to make the observations more credible and less open to interpretation. For this is a reason schedules and some structure to the observation are necessary. (Denscombe, 2014; Tripp, 2012)

The benefit to using Tripp's idea of a 'critical incident' study lends itself to the idea that the teacher can interpret the findings in a way which can be therefore evaluated and analysis events in the class in order to inform future teaching practice. Majority of Tripp's methodology lends itself to a participant observation as it serves as a reflective practice for the teacher who are analysing the incidents in their own classrooms. However, for the purpose of this study the observer is a non-participant this means that the observer is not involved in the incidents which occurred in the classroom.

The Four lessons which the observations took place all experienced a general feel that majority of students were engaged in the lesson. There was a whole school approach with 'meet and greet' and 'end and send' as pupils arrived and left the lessons. All four of the lessons had clear objectives to the lesson and the students had clear direction and knew what they had to do. The students were all challenged and were able to access the learning. There were a number of incidents which were identified throughout the observations, these included: talkative students during while watching a video clip during a history lesson, unsettled students in I.T lesson, good teacher modelling techniques in a Welsh lesson and the use of extrinsic rewards in a religious education lesson. The Incident which will be focused on will be the later one, the use of extrinsic rewards in the religious education lesson.

The lesson involved a starter task which allowed student to 'active prior knowledge' in the form of choosing two questions from several options. The main task for the lesson was to link pieces of information which had been placed around the classroom which was described

as a shopping basket task. The students were required to use the information they found around the classroom to fill in a grid in their books with titles the teacher had provided. The Student where required to write where possible the information in as much detail as possible in their own words. The lesson closed with peer assessment of the task and each student giving an exit answer of something which they had learnt in the lesson in order to leave for their break time.

Throughout the lesson the teacher used a variety of different motivational techniques. These included lots of verbal praise, rewards in the form of merits, peer assessments and a well-structured and engaging lesson. The incident occurred towards the end of the lesson while the teacher was looking for assessment for learning opportunities in the lesson. The teacher had requested student to give feedback of the answers they had written in their books. Only a limited number of students raised their hands to give the teacher a response. The Students who raised their hand had been student who had already answered teacher questions previously in the lesson. Rather than the teacher telling the students to put their hands down so that she could pick students who she felt should give her an answer or use a random pupil selection method the teacher produced a sheet of merit stickers. Upon the students seeing the sheet of merits majority of the class raised their hands to answer the question.

It is this use of extrinsic reward which is being evaluated and reflected upon. One of Donaldson four purposes to learning is to promote independent and capable learners. The Merits given were extrinsic rewards which could question whether the students were ready to be independent and capable learners however this could be argued that the rewards would lead to gaining intrinsic rewards for themselves in the future. This would lead then to them setting themselves high standards. It is also building them to be able to communicate effectively and enabling them to explain ideas and concepts which they have learnt about (Donaldson, 2015).

The lesson itself in its design was promoting 'Ethical, informed citizens' and the rewards meant that the students were encouraged to be "knowledgeable about their culture, community, society and the world, now and in the past". Which is another area of the Donaldson's principles (Donaldson, 2015).

The literature which relates to the critical incident covers areas such as behaviourist theories, intrinsic and extrinsic rewards, and building a Growth mindset.

The use of rewards and tokens have created much debate. Some academics have believed that rewards are great for positive reinforcement where others believe that rewards should be intrinsic to the individual person rather than an extrinsic reward which has a monitory or

token value. Both the Elton report and the Steer report highlight that there is a strong need for using positive reinforcement, praise and rewards, these ideas have been reported and used by the DfES. It was observed that there needed to be more emphasis on praising good behaviour rather than punishing bad behaviour. They suggested that an effective school system for a reward/sanction ratio should be at least 5:1 (Ellis and Tod 2015)

The research for extrinsic rewards is embedded in the behaviourist theories which were established by Pavlov in the late 19th and early 20th century and later Skinner built on Pavlov's theory of 'classical conditioning'. The work of Pavlov who is known for his formulation of classical conditioning in dogs showed that a dog could be conditioned to respond to a Stimuli. This work was later developed Skinner who worked on the idea of operant conditioning. Operant conditioning used the idea of positive and negative reinforcement. Positive reinforcement is the idea that behaviour is strengthened by giving a reward. For example, in education this reward could come in the form of praise, tokens or a grade for work. The giving of this reward is known as the 'positive reinforcer'. Negative reinforcement is the use of taking an unwanted stimulus away, thereby taking away something which the student did not want to do or experience to start with. An example of this could be that the student may be rewarded with less homework if they do enough class work. (Biehler and Snowman, 1993)

Biehler and Snowman identify the term '*behaviour modification*' as '*the use of operant conditioning techniques.....to modify behaviour*' (Biehler and Snowman, 1993, p340). The use of this technique in conjunction with the stimuli as a reward they call 'contingency management'. This involves the use of rewards, the 'contingent', to give a desired response. Techniques like this have been used over many years these include the Premack principle which allows students to pick an activity once the required task has been completed. David Premack first proposed the idea in 1959 which he also identified it as the 'Grandma's rule' which uses the idea 'once you finish your dinner you can have a pudding' (Biehler and Snowman, 1993, p.340)

