

Chapter 9

Conclusion

This chapter draws the arguments of the thesis together and presents final considerations. The focus of this research project, as described in the Introduction, was to investigate the fresco scheme of 319 images across three registers of the first floor Salone of the Palazzo della Ragione in Padua, Italy, in terms of the constellations that dictated the seasons and the cycle of the year as seen over Padua c.1309, as well as the medieval astrology and all its visual components, attributes, and assignments of meaning, that were reflected in the lives of the Paduan community. In this regard the project took into account my background and knowledge of the literature and practice of medieval astrology.

The Introduction determined the primary sources used for the research. With no extant commissioning documents for the Salone fresco scheme, the work of Giovanni da Nono, a contemporary eyewitness working as a judge at the Palazzo della Ragione, cited Giotto as the painter of the scheme.¹ The other primary sources that the research employed were the fresco scheme itself, including the history of the building and the actions taken by the Venetian Senate in the fifteenth century and the Commune in the eighteenth century to conserve and restore the paintings, the night skies over Padua, Pietro d'Abano's alleged *Astrolabium Planum*, and the translated medieval literature of the time. The research then examined the previous work in the field. In 1560 Bernardino Scardeone linked the images in the Salone with Pietro d'Abano's *Astrolabium Planum* and thus began an assumption that was taken up, in the main, by scholars thereafter. This chapter then considered the nature of an *Astrolabium Planum* and how its function, as a book of individual horoscopes to which single images were later connected by Johannes Engel and published in 1488,² was a misleading source to correlate with the images on the walls of the Salone. When Burges pursued work on the fresco scheme in 1858-1859,³ he based it on Scardeone's assumption, along with his own speculation that the lost d'Abano *Astrolabium Planum* contained images that were exactly reproduced in Engel's work. He

¹ Giovanni da Nono, 'Visio Egidij Regis Patavie', *Bollettino del Museo Civico di Padova* N.S. X-XI [XXVII - XXVIII] and XIII-XVII(1934-39), 1-20, p.20.

² Johannes Engel, *Astrolabium planum in tabulis ascendens* (Augsburg: Erhard Ratdolt, 1488 Vigesimo septimo Kalendas Nouembris).

³ W. Burges, 'La Ragione de Padoue', *Annales Archeologiques* XVIII(1858), 330-343. W. Burges, 'La Ragione de Padoue. Suite', *Annales Archeologiques* XIX, no. 31 (1859), 240-252.

acknowledged d'Abano's work in translating the work of Jewish-Spanish astrologer and polymath Abraham Ibn Ezra. Burges, however, used Ibn Ezra's text as an additional source for understanding images that were not recognisable or understandable using the *Astrolabium Planum* and in doing so, concluded that Giotto had made errors in the order of the scheme. From this point on, in seeking to understand the meaning of the Salone images, scholars appear to have followed Scardeone's assumption and Burges's suppositions. The chapter then introduced my methodology of research, which was to reconstruct the skies over Padua in 1309 using astronomical software and, together with the knowledge of poetic astronomy and naked eye astronomy, to see if it was possible to view the imagery along the top register as a sky map for the time when the sun moved into each new zodiac sign. Using the works of Ibn Ezra which d'Abano had translated, along with the medieval literature with which d'Abano would have been familiar and that underpinned the astrological tradition in the medieval period — Ptolemy's *Tetrabiblos*, Ptolemy's *Almagest*, and al-Qabīṣī's *The Introduction to Astrology* — I then examined the images in the middle and lower registers in order to see the astrological qualities that were reflected or revealed in the scheme.

Chapter 1 presented background information regarding the three people whose input into the building of the roof of the Palazzo della and the subsequent painting of the raised walls in the era of Padua's Golden Age shaped the Salone scheme. These three people — the architect Fra Giovanni degli Eremitani, the astrological advisor, Pietro d'Abano, and the painter, Giotto di Bondone — were all men who displayed innovation within their fields. The chapter then took into account the underlying cosmology that formed and shaped the medieval world and which was still current in 1420. I argued that it was this cosmology that was being repainted on the walls in 1425–1440 by Nicolò Miretto and Stefano da Ferrara, rather than a rendition of an *Astrolabium Planum*. The chapter then looked at the physical layout and design of the scheme. I further argued that, given the building's orientation, written up as field notes in Appendix 4, the southwest corner made greater sense as the starting point of the scheme, rather than the southeast corner, as other scholars had stated, and that the Salone fresco scheme was planet-driven and not, as other scholars had stated, zodiac sign driven. The chapter then identified the pattern of Labour of the Month–zodiac sign–planet–saint within each section of the scheme and defined what I am classifying as a 'chapter', where a narrative of images within these three registers starts and where it ends. I then analysed why the planets in the scheme were

depicted with rays, outlined the precedence for astrological schemes in communal buildings, and reflected on where the fresco scheme was placed within Giotto studies.

