

ECAD6007

University of Wales Trinity St David

A critical evaluation and the identification of next teaching and learning steps focusing on a case study of an individual learner or a group of learners, based on an observed critical incident.

Elizabeth Platt

A critical evaluation and the identification of next teaching and learning steps focusing on a case study of an individual learner or a group of learners, based on an observed critical incident

Introduction

The use of critical incidents refers to an analytical pedagogical approach where in an observed moment within a classroom is re-examined for its deeper meaning and solutions to any negative implications are explored and suggested. The theory was popularised by Tripp (1993) and allows for a reflective practice that develops professional judgment. The teacher makes changes to their own practice based on critical incidents by examining related literature and allows them to selectively and purposefully implement education theory within their classroom. Critical incidents need not be dramatic or bizarre, but as pivotal moments in which underpinning pedagogy can be applied (Tripp, 1993, p. 24). In this particular case the role of peer assessment will be examined. Its' links to the New Curriculum for Wales, in particular links to the four purposes proposed by Donaldson (2015) will be explored. Educational research that considers the influence of peers on the individual pupil will be examined. The role of assessment for learning will also be looked at as a whole and the issues that exist within the practice examined. From this, further suggestions will be made in how to best benefit the learner in future peer assessment tasks in order for its full benefits to be experienced and any negatives limited.

Observation

The observation of the critical incident took place in an 11-16 mixed Secondary School in South Wales. The school maintains between 700-800 pupils on roll annually and features a specialist unit for Key Stage Three and Four that hosts pupils with profound and multiple learning disabilities. A minority of the students come from the most deprived areas of Wales, although the school does fall below the national average of free school meal percentage. The individual pupil budget sits at a median average for the local authority and the school has been awarded a standard of excellent by Estyn for its resource management of this budget.

The observed incident took place in a year seven art class (ages 11-12), the class featured two pupils with additional learning needs and a Learning Support Assistant (LSA) was aiding students in addition to the teacher. The observed lesson was the final of the day and the atmosphere was busy but productive. Due to the recent Covid-19 pandemic the pupils final lesson was 15 minutes shorter than what would be the normal time-tabled slot, due to the need for students exiting the premises to do so at staggered timings in order to adhere to governmental guidelines. It is also of note that the traditional transition from primary to secondary education has been a different experience for this particular year group due to the national lock down; meaning that many students had a six month gap of their time spent in schools making their transition into secondary school less conventional than previous years.

By its nature, critical incident analysis relies on the role of observation (Tripp, 1993, p.8). This method of quantifying success, weakness, and suggesting future changes relies on a level of identification and professional diagnosis. The two main observation techniques are; observation and non-participant observation. Participant observation involves an observer becoming fully involved within the group's activities, experiencing them as the group does. Non-participant observation describes a passive observer separate from the group (Kumar, 2014). In both of these models the group is aware they are being observed as the guidelines set out by BERA stipulate in relation to transparency that research should be as clear as possible to participants in the detail of when and how research is taking place (British Educational Research Association BERA, 2019). The purpose of this observation would fall into Estyn's guidelines for "Understanding effective practice in other sectors: primary/secondary, secondary/further education" (ESTYN, 2014)

This observation will be conducted utilising the non-participant observation method. A large part of this decision was to help eliminate the role of the Hawthorne effect referring to the change in behaviour when a subject is aware, they are being observed (Cherry, 2020). Although participants will be aware that they are being observed a passive figure in the back of a classroom will have less influence. Furthermore, in a study by McCambridge et al (2014) a pivotal point was identified relating to the Hawthorne effect; "Perhaps, use of the label should be restricted to evaluations in which conformity and social desirability considerations are involved" (McCambridge, et al., 2014). Asking the question, if a class would behave in a certain way for a teacher, what effect would an observer have as they already have a higher authority figure?

Each of these models have positives and negatives, but observation itself comes with an inherent issue when considering classroom behaviours. It is, in itself, neither qualitative or quantitative and often takes the form of an overly narrative piece of text (Bickman, 2009, p. 261). In order to stop individual judgement from the observer, critical incidents must be described using neutral language. Tripp describes one such example when a teacher observed a pupil putting unwanted food in a bin and stated "This child is clearly being 'sneaky'" (Tripp, 1993, p. 52). By using linguistics that carry an opinion behind them there is a risk that further conclusions based upon the initial observed incident will be tainted by subsequent vocabulary choices. Observation draws the observer to narrative, but research demands objectivity. However, there are also advantages to observing an incident and then looking into its underpinning pedagogy. This approach can also be referred to as a case study, specifically where an incident is chosen and in its own right examined. Adelman referring to it as "the study of an instance in action" (Adelman 1976 as cited in Qi, 2009, p.23). Establishing a holistic view including direct cause and effect as well as lesser contributing factors allows for a deeper understand of the classroom.