Biehler and Snowman also talk about the 'Token economy' where a token which has no value is collected and then applied to something which does have value. This is a widely used technique used in schools still, where they use collecting merits and stickers or even using modern digital tools such as collecting dojo points on the school app 'Class Dojo' are used. It has been suggested that the use of tokens have the benefit that they can be given instantly as a reinforcer and then they can be 'cashed in' at an appropriate time where a higher value reinforcer can be given. (Biehler and Snowman, 1993) many of these systems

are adopted as a whole school approach and should be used consistently amongst teachers. (Ellis and Tod, 2015)

Biehler and Snowman (1993) go on to say that even though these techniques are widely used there are criticisms to the use of them. They suggested that research findings are limited and also some students may not react positively to them and behavioural scientists such as Skinner argue that if the techniques are not used in a systematic and consistent way this can lead to undesirable behaviours where students may become disappointed in the process.

Crowley says that rewards can be useful in many cases but that they need to be justified. Rewards work well for those students and classes where they are focused, well behaved and in general well motivated. She goes on to suggest that rewards may not be as effective with students who are disengaged with the school system, who have difficulty with behaviour. She says that these types of students for many different reasons may not be open to accepting these types of rewards. This could be for reasons like not wanting to be seen by peers as being 'needy' for this type of praise. These students can often be cynical of getting rewards too (Crowley, 2001). In some cases, students feel that getting positive feedback from their teacher will damage the relationship which they have with their peers. Understanding the needs of these pupils are important, they may require different strategies for praise such as in a less personal way and more discreetly (Ellis and Tod, 2015).

Some academics also question the use of extrinsic rewards, a number of them have expressed that the overuse of praise and rewards can have a limited impact for short-term gain for the use of achieving the demands of the adult or teacher (Bear et al, 2017). The use of extrinsic rewards is to promote participation in the desired activity in a productive way. Much research has been done into motivation of students (Biehler and Snowman, 1993).

Intrinsic rewards are believed to be the most desired form of rewards which the students gain from doing a task or participating. Intrinsic rewards are rewards which are personal to each individual and it is the value which the student feels in themselves for the achievement of doing the task (Biehler and Snowman, 1993). It is important to understand the link between how useful or damaging extrinsic reward is on intrinsic reward and motivation. It has been said that "*emphasis on the frequent use of teacher centred praise, rewards and punitive consequences promotes students' extrinsic motivation but stifles their intrinsic motivation for prosocial behaviour*" (Bear et al 2017, p.10).

When it is considered that intrinsic motivation and rewards are the most desired form of rewards because this is promoting self-satisfaction and students who want to learn because of the internal rewards that this gives we can make a link towards the idea of building a Growth mind set. Carol Dweck built the idea of 'Growth mindset' from the 'Motivational

model of achievement'. The 'Motivational model of achievement' had the key ideas that people should have self-motivation to excel and they can change and achieve greater things (Chao, 2017).

Carol Dweck (2009) suggests that there are two types of mindsets, a fix mind set and a Growth mindset. The fixed mindset is one where the learner does not value the learning process but rather is just after looking smart. They do not look for in depth learning or engage in critical thinking. They also believe that ability is fixed by external factors. Whereas A growth mindset believes that you can develop intelligence by looking into things with a deeper understanding, they seek out learning independently. They also look to improve on themselves by being told about the weaknesses which they have. It is also worth noting that extrinsic rewards have been used to build on improving motivation.

Chao et al (2017) also suggests that it is possible to Increase the effect of a Growth mindset by using a well-designed reward system. They led an experiment which looked at the use of extrinsic rewards to promote a growth mindset in India. They had mixed results which they believed was down to cultural factors and recognised that all previous research which had been done in this area was from western society where they believed that it was the social culture that helped to in build self-determination that increases the Growth mindset and incentive system culture. Their results showed that those who benefited from these methods were those who started out as higher achievers. Those who were low achievers did not engage with the strategies positively and became confused with the reward systems. Therefore, it could be argued that with growth mindsets the use of reward strategies could have underlying reasons why they may or may not work depending on the cultural backgrounds of the learners.

Where Chao (2016) found that their Growth mind programme did not have a positive result across all the participants. Claro et al carried-out research to see what the results where on those who came from a background which was poor and in poverty. They found that students on the same Socio-economic level still had a higher academic achievement if they had a growth mind set opposed to those who had a fix mind set.

From this review there are arguments both for and against extrinsic rewards and although intrinsic rewards are believed to be the most rewarding and what should be strived to achieve. It is possibly worth mixing the approaches relating to rewards as well as building a positive motivational mind. It is believed that from an Integrative view that intrinsic motivation and Growth mind set work hand in hand and are both important to each other as well as interrelated. (Betsy, 2018)

In reflection there are many positive points from the lesson which could be taken into my own teaching practice. The lesson where the critical incident took place was a well structure lesson where the students were able to engage in the lesson. They were given clear guidance and knew what was required of them. The teacher used positive reinforcement strategies well and a good level of praise and rewarded good work with merits.