Taking all of the above into account, and using the methodology outlined in chapter 1, the next six chapters analysed the scheme in detail, surveying the top register of constellation images and evaluating the celestial cartography that was described by those fresco images. Each group of frescoes, or ‘chapter’, then considered the themes represented in the middle and lower registers. Finally each ‘chapter’ examined the Salone apostles by using the Arena Chapel apostles in four of the narratives (*The Last Supper*, *Washing of the Feet*, *Pentecost* and *The Last Judgement*) as a comparator for facial features and behavioural characteristics, mantle and tunic colour, and attribute. The examination provided a positive correspondence and changed how previous scholars had described the Salone saints. The detailed analysis is written up in Appendix 5.

The final chapter, chapter 8, focused on an examination of the set of images placed along the south wall between the Venus rules Taurus ‘chapter’ and the Mercury rules Gemini ‘chapter’, which I named the Corpus Christi ‘chapter’. Chapter 8 explored the background to the Feast of Corpus Christi and the Feast’s connection with St Thomas Aquinas who wrote the office of the Feast in 1261–1263. In making this link, the argument that a Thomistic-derived theological thinking was being expressed along the walls, as cited in chapters 2 and 4, was further strengthened. The chapter then examined the nine images across the three registers of columns 20-22 and how these images conveyed the symbolism of the Feast of Corpus Christi. I argued that these images could be read as an altarpiece, horizontally as well as vertically. Finally this chapter considered the images in columns 23 and 24 as reflecting the *Book of Revelation*. The investigation of these images in such detail revealed coherence and intent, and supported the theory that the Feast of Corpus Christi was being celebrated in Padua at this time of the year, and that, if this was part of the scheme c.1309, Padua was an early adopter of the Feast in Italy.

An overview of the research findings

The following offers an overview of the entire findings of the research project.

Differences in planetary rulerships

Visually distinct seasonal labours and activities were apparent for each month. It was also apparent that the images that constituted a ‘chapter’ reflected the different qualities of each of luminary and planet as defined by Ibn Ezra and al-Qabīṣī, expressed in their rulerships of day and night signs.

Ibn Ezra denoted the Sun as ‘very hot and dry, and [can be both] useful and harmful, doing good and bad’ and that it signified ‘knowledge [and] intelligence’.⁴ The first of these qualities was depicted through images of fountains and lions, suggesting the value and necessity of water at that time of the year, along with ways of handling fevers caused by the destructive heat of summer, through medicine and medical astrology. The second of these qualities were depicted through images of the rationalist Aristotelian approach to knowledge with images portraying arguments and disputations, knowledge of constitutions and laws, knowledge of the world through faith, knowledge of the world through measuring it with a compass or divider, and the imprimatur of Old Testament knowledge.

Ibn Ezra denoted the Moon as ‘cold and moist’ and although it ‘corrupts all bodies and putrefies them’, when the Moon was full, ‘opposite the Sun, she will ripen all fruits, and in her share is the power of productivity’.⁵ These qualities were depicted through images of water and travel.

Ibn Ezra denoted Mercury as ruling ‘the soul of man and the power of intelligence’.⁶ The images of the Salone were created at a time when scholastic thought that had been flooding in to the Latin West since the twelfth century,⁷ sought to reconcile ‘faith with

⁴ Avraham Ben Meir ibn Ezra, *The Beginning of Wisdom (Reshith Hochma)*, ed. Robert Hand, trans. Meira B. Epstein (Reston: ARHAT Publications, 1998), p.98,99.

⁵ ibn Ezra, *The Beginning of Wisdom*, p.103.

⁶ ibn Ezra, *The Beginning of Wisdom*, p.101.

⁷ Josef Pieper, *Scholasticism*, trans. Richard Winston and Clara (South Bend, Indiana: St Augustine's Press, 2001). John Haldane, ‘Editorial Introduction: Scholasticism - Old and New’, *The Philosophical Quarterly* 43, no. 173 (1993), 403-411, pp.403-406; George Makdisi, ‘Scholasticism and Humanism in Classical Islam and the Christian West’, *Journal of the American Oriental Society* 109, no. 2 (1989), 175-182.

reason' (*fidem si poterit rationemque coniunge*).⁸ It was thought that reason allowed humanity to wisely value things and when combined with faith, to effect a transformation. In the Mercury rules Gemini 'chapter' these qualities of reason were depicted as bodily transformation, material transformation, intellectual transformation, spatial transformation, and the study of text underpinned by reason and logic, Dialectic, that could then be transformed into practical judgment in the Salone. In contrast, in the Mercury rules Virgo 'chapter' these qualities of reason were depicted through images that exemplified the crafting of reason through the subjects thought necessary to prepare the classically educated humanist for the study of philosophy: Grammar and Rhetoric (the last two of the Trivium) along with Geometry, Arithmetic, Music, and Astrology (the Quadrivium). I argued that the image of the zodiac sign Virgo might be playing a dual role as Lady Philosophy. This theme also embraced the idea of the *pictor doctus*, the artist elevated above mechanics to the status of the learned, as well as the *dictamen*, the art of composing letters and formal documents and which, according to Hyde, was an important tool for a skilled lawyer to possess.⁹ At the level of trade, reason through measurement was depicted as merchants measuring cloth. Thus Mercury as the day ruler was depicted as the transformative abilities of knowledge and learning and Mercury as the night ruler was depicted as valuing the precision and craft of knowledge as usable skills.