The critical incident being examined occurred as previously stated in a year seven art classroom. At the midway point of the lesson the teacher, who's class was completing an aboriginal style animal, asked them to stop and swap papers in order to peer assess using the "two ticks and a wish" method. Most pupils promptly did so swapping papers, writing the required three sentences and then continuing on with their work. A few pupils however, raised their hand to ask for further guidance in how to give their partner a wish "without being nasty". The teacher then explained that the wish was not a negative about their partners work, but a way to make it even better.

A full copy is available to view in Addendum 1.2

To best understand the significance of an observed critical incident, links can be made to the Welsh Curriculum. Successful Futures the Independent Review of Curriculum and Assessment Arrangements in Wales by Professor Graham Donaldson (2015) has outlined a new curriculum ideology for Wales with four central purposes. These are:

“Our children and young people will be:

Ambitious, capable learners who... are ready to learn throughout their lives

Enterprising, creative contributors who... are ready to play a full part in life and work

Ethical, informed citizens who... are ready to be citizens of Wales and the World

Healthy, confident individuals who... are ready to lead fulfilling lives as valued members of society”

(Donaldson, 2015)

Firstly, within the “Ambitious, capable learners” there is an elaboration that learners are able to “...build up a body of knowledge and have the skills to connect and apply knowledge in different contexts”. By applying their expertise pupils are able to use their pre-existing knowledge of what makes a successful piece and analyse their peers work.

Secondly, under the branch of “Enterprising, creative contributors” teamwork, the careful expression of emotions and creating individuals who can beneficially influence others through their own skills and energy can relate to peer assessment. It requires levels of diplomacy, sensitivity and positivity. These skills are developed and by allowing pupils to give and receive feedback with their peers, fostering empathy by sharing the experience in unison.

This emotional growth could also link to the “Ethical, informed citizens” branch that calls for pupils to be aware of the impact that their actions and choices have. Evidence of this could also be seen as pupils enquired about how to give their “wish”. The enquiry of how to complete their partners target and the answer from the teacher allows pupils to develop skills that fit into the “Healthy, confident individuals” area of the curriculum. The desire not to be mean spirited and the understanding that the targets set by their peers were there to help them succeed in their work allows pupils to “form positive relationships based upon trust and mutual respect” (Donaldson, 2015, p. 30)

In order to fully understand the pedagogical implications of the observed critical incident, analysis of the literature is a vital step in suggesting further steps or recommendations for change. A key factor in peer assessment is the role that a peer plays to an individual pupil. The influence of peers is perhaps most commonly explained by educators using Bronfenbrenner's model, depicting the ecology of human development which put the role of peers and friends of the individual in the classification hierarchy of "Microsystem". Referring to the smallest and closest part of the ecological systems theory, the Microsystem has the biggest influence over the child and is believed to be where the understanding of social norms originates from (Bronfenbrenner, 1979). Criticism has been leveled at the use of the ecological systems model due to the ever changing nature of society. Bronfenbrenner himself created many amendments that placed more emphasis on how the child should be viewed using the PPCT model. Unfortunately, this continued state of development can lead to researchers building on a previous and therefore outdated model. However the role of the Microsystem has remained largely unchanged since its original inception (Trudge, et al., 2009).

Despite these amendments, a constant factor has been the presence of "bidirectional" relationships within the Microsystem. Due to their proximity with the self Bronfenbrenner posits that, as these factors can influence the individual pupil, the pupil can also influence them in return (Bronfenbrenner & Ceci 1994 as cited in Aubrey & Riley, 2019, p. 153). The implication of the bidirectional influence has on the understanding of peer assessment is of note. Black et al, in *Assessment for Learning Putting it into Practice*, found that when managed appropriately peer assessment can be a tool to support students in their own social skills (2003). Black et al also found that one of the main benefits of peer assessment was that once a child has understood a success criteria, relaying this to a peer their language choices will be better understood by one another and are often more accepting of valid feedback (Black et al, 2003 as cited in Aubrey & Riley, 2019). Sociocultural theories propose that the most effective learning comes from a peer to peer exchange, in particular when a dialogue is allowed to occur. By questioning, self- and peer assessing, pupils can develop internal standards and better ownership of learning (Bennett, 2011).

The importance of peer assessment does not just apply to receiving feedback however, pupils can benefit more from being an assessor than simply being assessed (Lu & Law, 2012). Bloom's Taxonomy categorises this process of utilising existing knowledge and applying it to understand the success of another's work as "Evaluative". Although placed last in terms of the steps of cognitive development Bloom does note that it does not represent mastery, it can in fact be the first step in understanding a new topic by way of judging gaps in understanding (Bloom, et al., 1956, p. 185). Bloom et al also examines the role of assessment of work for understanding and learning, and its potential drawbacks. Noting that internal and external criteria form two separate thought processes, that a personal opinion may well be very different to that of an expert (in the school context an examiner) (Bloom, et al., 1956).