The critical incident shows that sometimes it is necessary to give students a motivational incentive for them to participate in giving an appropriate response. Some teachers would use a hands down approach where it could be argued that the teacher on this occasion wanted the students to take responsibility for offering a response themselves. The one thing which was striking was the high response levels to the teacher producing the merit sheet. The lesson structure had meant that the students was able to do well in the task therefore all students were able to give an appropriate answer if they had been asked to share their work. The rewards acted as a positive reinforcer and gave the students that small amount of encouragement needed to grow in confidence or motivation.

From the concepts studied in the literature review the use of extrinsic rewards can have benefits for building on the intrinsic rewards within the student. If the students can build on the idea of gaining self-satisfaction from completing the task and become motivated for themselves this would be a positive and desirable objective.

I would use these ideas in my own practice. Getting the right balance of extrinsic rewards is important, this is so that they don't lose their meaning. It is also worth noting that not all students will respond well to the use of rewards therefore it would be necessary to make these types of judgements with the individual students.

It is also important to use strategies which promote a growth mindset if we are to promote Donaldson's idea of independent capable learners. As research suggests building motivation it is important because students who have a growth mind set go on to engage with lifelong learning and are open to adapting to new situations as they arise.

Overall the lesson was well balanced therefore there would be nothing I would change to its content and structure. I felt that the students were given all the necessary tools to complete the tasks and learn from the lesson.

The one thing which needs to be encouraged is the willingness of the students to participate in the lessons fully by engaging with the teacher when they are asked too. This however is something which the reward system is working on and the use of praise and merits is the building blocks for building these independent learners which we as educational professionals are striving to promote. For the students the prospect of the rewards

outweighed any fixed mind set they might have had about not responding in case they got something wrong.

It is important to continue to follow reflective practice throughout a teaching career. Being able to reflect and evaluate practice helps to create a stronger pedagogy foundation which will grow, deepen, spread and move forward. Pedagogy is the most fundamental element to teaching and as professionals we must continue to identify areas to continue areas of professional development.(Education Wales, 2018)

When we reflect on the practices its useful to use a structure reflection practice such as that in Appendix 8. This keep a focus on what we areas we can improve, share with others and continue to develop much the same as when we used the structured questioning throughout the observation process.

In conclusion the identified critical incident was the use of extrinsic rewards to promote students motivationally to put their hands up in order to share their work with the class. It can be linked to the Donaldson's Four principles because the use of the rewards was to promote independent learners who are willing and capable of engaging with the tasks.

The Literature looks at the ideas that students can benefit from extrinsic rewards and that the used of these rewards can lead to intrinsic rewards where the students gain personal satisfaction from their achievements. This can then lead to growing a culture where there is a growth mindset and students believe that they have the potential to achieve. They are students who can critically evaluate their own working as well as the world around them.

From this study it has highlighted that with the right balance in the lesson we can structure our students to have the potential to produce work that they should be proud of and that they can share their thoughts and ideas.

I will be taking forwards with me the ideas that a good level of rewards and praise as a positive reinforcement tool can work but also that it is necessary to be mindful that these open forms of praise may not work with all students depending on the individual.

By carrying out this Observational case study experience as been gained from how other teaching professionals engage pupils and it is valuable for informing future teaching practice. By continuing to grow our professional standards we can help to deliver a more robust teaching pedagogy which will help to build and promote the new curriculum as it is introduced.

Appendix



Prifysgol Cymru
Y Drindod Dewi Sant
University of Wales
Trinity Saint David

Yr Athrofa
Addysg a'r Dyniaethau
Education and Humanities

Appendix 1.0

OBSERVATION / FIELD NOTES

(Questions adapted from Fletcher Wood (2016))

Date: 26 th September 2019
Lesson details: Year 8, mixed ability, History lesson, 30 students, lesson Child labour: conditions in the factories. Table lay out, 3 columns on 5 tables 2 students per table.
Classroom culture (Are the students focused on learning?) Most students were focused on learning, a small number of students chatty and turning around mostly male students Two girls a little chattier than the other members in the class sitting at the back of the classroom.
Objectives (Is there a clear purpose to the lesson? How do the lesson activities promote that purpose?) there was a clear purpose to the lesson. To what was it like for children working in factories during the industrial revolution. To be able to describe what the conditions were like in the factories during the industrial revolution. To be able to explain why this was allowed. The lesson activities were to link key words with a definition and description as a starter, these key words were then used as markers to look for while watching a documentary on children workers in the factories. Student were required to make their own notes under each of the heading during the documentary. This was to then come up with two questions you would like to ask the children on that time of your choosing to find out some key information. Do you agree or disagree 'conditions in the factories were not that bad?' Students to decide using the facts and the information gathered during lessons.
Direction (Are the students clear about what they are doing and how to do it well?) The students all understood what they needed to do and how to do it well.
Access and challenge (Are all students able to engage in the lesson? Are all students challenged?) All students were able to engage in the lesson. The lesson allowed for all levels within the class because they were using their own thinking skills. They were required to think what questions they could ask a child in the factory. Students were able to ask teacher other questions that they were thinking of during this process and showing that they had a critical mind. With questions such as 'how many children died in the factories? How many children were injured in the factories? Was these figures correct if the factory owners didn't want the world to know that the conditions were so bad?'
Assessment How does the teacher assess student understanding before, during and after the lesson? How is this used in their teaching? At the start of the lesson, the teacher ask a few questions of the class to check their understanding and to refresh previous knowledge from previous lessons, this linked to the starter activity and the documentary they were about to watch.