Ibn Ezra denoted Venus as ruling 'the desiring [part of the] soul, fructification and multiplication.'¹⁰ In the Venus rules Taurus 'chapter' these qualities were depicted through images relating to spring and new growth, and the desire to marry, through colour and dyeing, as well as images of worship through the mendicant orders clustered around the image of Venus in its rulership of Taurus portrayed as the Virgin and Child. In contrast, in the Venus rules Libra 'chapter' the qualities of fructification were depicted through images of wine casking and wine-crying, part of the seasonal activity connected with this time of the year as well as emphasising the importance of wine as a consumable, both liturgically and domestically. The alchemical connection of Venus with copper and

⁸ Boethius, *Tractates, De Consolatione Philosophiae (The Theological Tractates and The Consolation of Philosophy)*, ed. E.H. Warmington, trans. H.F. Stewart and E.K. Rand, 1968 ed. (Cambridge, Massachusetts & London: Loeb Classical Library; reprint, 1968), p.36.

⁹ J.K. Hyde, *Padua in the Age of Dante* (Manchester and New York: Manchester University Press 1966), pp.294-295.

¹⁰ ibn Ezra, *The Beginning of Wisdom*, p.100.

the physical properties that turned it from saffron-red to green verdigris, the isochromatic red-green colour-coding signifying the elemental union of fire (red) and water (green),¹¹ was also apparent as an expression of Venus ruling Libra, creating and maintaining harmony and balance. Thus Venus as the night ruler was depicted as fruitful growth through social connections and devotion, to another or to God, and Venus as the day ruler was depicted as applying precision and craft to the results of fructification, such as wine-making.

Ibn Ezra denoted Mars as ruling that which was ‘hot, dry, burning, harmful and destructive. He indicates ruin, drought, fires, rebellion, bloodshed, killing, war, fighting, blows, separations, and in general everything that is not right as it should be. Of the human nature he denotes anger.’¹² In the Mars rules Aries ‘chapter’ these qualities were depicted through images relating to the military class, of knights and fighting, including the image of the planet Mars as a protector, a *militissa* or female knight, and two women fighting each other in anger using raised arms and sticks, the wilful taking of life by a man committing suicide and a man committing infanticide, as well as accidents that occurred by being run over by a horse. At the level of trade, images of ironsmiths, blacksmiths, and the makers of lances and swords depicted the accoutrements of war used to defend and kill. In contrast, in the Mars rules Scorpio ‘chapter’ these qualities were depicted through the level of the trades or professions involved with making or using fire and sharp instruments: the blacksmith making arms and armour, a labourer using a hoe, a doctor attending a patient with a wound caused by a sharp instrument, a doctor in the act of bloodletting, a barber-surgeon pulling teeth, and two duellists using swords in ‘friendly’ combat. The theme of suicide or homicide continued with a naked woman having jumped or being thrown from a bridge into the river below. Thus Mars as the day ruler was depicted as the recognition of militaristic defence and killing and Mars as the night ruler was depicted as taking the precision and craft of cutting and piercing turning them into skills of healing.

¹¹ John Gage, *Colour and culture: practice and meaning from antiquity to abstraction* (London: Thames & Hudson, 1993), pp.142-143, 147.

¹² ibn Ezra, *The Beginning of Wisdom*, p.96.

Ibn Ezra denoted Jupiter as ruling ‘life and increase of beneficence and fruitfulness and multiplication and justice and honesty. In his share is the vegetative soul.’¹³ The Jupiter rules Sagittarius ‘chapter’ contained a scholarly-legal-religious focus, including the blessing of a bishop and monastic preaching, as well as a judge teaching civil law to his pupils. There was also the theme of forgiveness and reconciliation. In contrast, in the Jupiter rules Pisces ‘chapter’ these qualities were depicted through images showing people helping another in illness, giving gifts of clothing to those in need, and religious blessings, along with envoys, the carriage of messages to those in positions of eminence, and the training of a lawyer in how to argue a case in court, extending the scholarly-legal-religious focus from study, in the Jupiter rules Sagittarius ‘chapter’, into practice. The image of a woman with a lion suggested a possible theme of virtues and vices. Finally the image of an astrologer placed in this ‘chapter’ continued the theme of how one could fruitfully work with one’s fate. Thus Jupiter as the day ruler was depicted as teaching, reconciliation, and forgiveness and Jupiter as the night ruler was depicted as turning the precision and craft of judgment into charity and legal defense (judging another in need of aid).

