

Review

Reviewed Work(s): The Lesbian and Gay Movement and the State: Comparative Insights into a Transformed Relationship by Manon Tremblay, David Paternotte and Carol Johnson

Review by: Lisa D. Brush

Source: *Contemporary Sociology*, Vol. 41, No. 6 (November 2012), pp. 828-829

Published by: American Sociological Association

Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/41722759>

Accessed: 11-12-2017 12:53 UTC

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at <http://about.jstor.org/terms>



American Sociological Association is collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *Contemporary Sociology*

rules alone make the book worth its weight in gold because they collectively contain the answer to reducing religious/state violence, terrorism, and war. They include "acknowledge that religious actors are here to stay," and "accept that the more governments try to repress or exclude religion from public life, the more such efforts will be self-defeating."

In short this book, far better than any other I have read, helps us to understand what must happen so that religious actors can be the major advocates for democracy, peace, and freedom rather than taking up guns or forming dictatorships. I hope the world's governments and religions follow this book's lessons.

The Lesbian and Gay Movement and the State: Comparative Insights into a Transformed Relationship, edited by **Manon Tremblay**, **David Paternotte**, and **Carol Johnson**. Burlington, VT: Ashgate Publishing Company, 2011. 234pp. \$89.95 cloth. ISBN: 9781409410669.

LISA D. BRUSH
University of Pittsburgh
lbrush@pitt.edu

Lesbian, gay, bi, trans, and queer people, communities, institutions, and social movement organizations have, in many times and many places, had deeply troubled relationships with local and national governments. The spectrum extends from intense police surveillance, harassment, blackmail, and violence to heated struggles over employment, parental, and marriage rights, health care, sex education and other materials in public schools, and access to public accommodations. Manon Tremblay, David Paternotte, and Carol Johnson asked 13 scholars of sexuality politics to answer two questions about the country or countries they have studied: To what extent has the state influenced the lesbian and gay movement? and, How has the lesbian and gay movement in turn influenced the state? The result is an international collection of case studies that share a central concern with the mutual influences of what the editors abbreviate as the LG movement and the state, which the editors introduce

and then put into comparative perspective and use to set up further research questions in their conclusion.

The resulting collection of case studies will interest diverse audiences. Scholars of collective behavior and social movements will find concise historical overviews of specific countries and the ways institutional and discursive patterns in national and international politics can frustrate, facilitate, and otherwise shape social movement demands and strategies. Area Studies scholars will find cases from diverse geographic regions and institutional regimes. State scholars and theorists will find careful assessments of the limits and possibilities of contentious sexuality politics in states as different as the *junta* in Argentina, post-Communist Poland, post-apartheid South Africa, the multi-institutional United States, and post-colonial Singapore, Indonesia, and Malaysia (among others). Lesbian, gay, bi, trans, and queer movement organizers, instructors in courses that grapple with the social and political aspects of sexuality, and students of comparative politics will find accessible case studies of change over time that encourage contrast and comparison even as they defy notions of convergence. Readers steeped exclusively in mainstream political science, which the editors note is traditionally heteronormative and usually defined in terms of a narrowly conceived "public," will find much that is familiar in institutional accounts of states, social policies, and movement mobilization. Such readers may also be challenged by the notion that matters of sexuality, identity, and interpersonal relationships are a central terrain of struggle and study opening a wide window on the dynamics of national and transnational politics.

Even readers familiar with the politics of LG movements in their own countries, or readers engaged with other projects in comparative politics (which sometimes share a paradigm and data collection protocols that facilitate systematic comparisons), are likely to find compelling the insights that the chapter authors and editors derive from these case studies. The combination of historical detail, political overview, and the two shared questions from the editors means that the individual chapters offer insights

into many political processes. Democratization is an especially interesting theme in the chapters on Poland, South Africa, and Argentina. The chapters on Belgium, Poland, Spain, and the Netherlands all tackle the important issue of political organizing and governance in an era of transnational European politics and intranational diversity. Politics and social movement organizing in the global South are central to the chapters on Brazil, Argentina, India, South Africa, and Singapore, Indonesia, and Malaysia. The case studies from Australia, Canada, the United Kingdom, and the United States emphasize the difference that institutional arrangements and cultural frames make in the changing and nationally variable structures of political and discursive opportunities faced by social movements. Moreover, most chapters note the ways the globalization of the public health and political crises associated with HIV/AIDS have generated stigma and solidarity, repression and normalization, resources and backlash, for LG movements organizing with and against the state around the world.

Collections of case studies can be difficult to read, especially when the chapters share only a theme and some "How?" questions rather than the kind of common theoretical and empirical framework required for systematic comparisons. These chapters all feature their authors' careful descriptive work, but despite what the title of the book proclaims, they do not share a single theoretical approach or even definition of "the LG movement" (or "the state," for that matter). This lack of uniformity, although it may partly undermine the comparative ambitions of the collection, is (as the editors argue) ultimately a strength rather than a weakness. In fact, it helps the authors and editors avoid making tautological assumptions about the developmental trajectories of social movements that plague many comparative projects, especially those that center on culture and politics. The individual chapter authors are clear about the limits and specifics of both the framing questions they received from the editors and the cases they are describing. In addition, as noted above, many of the chapters grapple with general issues of interest to readers from a variety of disciplines, specialties, and theoretical

traditions. Researchers and teachers will find different selections from *The Lesbian and Gay Movement and the State* useful for different purposes, but all are great examples of the case study method and offer informed analyses of a set of issues sadly neglected in many other collections on social movements, states, and their reciprocal effects. As with many edited books, the more the reader brings to the topic, the more the reader will find to reward careful reading. But *The Lesbian and Gay Movement and the State* is also an excellent introduction to a set of issues likely to stimulate a wide variety of readers in several disciplines and specialties, and the editors have asked two straightforward yet high-yield questions and held the authors to high standards of detail and clarity, with great results.

Rural Protest and the Making of Democracy in Mexico, 1968–2000, by **Dolores Trevizo**. University Park, PA: Pennsylvania State University Press, 2011. 245pp. \$64.95 cloth. ISBN: 9780271037875.

ERNESTO CASTAÑEDA
University of Texas, El Paso
ecastaneda10@utep.edu

Rural Protest and the Making of Democracy in Mexico, 1968–2000, by Dolores Trevizo, delves into understudied areas contributing to Mexico's democratization; in particular the influence of social movements in the creation of a multiparty system that electorally challenged and defeated the PRI (*Partido Revolucionario Institucional*), the party in power between 1929–2000. Following McAdam, Tarrow, and Tilly, Trevizo conducted an event catalogue documenting protests and contentious incidents. The book illuminates movement-counter movement dynamics by mapping out events and reactions to them in a path-dependent causal model.

With this book Dolores Trevizo establishes herself as an astute observer of Mexican institutional and contentious politics. She is able to unveil an important pathway for the rise of Mexican democracy by looking at the *longue durée* and taking into account bottom-up politics. While most accounts are centered on dynamics in Mexico City or at the