Prifysgol Cymru
Y Drindod Dewi Sant
University of Wales
Trinity Saint David

Yr Athrofa
Addysg a'r Dyniaethau
Education and Humanities

Appendix 1.1

During the documentary being played the teacher would stop it as intervals, to ask key questions, asking thinking questions some time these required and answer and at other times these were just for the students to think about while watching the next section.

Teacher used a hands down approach and choose students at random from the register. The teacher also circulated around to check what students were writing. Also asked the students to share their ideas and beliefs and why.

Specifics / Critical Incidents

Are there particular telling moments and examples which it would be helpful to discuss?

During the documentary there was chatting by two female students at the back of the class. The teacher deal with this by stopping the documentary to revise over what was being seen, why this was important and what might they be needing to look for in the next part of the film. This stopped the students from talking for short periods.

However, they would start again. The teacher stopped the video at one point, highlighted and praised that they were all being attentive to the documentary and then went on to give some teacher exposition. This broke the documentary up and refocused the students. The teacher positioned himself most the time near his desk because he was out of the way of the projector there also the seating plan allowed students might cause low level disruptions to be near the teacher.

The teacher moved and stood at the back of the class during the last part of the documentary in order to position himself near the chatty female students. This was a good display of classroom management and known of the other members of the class where disturbed.

At the end of the lesson the teacher spoke to one student who it seems is normally someone who disrupts the class to praise him for the lesson and to let him know that he was well behaved for the first 45 minutes of the lesson. And that it would be great to see the last 15minutes at the same standard. (this behaviour was low key as I never picked up on it but must have been an ongoing issue which was being dealt with in a positive way)

Class teacher applied a great and meet, and end and send to their classroom. This is an agreement made after the last training day which the whole staff had.



Yr Athrofa
Addysg a'r Dyniaethau
Education and Humanities

Appendix 2.0

OBSERVATION / FIELD NOTES

(Questions adapted from Fletcher Wood (2016))

Date: 26 th September 2019
Lesson details: welsh lesson. Year 8. Meet and greet as students enter. Seating is in tables of 6 per table over 5 tables and 4 on the 6 th table.
Classroom culture (Are the students focused on learning?) The Students where focuses and engaged with the lesson. With a good culture of responding to the teachers learning style of saying and students repeating back what was said.
Objectives (Is there a clear purpose to the lesson? How do the lesson activities promote that purpose?) the Objectives where clear. The start was on the board ready for students to start. This was for students to work use the workbooks they must work on mutations which they had covered in the previous lesson. Then the main lesson objectives where on the projector when they were required. The lesson was to talk about the student's holiday, where they have been. And to ask other students where they had been. This included the mutations of the place names. The lesson then went on to ask students to find out about other student's holidays by filling a questions sheet.
Direction (Are the students clear about what they are doing and how to do it well?) The Students understood what they needed to do. The one student who wasn't so clear as to what he needed to do ask his friend and the teacher also helped him with this.
Access and challenge (Are all students able to engage in the lesson? Are all students challenged?) All students can engage in the lesson and they work together in pairs to answer and work through what they need to do. The teacher circulates the class explaining tot the students who are finding the challenge a little more difficult and to also give reassurance that they are doing everything as they should.
Assessment How does the teacher assess student understanding before, during and after the lesson? How is this used in their teaching? The Teacher assesses the understanding at the beginning of the class by giving them a starter which allows the students to revisit their previous lessons topic and skills. After the students have completed this task, he asks a person from each of the tables to give him their answers. He uses a hands down approach and asks students for their answers. The teacher also assesses the students correct pronunciation of the welsh words as he repeats over and over the words and they respond. Also, he checks this with the individual responses which the students give to him in welsh.
Specifics / Critical Incidents



Prifysgol Cymru
Y Drindod Dewi Sant
University of Wales
Trinity Saint David

Yr Athrofa
Addysg a'r Dyniaethau
Education and Humanities

Appendix 2.1

Are there particular telling moments and examples which it would be helpful to discuss?

The teachers uses a variety of modelling techniques during his lesson. Repetition of words where the students then repeat back the words. The teacher breaks the sounds of each of the words. For students to get a good grasp of how to make the sounds of the words.

The teacher also models the sentence structure of an example for answering the questions of where, when and how long students went on holiday. The students could then use this template to answer their own questions for the lesson. The Modelling was also very interactive with the students, asking them for responses.