Ibn Ezra denoted Saturn as ruling that which was ‘evil and harmful. He indicates destruction, and ruin, and death, and mourning, and weeping and crying, and ancient things. In his share of the human spirit is the power of thought.’¹⁴ In the Saturn rules Capricorn ‘chapter’ these qualities were depicted through images portraying old people, grave diggers and ditch diggers, the metals of the earth fabricated into implements, caves and wells and dark and uninhabited places, a man and a woman each bound up in despair and melancholy. In contrast, in the Saturn rules Aquarius ‘chapter’ these qualities were depicted through images of the death of children, this time from disease rather than mortal killing. At the level of the trades, these qualities were depicted in images of tanning skins to produce shoes, dressing stones for masonry work in buildings, sharpening instruments, caulking boats, and dressing wood. Thus Saturn as the night ruler was depicted as the physical boundaries of life, age, and emotions and Saturn as the day ruler was depicted as the precision and craft of maintaining the physical boundaries of life, such as shoes and boats.

¹³ ibn Ezra, *The Beginning of Wisdom*, p.94.

¹⁴ ibn Ezra, *The Beginning of Wisdom*, p.91.

Pattern to the sky maps

In evaluating the sky maps for the whole year, the following pattern emerged:

Table 18: Correlation of sky maps with constellation images found within the top register in each 'chapter'.		
Sky map created for the Ingress of...	Time of year	Time of day which makes sense of
Aries	Late March (Spring equinox)	Predawn
Taurus	Late April	Sunset
Gemini	Late May	Predawn
Cancer	Late June (Summer solstice)	Sunset
Leo	Late July	Predawn
Virgo	Late August	Predawn
Libra	Late September (Autumn equinox)	Predawn
Scorpio	Late October	Predawn
Sagittarius	Late November	Sunset
Capricorn	Late December (Winter solstice)	Sunset
Aquarius	Late January	Sunset
Pisces	Late February	Sunset

From this one can state that, in general, the sky maps for the summer months (July to October) were linked with predawn skies. When the weather turned darker and colder, the sky maps were linked with sunset skies (November to February). The pattern may have been broken to account for the fact that the sky maps for the spring (late March) and autumn equinoxes (late September) were both predawn skies and the sky maps for the summer (late June) and winter (late December) solstices were both sunset skies.

Ordinary Time ritual observances

The church dominated time in the medieval world. The diurnal cycle was, as Randolph noted, 'punctuated by the pealing of bells; weeks passed according to a cycle of worship leading to the Sabbath; months were characterised by specific feasts; and the year was an endless cycle of regeneration and redemption.'¹⁵ It is no surprise then to see images of ritual observances placed amongst the 'chapters' of the Salone fresco images. What is of note is that most of them occur in Ordinary Time,¹⁶ that part of the liturgical year that lies outside the seasons of Lent-Easter and Advent-Christmas: Candlemas (early February), Carnevale (the two weeks prior to Lent), and Corpus Christi (the Thursday after Trinity

¹⁵ Adrian Randolph, 'Regarding Women in Sacred Space', in *Picturing Women in Renaissance and Baroque Italy*, ed. G.A. Johnson and S.F. Matthews Grieco (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997), 17-41 and 250-256., p.18.

¹⁶ Laurence Hull Stookey, *Christ's Time for the Church Calendar* (Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1996), p.133.

Sunday). This is probably due to the fact that the Palazzo della Ragione was a civic building and cathedrals and parish churches contained images related to Sacred Time. Lent (the forty day period before Easter) is the only festival that is visually apparent in the fresco scheme that falls within the liturgical season.