Further positive benefits of peer assessment are its links to self assessment. By teaching pupils to recognise, even in work different to their own, desirable qualities and areas for improvement pupils begin to identify and assimilate the success criteria allowing them greater clarity when self assessing. (Black & Jones, 2006, p. 4). Within Successful Futures, the importance of peer assessment's importance is emphasised. The focus on life long learning within the curriculum

requires reflection and a depth of understanding both of which are prompted and developed by peer assessment, causing the recommendation “44. Both self-assessment and peer assessment should be developed as ways of encouraging children and young people to take greater responsibility for their own learning” (Donaldson, 2015, p. 81) to be made.

Peer assessment is generally categorised as a form of assessment for learning. Broadly defined as an approach in which formative feedback from various tasks is used to improve the performance of an individual or group of students by making the learning visible (Warner & Palmer, 2018, p. 1033). Assessment for Learning (or AFL) cannot be discussed without addressing the work of Black and Williams (1998) which culminated in the publication *Inside the Black Box*. *Inside the Black Box* focuses on the role of the classroom and its pivotal point between policy makers and successful student results. Referring to it as “the black box” Black & Williams posed that studying what happens in the classroom is key to improving results. Black & Williams found that formative assessment, and AFL were key factors in ensuring pupil success. Noting that a summative assessment that simply yields a final result does not allow educators and students a chance to rectify understanding. In contrast formative assessment and AFL can work as a diagnostic tool (1998). Williams, as part of the Assessment Reform Group (ARG), set out 5 main elements for assessment to improve learning. These included; the teachers responsibility to take note and respond to the results of assessment, the influence that assessment has on the pupils self-esteem and motivation, as well as the need for students to assess themselves (The Assessment Reform Group 1999 as cited in Aubrey & Riley, 2019). Estyn has also commented on the benefits of AFL, stating that the practice can significantly change classroom culture and lead to a confident ability. In a key school it was noted that the peer assessment process in particular had galvanised pupil learning and that by explaining their work to others it has improved diplomacy and oracy skills (ESTYN, 2018).

With all that being said assessment for learning does not come without flaws. For instance, within their own research Black & Williams noted that self or peer assessment was only successful when pupils understood and were aware of what they were trying to achieve, stressing the importance of pupil understanding of targets or objectives (Black and William (1998 as cited in Aubrey & Riley, 2019). This links in with comments previously mentioned in Bloom et al’s work, that the separate success criteria of internal and external factors have to be addressed. Additionally weak suggestions for improvement have neither benefit to the pupil receiving this nor the one assessing the work. Without modeling of training on how to, not only critique sensitively, but with solutions or plans in place the task itself can become almost redundant in its use particularly in online peer assessment (Lu & Law, 2012). Successful peer assessment occurs when there is base understanding.

Education blogger Joe Kirby argues that whilst Black & William’s *Inside the Black Box* was “powerful stuff” the theory behind it had been hijacked and distorted by many who didn’t understand the versatility behind the theory. Stating that the overly bureaucratised presence of mandated in lesson progress assessment became “reductio ad absurdum” (Kirby, 2013). Support for this view comes from fellow education blogger David Didau, in a blog post Didau explained that whilst he has been massively influenced in his personal practise by the work of, in particular Williams he disagreed with the “big idea” of assessment for learning. Stating that mandated formative assessment does not improve metacognition, and that authenticity is needed in lesson tasks. Whilst proof reading another students work may aid in understanding, a traffic light system will not (Didau, 2014).

The authenticity of peer assessment within an art lesson leads to further theory. Artistic practice relies on developing a critical judgment when looking at other artists work, with one of the four approaches to teaching secondary art and design being a “locus for critique” (Addison &

Burgess, 2015, p. 6). Within this context pupil assessment is not a tool for learning, but a technique to learn. Because of the inately critical nature of the art classroom, the lines between internal and external success criteria become increasingly difficult to separate. For this reason, the external success criteria could be used to scaffold self- or peer assessment during earlier KS3 years (Addison & Burgess, 2015). In the beginning students would be taught to comment on solely descriptive factors of the work; shape, form ect. The students then advance to how these aspects interlink and finally they move on to considering the implications of the piece, its intent and how successful it is.

As the subject matter becomes more complex, the understand and therefore critique of the work should reflect this (Risatti, 1987). This does raise further questions in terms of validity of pupils opinions, it may seem as though pupils are encouraged to deviate from their own individual opinion and simply look to assess their peers work in the same way an examiner would. This means that a key distinction has to be made; honeing a critical voice in art requires the application of the understanding of a successful piece and being able to validate personal opinion through reasoned and evidenced arguments based on prior study and knowledge (Steers 2013 as cited it Addison & Burgess, 2015).

Perhaps the most vital step to truly understand the significance of these moments is reflection. Unless a teacher can use reflective practice, their unexamined assumptions and reactions become stagnant. To use reflective practice is to fuse personal beliefs into a professional identity (Larrivee, 2000, as cited in Finlay, 2008). In short, without reflecting on the literature around an incident, it becomes redundant in developing personal practice.