OBSERVATION / FIELD NOTES

(Questions adapted from Fletcher Wood (2016))

Date: 26th September 2019 Lesson details: philosophy and ethics. Year 8, mixed ability. Seating plan in place the teacher had put books on the table and where requested to sit where she had placed the books because she had change some of her seating plan. greet and meet. End and send in place.
Classroom culture (Are the students focused on learning?) The students had just had a PE lesson therefore where a little bouncy from the previous lesson. The students settle down and overall was focused on learning.
Objectives (Is there a clear purpose to the lesson? How do the lesson activities promote that purpose?) there were clear objectives given on the white boards and told to the pupils. This was to answer the question 'what do Muslims do to celebrate?' there was criteria for success given too. Use a range of strategies, speed reading, close reading annotation, prediction, skim reading for key ideas and themes and scan information for details. The students were told that everyone would and the questions differently. That some would answer with short sentence and other with longer sentence and the better answers would be the longer more thought out answers. The students where also told that this information would be being used in a later lesson therefore to try and get a good understanding of it in this lesson.
Direction (Are the students clear about what they are doing and how to do it well?) starter was Given as a 'bell task' this involved checking previous learning with a choice of questions where the students had to choose two to answer. The main task was a 'shopping basket' style task where the student had to split their page into six. In each box a title was required which had been given on the board. The student then needed to look around the classroom to add the information for the relevant titles. They were asked to write the sentences in their own words if they could and that the longer and more thought our pieces of information would be better. A picture was also required in which was to fill the rest of the space in each box
Access and challenge (Are all students able to engage in the lesson? Are all students challenged?) All students were able to access and engage in the lesson because the lesson had been differentiated in a way where students could fins the answers and if possible put them in their own words, for those students who didn't have a lot to write down they were able to fill the space with a pictures instead of worrying that they didn't have enough writing.
Assessment How does the teacher assess student understanding before, during and after the lesson? How is this used in their teaching? Assessments took place with the teacher going over and retrieving students to tell her what their answers to the questions where. Not all students where willing to put their hands up for this and the teacher choose some of the students knowing that they had



Prifysgol Cymru
Y Drindod Dewi Sant
University of Wales
Trinity Saint David

Yr Athrofa
Addysg a'r Dyniaethau
Education and Humanities

Appendix 3.1

answered the question even if they hadn't show her that they had answered that specific question.

The teacher did the same for the main task. Asking students to read out what they had put for their information in the boxes for each title.

The student where also ask to peer assess give a what went well and an even better if response to their peer assessments. The teacher asked student to leave their books open for her to be able to check that they had done this at the end of the lesson.

Finally, the teacher also used an exit method in class where they students could leave the lesson after telling her one thing that they had learnt knew in lesson.

Specifics / Critical Incidents

Are there particular telling moments and examples which it would be helpful to discuss?

One student was particularly unsettled during the lesson. Collecting pencil crayons many times instead of just choosing all the colours that he wanted at once. The same student also didn't stay in his allocated area for collecting information and choose to move all over the classroom and talk with another student while they were trying to stay focused.

The students where reluctant to answer questions or give a response. Very few students put their hands up to answer. Until the teacher took her merit stickers out and as soon as she did that pretty much the whole class raised their arms to give a response. All students had been given the necessary tools to finish the task, so all had a response to give.

OBSERVATION / FIELD NOTES

(Questions adapted from Fletcher Wood (2016))

Date: ~~26th September 2019~~ 2nd October 2019
Lesson details: philosophy and ethics. Year 8, mixed ability. Seating plan in place the teacher had put books on the table and where requested to sit where she had placed the books because she had change some of her seating plan. greet and meet. End and send in place.
Classroom culture (Are the students focused on learning?) The students had just had a PE lesson therefore where a little bouncy from the previous lesson. The students settle down and overall was focused on learning.
Objectives (Is there a clear purpose to the lesson? How do the lesson activities promote that purpose?) there were clear objectives given on the white boards and told to the pupils. This was to answer the question 'what do Muslims do to celebrate?' there was criteria for success given too. Use a range of strategies, speed reading, close reading annotation, prediction, skim reading for key ideas and themes and scan information for details. The students were told that everyone would and the questions differently. That some would answer with short sentence and other with longer sentence and the better answers would be the longer more thought out answers. The students where also told that this information would be being used in a later lesson therefore to try and get a good understanding of it in this lesson.
Direction (Are the students clear about what they are doing and how to do it well?) starter was Given as a 'bell task' this involved checking previous learning with a choice of questions where the students had to choose two to answer. The main task was a 'shopping basket' style task where the student had to split their page into six. In each box a title was required which had been given on the board. The student then needed to look around the classroom to add the information for the relevant titles. They were asked to write the sentences in their own words if they could and that the longer and more thought our pieces of information would be better. A picture was also required in which was to fill the rest of the space in each box
Access and challenge (Are all students able to engage in the lesson? Are all students challenged?) All students were able to access and engage in the lesson because the lesson had been differentiated in a way where students could fins the answers and if possible put them in their own words, for those students who didn't have a lot to write down they were able to fill the space with a pictures instead of worrying that they didn't have enough writing.
Assessment How does the teacher assess student understanding before, during and after the lesson? How is this used in their teaching? Assessments took place with the teacher going over and retrieving students to tell her what their answers to the questions where. Not all students where willing to put their hands up for this and the teacher choose some of the students knowing that they had