The influence of St Thomas Aquinas

St Thomas Aquinas (c.1225–1274) followed Albertus Magnus (1193–1280) when he crystallised the orthodox view of astrology as having purpose and meaning when consulted in connection with medicine and meteorology.¹⁷ Astrology, a belief in an ensouled sky, provided information and a rationale for medicine and meteorology. The spirit/soul, however, as Aquinas qualified, was ‘controlled immediately by God’.¹⁸ Thus whilst I am arguing that the Salone scheme reflects Aquinas’ understanding that astrology held the reasons and rhythms of how the world worked, a Thomist-based theological underpinning appears to weave itself through a number of the ‘chapters’. First, in the Sun rules Leo ‘chapter’, as noted above, images connected with astrology in relation to maintaining a healthy body (medical astrology) (43B, 43C, 44C, 45C, 46C) are balanced with images which related to the nature of knowledge through faith plus reason (46B, 48B, 49B, 49C). Second, there appears to be an image of Averroës (48B), an Andalusian Islamic polymath known for his medical and legal writings and his detailed commentaries on the works of Aristotle, also placed in the Sun rules Leo ‘chapter’. Aquinas accepted the Aristotelian model and acknowledged and respected how Averroës’ commentaries ‘informed his appreciation of the Philosopher’.¹⁹ Yet Aquinas’ argued that knowledge came in different ways and used different pathways to understanding. Thus in emphasising a Thomist perspective, the image of Averroës’ was placed amongst images portraying arguments and disputations (46B), knowledge of constitutions and laws (47BC), knowledge of the world through faith (49B) and the imprimatur of Old Testament knowledge (49C). Third, in the Mars rules Aries ‘chapter’ image 8A suggests a debate regarding the consequences of a mouse eating the eucharist and which was answered by Aquinas. Fourth, Aquinas wrote the office of the Feast of Corpus Christi, and Corpus Christi imagery has its own ‘chapter’ in the Salone fresco scheme. Thus I am

¹⁷ Thomas Aquinas, *Summa Contra Gentiles, Book Three: Providence Part II*, trans. Vernon J. Bourke (London: University of Notre Dame Press, 1975), 3:85,89,91,92.

¹⁸ Aquinas, *Summa Contra Gentiles*. 3:85.2.

¹⁹ Harold Stone, ‘Why Europeans Stopped Reading Averroës: The Case of Pierre Bayle’, *Alif: Journal of Comparative Poetics*, no. 16 (1996), 77-95, p.78.

arguing the Salone fresco scheme is not just an image of a medieval cosmology but a cosmology reflecting the Christianity of Aquinas and possibly one of its earliest representations, being painted only thirty-five years after his death.

Justice and trade

As noted in the Introduction, since its inception, the Palazzo della Ragione had formed the heart of the Paduan state with the judiciary on the first floor and the market life of the city underneath and around it. Thus administration of justice and trade were interlaced in a commensal relationship that strengthened the medieval city-state. The images of the Salone fresco scheme reflected and reinforced this commensal relationship: a dominant thread of teaching, learning, legal systems, and the behaviour of judges is interleaved with images of trades, many of which would have had their physical counterparts in the shops and stalls in the areas to the north and south of the building, in the porticos, under the four staircases, and in the adjacent streets. For the one is dependent upon the other: trade flourishes when laws are defined and maintained; and order on earth is reflected by the order in the heavens, and thus divine order, all which constitutes the cosmology of the time. Rather than expressing the complete set of astrological qualities for each planet, the images in the fresco scheme are selective, representing the qualities specifically related to justice and trade.

Fate

There are many cultural variations in theories of fate across time.²⁰ According to Bernadette Brady, the notion of the human will, the phrase ‘what is up to us’ used by Aristotle in *Nicomachean Ethics*, the Stoics Chrysippus (279–206 BCE) and Epictetus (55–135CE), and then expanded into ‘the freedom of the will’ by the Christian apologist Tatian (120–180 CE), ‘imply different concepts around attitude, choice and action’.²¹ Within medieval cosmology, fate could be defined as this freedom of the will placed into an Aristotelian ensouled divine sympathetic cosmos that acted on the body, and a soul that was within God’s domain.²² Accordingly a number of images in the fresco scheme allude to the idea of an individual’s fate and offer us an insight into the way the medieval world saw and worked with fate: image 31C in the Mercury rules Gemini ‘chapter

²⁰ Bernadette Brady. ‘*Theories of Fate among Present-day Astrologers.*’ Unpublished PhD dissertation, University of Wales Trinity Saint David, 2011.pp.47-87.

²¹ Brady, ‘*Theories of Fate among Present-day Astrologers*’, p.48.

²² Aquinas, *Summa Contra Gentiles*, Book 3, 91.92.

(chapter 3), a woman spinning which one might see as the ancient Fate Clotho, spinning the thread of life; image 90B in the Saturn rules Capricorn ‘chapter’ (chapter 7) of the neonatal being placed on the forest floor in an act of *expositio*, a term Boswell clarified as meaning ‘putting out’ or ‘offering’, and which he identified as ‘the most widespread form of abandonment in the ancient world’;²³ and image 110C in the Jupiter rules Pisces ‘chapter’ of an astrologer working with the pattern of stars, the heavenly order that offered an understanding of earthly order.