In order for a practitioner or researcher to reflect on literature, they may consider utilising a reflective model. For this reflection Brookfeilds Lenses has been chosen for its different perspectives that allow us to pinpoint “the distorted or incomplete aspects of our assumptions that need further investigation” (Brookfeild, 1998, p. 197).

The first lens is Autobiographical with personal experience considered. My own teaching experience being limited, the most appropriate experiences to consider are my own as a pupil. I experienced secondary education after the publication of and implementation of *Inside the Black Box* meaning that AFL was part of my classroom environment. Peer assessment played a larger role whilst at university, the with a heightened form of peer assessment called a “gap crit”. As a teenager in secondary school my mind would have gone to Kirby (2013) and Didau’s (2014) suggestions that how AFL was implemented had become almost tokenistic and inauthentic. However, after experiencing gap crits in university I understood the importance of building a critical voice. Furthermore, after reading Risatti (1987) I now believe that the importance of honing a critical voice through peer assessment is vital. A child will learn to understand the artwork of another child with greater ease than the work of a modern artist.

The second lens to consider is what the experience looked like through the eyes of the pupils. As mentioned in the observation description, several of the learners asked how to give constructive feedback. The need for this qualification showcases a lack of understanding by those in the class. As Lu & Law (2012) found, peer feedback where the success criteria has not been understood can become a redundant task. The question here is did the individuals in the class raise their hands because they did not understand the success of a piece or because they did not understand what made successful feedback. As mentioned earlier, this year groups transition to secondary education had been less conventional than that of previous years meaning that they may require extra modeling of standard school practices.

The next lens to consider is the experience of colleagues. I discussed the incident initially with the classroom practitioner at the end of all the completed observations, so as not to influence what was observed. They viewed the lack of understanding over how to give feedback as an issue with the class understanding the structure of the feedback due to their lengthy time off school. They had in fact deviated from the standard feedback model that the school normally used that featured an “even better if” form to the “two ticks and wish model” as they knew it was what many were familiar with at primary school. When discussing the observed incident and literature with fellow researchers, they noted that the desire of the individual pupils not to deliver mean spirited comments showcased Donaldson’s (2015) aim that individuals should become ethical and informed citizens, noting that wanting to make constructive comments aligned with this.

The final lens to consider is what we can glean from literature. Bronfenbrenner's continued work shows us the impact of bidirectional peer relationships, and by building on these in a positive way we can directly affect learning. However, critics stress the importance of assessment for learning being authentic (Didau, 2014). Voices such as Risatti (1987) would suggest that all forms of self- and peer assessment are authentic to the art classroom due to how they lend themselves to the development of critical opinions. It is also important to consider the role of success criteria, the suggestion by Addison & Burgess (2015) that using an external success criteria would help to remove the seeming personal voice of a peer.

Following this reflection there are few suggestions that could be made to improve the scenario that was observed. The use of peer assessment in an art classroom is an authentic use of AFL. However, to increase authenticity a role play situation could be used when suggesting the task to the pupils. For example, "pretend you work in an art gallery, your peer is an artist, what would you ask them to do to make you proud to display their work?". By relating it to the real world pupils understand the purpose of giving and receiving feedback. It would also link in with Donaldson's (2015) curriculum whereby children and young people become lifelong learners by teaching them to accept critique and grow from it within professional roles.

The next suggestion could be to provide scaffolding for feedback. Pupils could also be given a copy of the success criteria for their piece and be asked to tick two things that their peer did well and circle one that they could improve. Although this approach could seem more "basic" than the two ticks and wish model that requires a greater application of knowledge as described in Bloom et al (1956), it lays the groundwork correctly, allowing pupils to develop the skills without the influence of bad practice as seen in Steers (2013) as cited in Addison & Burgess (2015).

A final suggestion could be the inclusion of a "I can successfully peer assess" achievement in Donaldson's (2015) recommendation for the creation of an "e-portfolio" where records of accomplishments and experiences are kept. This award could help underscore the importance of peer assessment as a crucial and learnt skill.

In personal practice, the role of authenticity in peer assessment has clear benefits. The key to its success does not appear to be the frequency of which it is used but the understanding of those partaking in it of its purpose. Art education relies heavily on development of the individual's critical voice and by utilising pupils as a resource for one another, this process can be done in a way that becomes accessible and beneficial to other areas of the curriculum beyond art and design.

Conclusion

Utilising the non-participant observation model a critical incident analysis, or case study was performed around an observed peer assessment within a year seven classroom. Research regarding the role of peer assessment, AFL and the development of a critical voice in art was examined and then reflected upon using Brookfeilds lenses (1998). Overall the research was evaluated in terms of validity, opposition and subject specific circumstances. However as the research conducted was by an individual who operated outside of the classroom environment the choices made by the teacher and students lacked the context that a self evaluation practitioner would have if performing their own critical incident review. It was only when further explanation was provided by the teacher that the choices made were revealed to be purposeful in their design in the use of a primary school feedback model.