Prifysgol Cymru
Y Drindod Dewi Sant
University of Wales
Trinity Saint David

Yr Athrofa
Addysg a'r Dyniaethau
Education and Humanities

Appendix 4-1

answered the question even if they hadn't show her that they had answered that specific question.
The teacher did the same for the main task. Asking students to read out what they had put for their information in the boxes for each title.
The student where also ask to peer assess give a what went well and an even better if response to their peer assessments. The teacher asked student to leave their books open for her to be able to check that they had done this at the end of the lesson.
Finally, the teacher also used an exit method in class where they students could leave the lesson after telling her one thing that they had learnt knew in lesson.

Specifics / Critical Incidents

Are there particular telling moments and examples which it would be helpful to discuss?

One student was particularly unsettled during the lesson. Collecting pencil crayons many times instead of just choosing all the colours that he wanted at once. The same student also didn't stay in his allocated area for collecting information and choose to move all over the classroom and talk with another student while they were trying to stay focused.

The students where reluctant to answer questions or give a response. Very few students put their hands up to answer. Until the teacher took her merit stickers out and as soon as she did that pretty much the whole class raised their arms to give a response. All students had been given the necessary tools to finish the task, so all had a response to give.

Model Beirniad Wedi Adfyfyrio (BWA) Assisted Reflective Conclusions (ARC) Model

Dyddiad/Date: 26th September 2019

Digwyddiad critigol (Ffocws)/Critical incident (focus): Low level disruption with talkative students

Profiad/ Experience	
Teimladau/ Feelings Beth yw eich teimladau ynghylch y profiad? "What are your feelings regarding the experience?"	My feeling on the experience were that there was a good classroom culture where most students were focused on learning and engaged, there was a small number of students who were a little talkative and chatty. The lesson had a good flow and structure.
Cofio a Deall/ Remember and Understand Allwch chi restru'r agweddau ar y profiad dysgu a aeth yn dda? "Can you list the aspects of the learning experience that went well?" Pa elfennau o'r profiad dysgu oedd yn siomedig? "What were the elements of the learning experience that were disappointing?"	<u>The aspects of the learning which went well.</u> There were clear objectives to the lesson which all the students understood and able to access. There was structure to engage the students while watching a Documentary, they were required to make notes on key words. The students were required to think of questions that they would ask a child in the factories this allowed open ended ideas where the students. The Tasks in the lesson were well structured and supported each new task in order. This structure supported the students need. <u>Elements that were disappointing</u> A small number of students were talkative and were not totally focused on the documentary.
Gwerthuso a dadansoddi/ Evaluate and analyse Beth fyddwch chi'n cadw'r un fath i sicrhau dysgu ac addysgu effeithiol yn y dyfodol? "What will you keep the same to ensure effective teaching and learning in the future?" Beth oedd achos yr elfen siomedig bwysicaf? "What was the cause of the most important disappointing element?"	<u>What would I keep the same?</u> The lesson was well structured therefore I would not change anything about the lesson. The teacher had to use classroom management techniques such as stopping the film to reaffirm the task at hand and refocus the students who became distracted while the documentary clip was playing. The teacher also moved amongst the class and stood near specific pupils who became distracted. The Students had to make notes on the clip therefore they had purpose to watching the it. <u>What were</u> <u>Cause of the disappointing element</u> There was no obvious reason why there were low level disruption. The task was engaging enough for most students. The students may have just been a chatty mood.
Casgliadau a chamau gweithredu/ Conclusions and actions Beth yw eich atebion posibl i'r materion siomedig a nodwyd? "What are your possible solutions to the disappointing issues identified?" Beth ydych yn mynd i'w wneud nesaf? "What will you do next?"	<u>Possible solutions</u> The teacher controlled the situation well. However, if the distributions are a common place with these students a new seating plan may be required. <u>What to do next?</u> Use the skills of the teacher by keeping a good classroom presence use the strategy of stopping the documentary to refocus and give some teacher exposition. Use the seating plan and change it if it isn't working.
Y profiad newydd / Transformed experience	