Salone as Memory Palace

Aristotle, in his *De anima*, defined imagination as that which holds a place between perception and thought, making sensory experience meaningful, and enabling us to interpret and make sense of it.²⁴ He suggested that the imagination collated what the five senses had perceived and created images that become the raw material for the intellectual faculty. The imagination, he posited, was thus the intermediary that processed sense impressions so that they could become knowledge: ‘the faculty of thinking then thinks the forms in the images’.²⁵ Furthermore ‘no-one can learn or understand anything in the absence of sense, and when the mind is actively aware of anything it is necessarily aware of it along with an image’²⁶ adding that ‘The soul never thinks without an image.’²⁷ One of the difficulties presented by Scardeone’s assumption, which scholars thereafter have tended to follow, is that of assigning each image in the Salone a separate function. Yet, as noted in chapter 3, rather than being discrete packages of information expressing a single, simple concept, the images of the fresco scheme appear to be images that deepen into consciousness the rich tradition that sits beneath them when they are observed, focused upon, and thought about in juxtaposition with each other. Indeed the structure of the Salone images appear to form great rivers of thinking, tributaries that flow in and out of each other, supporting, reinforcing and illuminating the philosophical and theological thinking of the time.

²³ John Eastburn Boswell, ‘Expositio and Oblatio: The Abandonment of Children and the Ancient and Medieval Family’, *The American Historical Review* 89, no. 1 (1984), 10-33, p.12.

²⁴ Aristotle, *De Anima*, ed. Jonathan Barnes, vol. 1, The Complete Works of Aristotle, The Revised Oxford Translation, Bollingen Series L X X I.2 (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1984). 428^a 1–18.

²⁵ Aristotle, *De Anima*. 431^b 2,

²⁶ Aristotle, *De Anima*. 432^a 7–8.

²⁷ Aristotle, *De Anima*. 431^a 17

What I am suggesting is that it would be a mistake to consider these scenes as mere illustrations. Webster used the term ‘pictorial metonymy’²⁸ in connection with the attributes connected with the Labours of the Months, the use of a single characteristic or pose or object to identify a complete range of seasonal activity. In terms of the images in the Salone, one may be able to take the term ‘pictorial metonymy’ further to become what Tim Ingold referred to as ‘place-holders’ for ideas and ways of thinking.²⁹ Ingold upheld that images ‘do not stand for things, but rather help you find them’³⁰ by pointing the viewer in a particular direction. Ingold likened this to the way that medieval European monks ‘enrolled both manuscripts and landscapes in their perambulatory meditations on the presence of God.’³¹ As these monks travelled in their minds, so they would draw on ideas that had been embedded in their interior landscape from previous sojourns. In researching the crafts of writing and masonry, Ingold acknowledged the work of Mary Carruthers on the training and uses of memory in the Middle Ages.³² Ingold and Carruthers both recognised that physical sites held biblical characters and stories and that when one journeyed to these locations, recalling the inherent stories allowed the characters to come alive and engage with the pilgrim, opened the way for the pilgrim to harness ‘their wisdom and powers to the task of crafting one’s own thought and experience, and of giving it sense and direction.’³³ Carruthers’ work on the mnemonic uses of imagery, and the training and uses of memory in European cultures, was, in turn, built on the work of Frances Yates.³⁴ Yates examined the memory training that formed the central pillar of rhetoric in the ancient world and which, when it emerged in the medieval period through the writings of Albertus Magnus and Thomas Aquinas as a moral and religious duty, was combined with Aristotelian philosophy and the understanding of artificial memory under the virtue of Prudence, as detailed in *Ad*

²⁸ James Carson Webster, *The Labors of the Months*, Northwestern University Studies in the Humanities, Number Four (New York: AMS Press, 1938), p.16.

²⁹ Tim Ingold, ‘Ways of mind-walking: reading, writing, painting’, *Visual Studies* 25, no. 1 (2010), 15-23, p.17.

³⁰ Ingold, ‘Ways of mind-walking: reading, writing, painting’, p.16.

³¹ Ingold, ‘Ways of mind-walking: reading, writing, painting’, p.16.

³² Ingold, ‘Ways of mind-walking: reading, writing, painting’, pp.16,17. Mary Carruthers, *The Craft of Thought: Meditation, Rhetoric, and the Making of Images, 400-1200*, vol. 34, Cambridge Studies in Medieval Literature (Cambridge University Press 2000); Mary Carruthers and Jan M. Ziolkowski, eds. *The Medieval Craft of Memory: An Anthology of Texts and Pictures* University of Pennsylvania Press, 2003. Mary J. Carruthers, *The Book of Memory: A Study of Memory in Medieval Culture*, 2 ed. (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008).

³³ Ingold, ‘Ways of mind-walking: reading, writing, painting’, p.17; Carruthers, *The Craft of Thought: Meditation, Rhetoric, and the Making of Images, 400-1200*, pp.254-261.

³⁴ Frances A. Yates, *The Art of Memory* (London: Pimlico, 1996).