The role of reflection as a teacher in Wales is key to getting the best out of the Professional Standards for Teaching and Leadership (Education Wales, 2017). By understanding what outcome is desired for the individual or group of pupils, in essence the teaching practice is reverse engineered using studied pedagogy (Education Wales, 2018). A teacher cannot deliver on the expectation of leadership without the confidence of underpinning pedagogy, and the reflection on their own practice to know how to best support their pupils to success. Furthermore, reflective practice allows for professional learning to continue throughout a teacher's career; with Tripp (1993) stressing the importance of continued critical incident analysis in order to prevent stagnation. It is only through these continuous self-reflective processes does purposeful innovation occur, seeking to answer issues that genuinely matter. These approaches can then be shared with other practitioners who can then trial them in their own classroom approach, reflect and then continue the cycle of a constantly evolving and improving teaching practice in Wales.

References

- Addison, N. & Burgess, L., 2015. *Learning to Teach Art and Design in the Secondary School*. 3rd ed. Oxon: Routledge.
- Aubrey, K. & Riley, A., 2019. *Understanding and Using Educational Theory*. 2nd ed. London: SAGE Publications.
- Bennett, R. E., 2011. Formative assessment: a critical review. *Assessment in Education: Principles, Policy & Practice*, 18(1), pp. 5-25.
- Bickman, L., 2009. *The SAGE Handbook of Applied Social Research Methods*. 2nd ed. London: SAGE Publications Limited.
- Black, P. & Jones, J., 2006. Formative assessment and the learning and teaching of MFL: sharing the language learning road map with learners. *Language Learning Journal*, Volume 34, pp. 4-9.
- Bloom, B. S. et al., 1956. *Taxonomy of Educational Objectives The classification of educational goals*. 1st ed. London: Longmans.
- British Educational Research Association BERA, 2019. *BERA Ethical Guidelines for Educational Research*. [Online]
Available at: <https://www.bera.ac.uk/publication/ethical-guidelines-for-educational-research-2018-online#transparency>
[Accessed 30 September 2020].
- Bronfenbrenner, U., 1979. *the Ecology of Human Development*. 9th ed. Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press.
- Brookfield, S., 1998. Critically Reflective Practice. *The Journal of Continuing Education in the Health Professions*, Volume 18, pp. 197-205.
- Cherry, K., 2020. *The Hawthorne Effect and Behavioral Studies*. [Online]
Available at: <https://www.verywellmind.com/what-is-the-hawthorne-effect-2795234>
[Accessed 20 October 2020].
- Didau, D., 2014. *Why AFL might be wrong and what to do about it..* [Online]
Available at: <https://learningspy.co.uk/myths/afl-might-wrong/>
[Accessed 17 October 2020].
- Donaldson, G., 2015. *Successful Futures*, s.l.: Welsh Government.
- Education Wales, 2017. *An introduction to the professional standards for teaching and leadership*. [Online]
Available at: <https://hwb.gov.wales/professional-development/professional-standards/>
[Accessed 17 October 2020].
- Education Wales, 2018. *Philippa Cordingley - Cynhadleddau yr Hydref 2018 / Philippa Cordingley - Autumn conferences 2018*. [Online]
Available at: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=wtDUNAy7Nig&feature=emb_title
[Accessed 25 October 2020].

ESTYN, 2014. *Effective classroom observation in Primary and Secondary schools*, Cardiff: Estyn Publication Centre.

ESTYN, 2018. *Assessment for Learning and thinking skills*. [Online]
Available at: <https://www.estyn.gov.wales/effective-practice/assessment-learning-and-thinking-skills>
[Accessed 30 September 2020].

Finlay, L., 2008. Reflecting On "Reflective Practice". *Practice Based Professional Learning Papper. The Open University.* , Volume 52.

Jeff Sauro, P., 2015. *"Measuring U" Four Types of Observational Research*. [Online]
Available at: <https://measuringu.com/observation-role/>
[Accessed 12 October 2020].

Kirby, J., 2013. *What can we learn from Dylan Williams and AfL*. [Online]
Available at:
<https://pragmaticreform.wordpress.com/2013/03/30/afl/#:~:text='The%20only%20thing%20we%20learn,ve%20learned%20from%20our%20mistakes'.&text='Blessed%20are%20the%20forgetful%3A%20for,better%20even%20of%20their%20blunders'.&text=but%20requires%20teachers%20t>
[Accessed 4th October 2020].

Kumar, R., 2014. *Research Methodology a step-by-step guide*. 4th ed. London: SAGE.

Lu, J. & Law, N., 2012. Online Peer Assessment: effects of cognitive and affective feedback. *Instr Sci*, Volume 40, pp. 257-275.

McCambridge, J., Witton, J. & Ebourne, D. R., 2014. Systematic review of the Hawthorne effect: New concepts are needed to study research participation effects. *Journal of Clinical Epidemiology*, 67(3), pp. 267-277.

Qi, S., 2009. Case Study in Contemporary Educational. *Cross-Cultural Communication*, 5(4), pp. 21-23.