Model Beirniad Wedi Adfyfrio (BWA) Assisted Reflective Conclusions (ARC) Model

Dyddiad/Date: 26th September 2019

Digwyddiad critigol (Ffocws)/Critical incident (focus): Good teacher modelling

Profiad/ Experience	
Teimladau/ Feelings Beth yw eich teimladau ynghylch y profiad? "What are your feelings regarding the experience?"	The class had a good positive feel. The students worked together with the tasks and they had a clear understanding of what was required of them. There was a good amount of Teacher modelling, showing good pronunciation of the sounds in Welsh
Cofio a Deall/ Remember and Understand Allwch chi restru'r agweddau ar y profiad dysgu a aeth yn dda? "Can you list the aspects of the learning experience that went well?" Pa elfennau o'r profiad dysgu oedd yn siomedig? "What were the elements of the learning experience that were disappointing?"	The aspects of the learning which went well The students worked well together when working out the Welsh tasks for the lesson. The lesson objectives were clear The teacher led learning was engaging, with lots of repetition. Assessed the students understanding by checking knowledge with good questioning. Elements which were disappointing There were no elements recorded which were disappointing.
Gwerthuso a dadansoddi/ Evaluate and analyse Beth fyddwch chi'n cadw'r un fath i sicrhau dysgu ac addysgu effeithiol yn y dyfodol? "What will you keep the same to ensure effective teaching and learning in the future?" Beth oedd achos yr elfen siomedig bwysicaf? "What was the cause of the most important disappointing element?"	What would I keep the same? I wouldn't change anything from the lesson, I would hope that I could engage the students as well as the teacher did. I would use the repetitive use of words for learning if the lesson involved learning by rote. Cause of the disappointing element There was no disappointing element in the lesson, the students were well engaged and working together to complete the work.
Casgliadau a chymau gweithredu/ Conclusions and actions Beth yw eich atebion posibl i'r materion siomedig a nodwyd? "What are your possible solutions to the disappointing issues identified?" Beth ydych yn mynd i'w wneud nesaf? "What will you do next?"	Possible solutions None needed What to do next? To be able to repeat the good teacher talk and modelling from the lesson.
Y profiad newydd / Transformed experience	

Model Beirniad Wedi Adfyfyrio (BWA) Assisted Reflective Conclusions (ARC) Model

Dyddiad/Date: 26th September 2019

Digwyddiad critigol (Ffocws)/Critical incident (focus): low level disruption

Profiad/ Experience	
Teimladau/ Feelings Beth yw eich teimladau ynghylch y profiad? "What are your feelings regarding the experience?"	The lesson had a over all positive feel. It was a lesson directly after lunch which meant a small number of students were a little unsettle. This was not a big issue just low-level disruption.
Cofio a Deall/ Remember and Understand Allwch chi restru'r agweddau ar y profiad dysgu a aeth yn dda? "Can you list the aspects of the learning experience that went well?" Pa elfennau o'r profiad dysgu oedd yn siomedig? "What were the elements of the learning experience that were disappointing?"	<u>The aspects of the learning which went well</u> Teacher makes sure that the correct seating arrangements are in place. The teacher uses classroom management strategies such as locking the computer screens which teacher gives the exposition. Good modelling of what the students need to do. A engaging task for new piece of work. This engaged the students who were a little distracted at the start of the lesson. <u>Elements which were disappointing</u> That students found it hard to settle and focus on the lesson
Gwerthuso a dadansoddi/ Evaluate and analyse Beth fyddwch chi'n cadw'r un fath i sicrhau dysgu ac addysgu effeithiol yn y dyfodol? "What will you keep the same to ensure effective teaching and learning in the future?" Beth oedd achos yr elfen siomedig bwysicaf? "What was the cause of the most important disappointing element?"	<u>What would I keep the same?</u> The teacher using the computer locking in the lesson is something which I would consider using in my lesson when giving an explanation or exposition to the class. The use of a seating plan in the lesson. <u>Causes of the disappointing element.</u> The student had just had lunch and wanted to continue the lunch time conversations
Casgliadau a chamau gweithredu/ Conclusions and actions Beth yw eich atebion posibl i'r materiaon siomedig a nodwyd? "What are your possible solutions to the disappointing issues identified?" Beth ydych yn mynd i'w wneud nesaf? "What will you do next?"	<u>Possible solutions.</u> Rearrange the seating plan so that students find it difficult to turn around and talk. Ensure that students stay seated. Make the topic more engaging and interesting <u>What to do next?</u> I would use the idea that an interesting topic can engage the most distracted pupils which will allow learning to take place.
Y profiad newydd / Transformed experience	

Model Beirniad Wedi Adfyfrio (BWA) Assisted Reflective Conclusions (ARC) Model

Dyddiad/Date: 2nd October 2019

Digwyddiad critigol (Ffocws)/Critical incident (focus): Using merit rewards to promote pupil responses and participation.