Herennium or ‘the Second Rhetoric of Tullius’.³⁵ Yates and Carruthers both acknowledged how memorial practices were predicated in a world where few books abounded and those that did were housed in communal libraries, thus it was imperative to memorise what one was taught as one was taught it.³⁶ Carruthers observed how the skill of memory was held in as high regard in medieval thinking as documents now hold in the contemporary West.³⁷

Building on all of these ideas, as noted in chapter 3, I am suggesting that the Palazzo della Ragione was not only a Palace of Reason and a Palace of Law but also a Memory Palace, a place that held memories in the medieval sense. Thus the separate and seemingly disconnected individual images, I contend, expand as one focuses upon them and connect with other images to create themes based on *memoria*. As Carruthers explained, ‘*memoria* was also an integral part of the virtue of prudence, that which makes moral judgement possible.’³⁸ It was in the Palazzo della Ragione where such moral judgements were translated into legal rulings.

The medieval concept of order

Continuing this line of thinking, many scholars, as noted in chapter 1, believed the fresco scheme to be made up of single separate images, and therefore challenged the order of the images. Burges in the nineteenth century concluded that Giotto himself had made errors in the order of the scheme. In the twentieth century Barzon, Blume, and Mariani Canova argued that some images had been changed, moved, or simply missed out. I suggested, in the Introduction that, from the perspective of Aristotelian cosmology, the order of the images within the scheme was correct and this has been supported throughout the analysis of the scheme. According to William W. Ryding, in the genre of medieval literature, the desire for the well-made narrative reached a peak with the publication of Francesco Robortello’s edition of and commentary on Aristotle’s *Poetics* in 1548,³⁹ only twelve years before Scardeone was to make his assumptions about the Salone fresco scheme. The technique that was being criticized in epic medieval literature was termed

³⁵ Yates, *The Art of Memory*, pp.12,68.

³⁶ Yates, *The Art of Memory*, p.20; Carruthers, *The Book of Memory*, p.8.

³⁷ Carruthers, *The Book of Memory*, p.9.

³⁸ Carruthers, *The Book of Memory*, p.11.

³⁹ Francesco Robortello, in *librum Aristotelis de arte poetica explicationes* (Florentiæ: In officina L. Torrentini, 1548).

‘interlaced narrative’.⁴⁰ What bothered the critics of the sixteenth century was that the medieval structure did not form a logical pattern in which the various threads moved towards a focused point. Instead the threads diverged to form ‘a broad and spacious tapestry’ which were yet still ‘structurally dependent upon one another’.⁴¹ This tapestry, this intent and this same coherence, I argue, is what was painted and what is visible now in the Salone fresco scheme. Its order may not be obvious to post-sixteenth century eyes, as is evident in the anachronistic thinking of Mariani Canova in 2011 when she stated that, ‘It seems, therefore, that the frescoes of the fifteenth century were realized with great fantasy rather than with scientific rigor.’⁴² The rigour being sought was the one Ryding summed up as being ‘faced with a multiplicity where we should like to see unity.’⁴³ Nevertheless I have shown in this thesis that order is there in the ‘interlaced narrative’ of the fresco scheme, with images often taking on dual functions in their placement within the three registers.

Final thoughts

For at least three centuries, the three-tiered fresco scheme of the first floor Salone, with its depiction of heavenly constellations and the qualities of the planets informed by the extensive astrological knowledge of Pietro d’Abano, visually reminded the judges who worked in this building of the cosmology in which they lived. By the sixteenth century, however, the scheme’s meaning had been lost to the observer who stood in a different cosmology to the first painters and advisors. Scholars from Scardeone (1560) to Mariani Canova (2011) all acknowledged that there were astrological images contained within this scheme, yet they looked for meaning from the *Astrolabium Planum* of Johannes Engel of 1488, rather than turning their eyes to the actual sky, as well as placing an understanding of medieval cosmology at the centre of their research.

The Salone is not a work in isolation. It is deeply embedded in the philosophy and theology of its day. In a recent television broadcast on the story of the Jews historian Simon Schama mentioned that the Mishnah and the Talmud were created ‘for an endless

⁴⁰ William Wellington Ryding, *Structure in medieval narrative* (The Hague: Mouton, 1971), p.16.

⁴¹ Ryding, *Structure in medieval narrative*, p.16.

⁴² Giordana Mariani Canova, ‘Padua and the Stars: Medieval Painting and Illuminated Manuscripts’, in *ASP Conference Series (Proceedings of a conference held October 18-23, 2009 in Venezia, Italy)*, ed. Enrico Maria Corsini. Vol. 441 (San Francisco: Astronomical Society of the Pacific, 2011), 111-129, p.122.

⁴³ Ryding, *Structure in medieval narrative*, p.61.

future'.⁴⁴ One could say the same of the Salone fresco scheme, that it was a narrative interlaced pictorial cycle that placed astrology at the heart of its thinking, the beat that kept civic time as the church kept sacred time, a cycle that repeated endlessly but not mindlessly and reminded the first viewers and spectators of who they were, how to maintain order and justice in the community, and where they stood between heaven and earth.