Risatti, H., 1987. Art Criticism in Discipline-Based Art Education. *The Journal of Aesthetic Education*, 21(2), pp. 217-225.

Tripp, D., 1993. *Critical Incidents In Teaching*. 2nd ed. New York: Routledge.

Trudge, J. R. H., Mokrova, I., Hatfeild, B. E. & Rachana, K. B., 2009. Uses and misuses of Bronfenbrenner's bioecological theory of human development. *Journal of Family Theory and Reveiw*, 1(4), pp. 198-210.

Warner, T. & Palmer, E., 2018. Formative self-and peer assessment for improved student learning: the crucial factors of design, teacher participation and feedback. *Assessment & Evaluation in Higher Education*, 43(7), pp. 1032-1047.

Addendum 1.1

OBSERVATION / FIELD NOTES

(Questions adapted from Fletcher Wood (2016))

Date and time, year group: 30th September, Lesson 5, Year 7
Lesson details: (Context and focus -/AoLE/subject- is it near start of end of unit of study? Indoors/outdoors? Ability range? Any particularly relevant information). The lesson observed was a creative expression lesson, specifically art. The lesson was part of a scheme of work relating to aboriginal art and was about the third planned. The lesson observed was in a classroom that followed current Covid-19 guidelines. The ability of the lesson was mixed with two students having additional learning needs that entitled them to a Learning Support Assistant. The transition from primary to secondary was interrupted for these students due to national lockdown restrictions.
Classroom culture (What is the classroom 'vibe.'? What do attitudes, dispositions, behaviours towards learning seem like at this point in time?) The classroom culture was busy, with pupils engaged in their work, leading to a productive environment. The pupils asked subject specific questions to further their understanding of areas such as color. The behaviour was overall desirable with only a few reminders having to be given by the teacher to keep conversation volume low.
Objectives (What happens in the environment that communicates the purpose of the experiences? What can be observed regarding the way lesson activities relate to these purposes?) Slides of exemplar work were clearly visible on the interactive whiteboard. Starter exercises were used in order to galvanise artistic choices that the class should make. The teacher asked questions about what kind of animals would feature in aboriginal art and why. Although lesson objectives were not reiterated as the lesson was a continuation of a previous one, after the observation was complete, the teacher explained that the starter questions directly related to the objectives set out in the previous.
Direction (What can be observed that helps learners understand what they are engaging in? What in the environment helps them understand how to achieve well?)

Pupils were given a key to decipher and use the symbolism seen in aboriginal art, aiding in understanding the functionality of the more artistic version of topography used by the aboriginal people.

Peer assessment was used at the midway point of the lesson, utilising the “two ticks and a wish” method.

Access and challenge

(What can be observed in the environment that enables engagement of learners? What can be observed regarding levels of challenge?)

Pupils who completed the task were given an extension activity to start

Pupils who were struggling were given guide sheets on how to break down their animal into basic shapes to aid with proportion.

Pupils were given individual feedback from the teacher as she was circling the room on how pupils could improve their works aesthetic value.

Assessment

(Can anything be observed about how student’s existing knowledge is used? Can anything be observed regarding the development of knowledge during or after the experience?)

During plenary further questions were asked about aboriginal art and its meaning (in relation to navigation)

Peer assessment was used at the midway point, several students asked for ways to give feedback without being “nasty”. The teacher then explained to the class that the feedback was there to let them help their peer be better.

Specifics / Critical Incidents

(Are there moments which cause you to consider aspects of practice when you come across them in future teaching?)

The role of peer assessment, the idea that it is a learnt skill and its benefits may not be obvious to a class.

The role of scaffolding as a form of differentiation in artistic practice.

CRITICAL INCIDENT IDENTIFICATION RECORD

Details relevant to the research context. Date/time. Age/Stage of group. People involved. Contextual information from field notes.	30th September, Lesson 5, Expressive Arts, Art and Design Year 7 class, two members of the class with additional learning needs that entitled them to the presence of a Learning Support Assistant. The class was just under 30 pupils, and had one teacher, one LSA, and myself as a passive researcher. Pupils work was focused on aboriginal art. Pupils had an unconventional transition from primary to secondary due to national lockdown.
<i>What happened? A detailed description of what you observed and what thoughts on pedagogy and practice occurred to you as a result, looking towards your research.</i>	At the midway point of the lesson the teacher asked the class to swap their drawings with the person sitting next to them and to give them “two ticks and a wish” about their work. The pupils did so, writing their recommendations on the back of their partners’ work. The level of noise increased as pupils discussed with their partners what they thought was good and bad about the art. A few pupils raised their hands and asked about how to give their “wish” constructively. One pupil asking how not to be “nasty”. The teacher then explained to the whole class that the wish was there to make the work of their peers even better, a suggestion for positive change rather than pointing out flaws. My first thought was Successful Futures, how this practice related to the four purposes of the curriculum. I also wanted to consider the role that peers play in learning, the effectiveness of assessment for learning and how this particular practice related to an Art lesson.