Profiad/ Experience	
Teimladau/ Feelings Beth yw eich teimladau ynghylch y profiad? "What are your feelings regarding the experience?"	The class were given activities which allowed all students to assess the tasks. Most students engaged with the lesson. Although the students were reluctant to put hands up to give examples of their work even though all students had been given the structure to write something informative in the tasks.
Cofio a Deall/ Remember and Understand Allwch chi restru'r agweddau ar y profiad dysgu a aeth yn dda? "Can you list the aspects of the learning experience that went well?" Pa elfennau o'r profiad dysgu oedd yn siomedig? "What were the elements of the learning experience that were disappointing?"	<u>Aspects of the learning which went well</u> The objectives of the lesson were clear. Clear success criteria were given for the main task. Students were given plenty of praise and merits throughout the lesson to reinforce good work. Peer assessment took place at the end of the lesson. Bell tasks at the beginning of the lesson worked well. <u>Disappointing learning experience</u> That it took the teacher to offer the reward of merits for the students to be motivated enough to want to share their work with the class.
Gwerthuso a dadansoddi/ Evaluate and analyse Beth fyddwch chi'n cadw'r un fath i sicrhau dysgu ac addysgu effeithiol yn y dyfodol? "What will you keep the same to ensure effective teaching and learning in the future?" Beth oedd achos yr elfen siomedig bwysigaf? "What was the cause of the most important disappointing element?"	<u>I will keep the same</u> The effective reward giving when there is meaning to giving those rewards. As long as it aim at working towards gaining intrinsic values as well as building confidence and reinforcing a good Growth mind set. The bell tasks at the beginning of the lesson worked well to assessing prior knowledge and recapping what was learnt in the previous lesson. <u>The cause of the most disappointing elements</u> Lack of confidence or lack of motivation.
Casgliadau a chamau gweithredu/ Conclusions and actions Beth yw eich atebion posibl i'r materiau siomedig a nodwyd? "What are your possible solutions to the disappointing issues identified?" Beth ydych yn mynd i'w wneud nesaf? "What will you do next?"	<u>Solutions to the disappointing elements are:</u> Work on building up a growth mind set and the idea that intrinsic rewards give personal satisfaction. <u>Thinks to take forward.</u> I would implement good starter or bell task at the beginning of the lesson Make sure that the lesson as a good structure to the tasks which are support and differentiated for all students to access. I would also use a good well thought out reward system as it can help to boost good independent learning promoting personal motivation within the students.
Y profiad newydd / Transformed experience	

Reference List

- Bera (2018) Ethical Guidelines for Educational Research, fourth edition Available at <https://www.bera.ac.uk/publication/ethical-guidelines-for-educational-research-2018> (Accessed: 7th October 2019)
- Bear.G.G, Slaughter.J.C, Mantz.L.S, Farley-Ripple.E (2017) 'Rewards, praise, and punitive consequences: Relations with intrinsic and extrinsic motivation', Teaching and Teacher Education, vol.65, p.10-20, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2017.03.001> (Accessed 8th October 2019)
- Betsy.Ng (2018) 'The Neuroscience of Growth Mindset and Intrinsic Motivation', Brain Science, Vol.8(2), pp.20
- Biehler.R, Snowman.J (1993) Psychology Applied to Teaching 7th ed, USA, Houghton Mifflin Company.
- Chao.M, Sujata.V, Mukhopodhyay.A, Dehejia.A (2017) 'Do rewards reinforce the growth mindset?.Joint effect of the growth mindset and incentive schemes in a Field intervention' Journal of Experimental Psychology Vol.146(10), pp.1402
- Claro.s, Paunesku.D, Dweck.C (2016) 'Growth mindset tempers the effects of poverty on academic achievement' Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America, Vol.113(31) pp.8664
- Cowley.S (2001) Getting the Buggers to Behave, London, Continuum
- Denscombe.M, (2014) The Good Research Guide: for small-scale social research projects 5th ed, Berkshire, Open Uni Press.
- Donaldson.G (2015) Successful Futures: Independent Review of Curriculum and Assessment Arrangements in Wales, Available at <https://www.nasuwt.org.uk/asset/A788604C-3046-4005-A1EA0EAFF023E0DD/> (Assessed 10th October 2019)
- Dweck.C (2009) 'Who will the 21st-Century learner Be' Knowledge Quest, Vol38(2), pp.8-9
- Ellis.S, Tod.J (2015) Promoting Behaviour for learning in the classroom: Effective Strategies, Personal Style and Professionalism, Oxon, Routledge
- Education Wales (2018) (Professional standards for school practitioners in Wales Available at <https://s3-eu-west-1.amazonaws.com/hwb-live->

[storage/c7/51/6e/f9/2658478caac692c6e220dcce/professional-standards-for-school-practitioners-in-wales.pdf](https://storage.c7/51/6e/f9/2658478caac692c6e220dcce/professional-standards-for-school-practitioners-in-wales.pdf) (Accessed 28th October 2019)

Estyn (2019) A report on [REDACTED], available at

([https://www.\[REDACTED\].co.uk/admin/ckfinder/userfiles/files/\[REDACTED\]0\(1\).pdf](https://www.[REDACTED].co.uk/admin/ckfinder/userfiles/files/[REDACTED]0(1).pdf)) (Accessed 7th October 2019)

Fletcher-Wood.H (2016) Ticked off, Carmarthen, Crown house Publishing

My Local School (2018) My Local School Available at

[http://mylocalschool.wales.gov.uk/School/\[REDACTED\]](http://mylocalschool.wales.gov.uk/School/[REDACTED]), (Accessed 3rd October 2019)

Tripp.D, (2012) Critical incidents in teaching: Developing Professional Judgement, Oxon, Routledge.