⁴⁴ BBC2, Simon Schama, *The Story of the Jews*, broadcast September 2013: <http://www.bbc.co.uk/programmes/b0392pzx/episodes/guide>

- Aquinas, Thomas. *Summa Contra Gentiles, Book Three: Providence Part II*. Translated by Vernon J. Bourke. London: University of Notre Dame Press, 1975.
- Aristotle. *De Anima*. Edited by Jonathan Barnes. Vol. 1, The Complete Works of Aristotle, The Revised Oxford Translation, Bollingen Series L X X I.2. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1984.
- Boethius. *Tractates, De Consolatione Philosophiae (The Theological Tractates and The Consolation of Philosophy)*. Translated by H.F. Stewart and E.K. Rand. Edited by E.H. Warmington. 1968 ed. Cambridge, Massachusetts & London: Loeb Classical Library. Reprint, 1968.
- Boswell, John Eastburn. 'Expositio and Oblatio: The Abandonment of Children and the Ancient and Medieval Family.' *The American Historical Review* 89, no. 1 (1984): 10-33.
- Brady, Bernadette. 'Theories of Fate among Present-day Astrologers.' Unpublished PhD dissertation, University of Wales Trinity Saint David, 2011.
- Burges, W. 'La Ragione de Padoue.' *Annales Archeologiques* XVIII (1858): 330-343.
- . 'La Ragione de Padoue. Suite.' *Annales Archeologiques* XIX, no. 31 (1859): 240-252.
- Carruthers, Mary. *The Craft of Thought: Meditation, Rhetoric, and the Making of Images, 400-1200*. Vol. 34, Cambridge Studies in Medieval Literature Cambridge University Press 2000.
- Carruthers, Mary J. *The Book of Memory: A Study of Memory in Medieval Culture*. 2 ed. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008.
- Carruthers, Mary, and Jan M. Ziolkowski, eds. *The Medieval Craft of Memory: An Anthology of Texts and Pictures* University of Pennsylvania Press, 2003.
- da Nono, Giovanni. 'Visio Egidij Regis Patavie.' *Bollettino del Museo Civico di Padova* N.S. X-XI [XXVII - XXVIII] and XIII-XVII (1934-39): 1-20.
- Engel, Johannes. *Astrolabium planum in tabulis ascendens*. Augsburg: Erhard Ratdolt, 1488 Vigesimo septimo Kalendas Nouembris.
- Gage, John. *Colour and culture: practice and meaning from antiquity to abstraction*. London: Thames & Hudson, 1993.
- Haldane, John. 'Editorial Introduction: Scholasticism - Old and New.' *The Philosophical Quarterly* 43, no. 173 (1993): 403-411.
- Hyde, J.K. *Padua in the Age of Dante*. Manchester and New York: Manchester University Press 1966.
- ibn Ezra, Avraham Ben Meir. *The Beginning of Wisdom (Reshith Hochma)*. Translated by Meira B. Epstein. Edited by Robert Hand. Reston: ARHAT Publications, 1998.
- Ingold, Tim. 'Ways of mind-walking: reading, writing, painting.' *Visual Studies* 25, no. 1 (2010): 15-23.
- Makdisi, George. 'Scholasticism and Humanism in Classical Islam and the Christian West.' *Journal of the American Oriental Society* 109, no. 2 (1989): 175-182.
- Mariani Canova, Giordana. 'Padua and the Stars: Medieval Painting and Illuminated Manuscripts.' In *ASP Conference Series (Proceedings of a conference held October 18-23, 2009 in Venezia, Italy)*, edited by Enrico Maria Corsini. Vol. 441. 111-129. San Francisco: Astronomical Society of the Pacific, 2011.
- Pieper, Josef. *Scholasticism*. Translated by Richard Winston and Clara. South Bend, Indiana: St Augustine's Press, 2001.
- Randolph, Adrian. 'Regarding Women in Sacred Space.' In *Picturing Women in Renaissance and Baroque Italy*, edited by G.A. Johnson and S.F. Matthews Grieco. 17-41 and 250-256. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997.

- Robortello, Francesco. *in librum Aristotelis de arte poetica explicationes*. Florentiæ: In officina L. Torrentini, 1548.
- Ryding, William Wellington. *Structure in medieval narrative*. The Hague: Mouton, 1971.
- Stone, Harold. 'Why Europeans Stopped Reading Averroës: The Case of Pierre Bayle.' *Alif: Journal of Comparative Poetics*, no. 16 (1996): 77-95.
- Stookey, Laurence Hull. *Christ's Time for the Church Calendar*. Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1996.
- Webster, James Carson. *The Labors of the Months*, Northwestern University Studies in the Humanities, Number Four. New York: AMS Press, 1938.
- Yates, Frances A. *The Art of Memory*. London: Pimlico, 1996.