Addendum 2.1

Date and time, year group: 30th September, Lesson 1, Year 7
Lesson details: (Context and focus -/AoLE/subject- is it near start of end of unit of study? Indoors/outdoors? Ability range? Any particularly relevant information). The lesson observed was a creative expression lesson, specifically art. The lesson was part of a scheme of work relating to aboriginal art and was about the third planned. The lesson observed was in a classroom that followed current Covid-19 guidelines. The ability of the lesson was high with no additional learning needs visible. The transition from primary to secondary was interrupted for these students due to national lockdown restrictions.
Classroom culture (What is the classroom 'vibe.'? What do attitudes, dispositions, behaviours towards learning seem like at this point in time?) Pupils seemed indifferent to their work the teacher having to remind them several times to stay on task. Although there was no dramatically poor behavior the level of chatter did not seem to lend itself to a productive environment for progressing with the task.
Objectives (What happens in the environment that communicates the purpose of the experiences? What can be observed regarding the way lesson activities relate to these purposes?) Slides of exemplar work were clearly visible on the interactive whiteboard. Starter exercises were used in order to galvanise artistic choices that the class should make. The teacher asked questions about what kind of animals would feature in aboriginal art and why. Although lesson objectives were not reiterated as the lesson was a continuation of a previous one, after the observation was complete, the teacher explained that the starter questions directly related to the objectives set out in the previous
Direction (What can be observed that helps learners understand what they are engaging in? What in the environment helps them understand how to achieve well?) Pupils were given a key to decipher and use the symbolism seen in aboriginal art, aiding in understanding the functionality of the more artistic version of topography used by the aboriginal people. Peer assessment was used at the midway point of the lesson, utilising the "two ticks and a wish" method.

Access and challenge

(What can be observed in the environment that enables engagement of learners? What can be observed regarding levels of challenge?)

Pupils who completed the task were given an extension activity to start

Pupils who were struggling were given guide sheets on how to break down their animal into basic shapes to aid with proportion.

Pupils were given individual feedback from the teacher as she was circling the room on how pupils could improve their works aesthetic value.

Assessment

(Can anything be observed about how student's existing knowledge is used? Can anything be observed regarding the development of knowledge during or after the experience?)

Pupils completed the work to a high standard but slowly, they appropriately applied the success criteria

Pupils applied feedback, given by their peers and by the teacher. Showing understanding of the success criteria and ability to take work further.

Specifics / Critical Incidents

(Are there moments which cause you to consider aspects of practice when you come across them in future teaching?)

When the class arrived, there was no seating plan in place, over the course of the lesson several pupils were removed to sit away from their friends. The use of a seating plan as a form of behaviour management could underpin certain behaviour management schools of thinking and their strategy.

Addendum 2.2

CRITICAL INCIDENT IDENTIFICATION RECORD

Details relevant to the research context. Date/time. Age/Stage of group. People involved. Contextual information from field notes.	30th September, Lesson 1, Expressive Arts, Art and Design Year 7 class of high ability The incident featured a class of under 30, one teacher and myself as a passive observer. Pupils work was focused on aboriginal art. Pupils had an unconventional transition from primary to secondary due to national lockdown.
<i>What happened? A detailed decription of what you observed and what thoughts on pedagogy and practice occurred to you as a result, looking towards your research.</i>	Two pupils were consistently talking throughout the lesson and becoming disruptive, they were at the epicentre of the conversation that would take over the lesson. The teacher instructed the students to sit on separate tables far apart from one another so as to break up the conversation between the two key students. The students did so begrudgingly and then continued on with their work at a better productive pace. The areas for research to consider in this case would be different behaviour management theories, addressing primary or secondary behaviour and Donaldson's purposes.

Addendum 3.1

OBSERVATION / FIELD NOTES

(Questions adapted from Fletcher Wood (2016))

Date and time, year group: 30th September, Lesson 3, Year 9
Lesson details: (Context and focus - /AoLE/subject- is it near start of end of unit of study? Indoors/outdoors? Ability range? Any particularly relevant information). The lesson observed was a creative expression lesson, specifically art. The lesson was part of a scheme of work relating to portraiture and was about the fourth in the scheme. The lesson observed was in a classroom that followed current Covid-19 guidelines. The ability was of the lesson was low in terms of artistic talent but with no additional learning needs visible.
Classroom culture (What is the classroom 'vibe.'? What do attitudes, dispositions, behaviors towards learning seem like at this point in time?) Pupils, although of a lower artistic ability, seemed to be engaged and enjoying their task of drawing a self-portrait. There was general productive chatter that did not seem to negatively impact work in any significant way.
Objectives (What happens in the environment that communicates the purpose of the experiences? What can be observed regarding the way lesson activities relate to these purposes?) Objectives were explained clearly during a demonstration of how to use different techniques.
Direction (What can be observed that helps learners understand what they are engaging in? What in the environment helps them understand how to achieve well?) Exemplar were displayed on the wall. Lesson objectives were viewed prominently on the white board throughout the lesson Feedback was constantly given by the teacher circulating the room.
Access and challenge (What can be observed in the environment that enables engagement of learners? What can be observed regarding levels of challenge?) Pupils who completed the task were given an additional element to add to their artwork. Pupils who were struggling were given modelling sheets to help with proportion

Assessment

(Can anything be observed about how student's existing knowledge is used? Can anything be observed regarding the development of knowledge during or after the experience)?

Pupils completed the work to a low to medium standard but consistently attempted to improve work based on individual feedback feedback.

Differentiation due to outcome of final image.

Specifics / Critical Incidents

(Are there moments which cause you to consider aspects of practice when you come across them in future teaching)?

The role of unidivual feedback for each pupil

Addendum 3.2

CRITICAL INCIDENT IDENTIFICATION RECORD

Details relevant to the research context. Date/time. Age/Stage of group. People involved. Contextual information from field notes.	30th September, Lesson 3 , Expressive Arts, Art and Design Year 9 class of high ability The incident featured a class of under 30, one teacher and myself as a passive observer. Pupils work was focused on portraiture and the self.
<i>What happened? A detailed decription of what you observed and what thoughts on pedagogy and practice occurred to you as a result, looking towards your research.</i>	The teacher was circling round the classroom looking at students work. Two students with different levels of ability had produced similar levels of outcome in their work. The teacher prasied one and encouraged the other to to try harder with her accuracy. Differentiation and the role that justice and fairness play in assessment and school life.

Addendum 4.1

OBSERVATION / FIELD NOTES

(Questions adapted from Fletcher Wood (2016))

Date and time, year group: 30th September, Lesson 5, Year 7
Lesson details: (Context and focus -/AoLE/subject- is it near start of end of unit of study? Indoors/outdoors? Ability range? Any particularly relevant information). The lesson observed was a creative expression lesson, specifically art. The lesson was part of a scheme of work relating to aboriginal art and was about the third planned. The lesson observed was in a classroom that followed current Covid-19 guidelines. The ability of the lesson was mixed with two students having additional learning needs that entitled them to a Learning Support Assistant. The transition from primary to secondary was interrupted for these students due to national lockdown restrictions.
Classroom culture (What is the classroom 'vibe.'? What do attitudes, dispositions, behaviours towards learning seem like at this point in time?) The classroom culture was busy, with pupils engaged in their work, leading to a productive environment. The pupils asked subject specific questions to further their understanding of areas such as color. The behaviour was overall desirable with only a few reminders having to be given by the teacher to keep conversation volume low.
Objectives (What happens in the environment that communicates the purpose of the experiences? What can be observed regarding the way lesson activities relate to these purposes?) Slides of exemplar work were clearly visible on the interactive whiteboard. Starter exercises were used in order to galvanise artistic choices that the class should make. The teacher asked questions about what kind of animals would feature in aboriginal art and why. Although lesson objectives were not reiterated as the lesson was a continuation of a previous one, after the observation was complete, the teacher explained that the starter questions directly related to the objectives set out in the previous.
Direction (What can be observed that helps learners understand what they are engaging in? What in the environment helps them understand how to achieve well?)

Pupils were given a key to decipher and use the symbolism seen in aboriginal art, aiding in understanding the functionality of the more artistic version of topography used by the aboriginal people.

Peer assessment was used at the midway point of the lesson, utilising the “two ticks and a wish” method.

Access and challenge

(What can be observed in the environment that enables engagement of learners? What can be observed regarding levels of challenge?)

Pupils who completed the task were given an extension activity to start

Pupils who were struggling were given guide sheets on how to break down their animal into basic shapes to aid with proportion.

Pupils were given individual feedback from the teacher as she was circling the room on how pupils could improve their works aesthetic value.

Assessment

(Can anything be observed about how student’s existing knowledge is used? Can anything be observed regarding the development of knowledge during or after the experience?)

During plenary further questions were asked about aboriginal art and its meaning (in relation to navigation)

Peer assessment was used at the midway point, several students asked for ways to give feedback without being “nasty”. The teacher then explained to the class that the feedback was there to let them help their peer be better.

Specifics / Critical Incidents

(Are there moments which cause you to consider aspects of practice when you come across them in future teaching?)

The role of peer assessment, the idea that it is a learnt skill and its benefits may not be obvious to a class.

The role of scaffolding as a form of differentiation in artistic practice.

This incident sheet is a repeat of addendum 1.1 as both incidents were observed within the same lesson.

Addendum 4.2

Details relevant to the research context. Date/time. Age/Stage of group. People involved. Contextual information from field notes.	30th September, Lesson 5, Expressive Arts, Art and Design Year 7 class, two members of the class with additional learning needs that entitled them to the presence of a Learning Support Assistant. The class was just under 30 pupils, and had one teacher, one LSA, and myself as a passive researcher. Pupils work was focused on aboriginal art. Pupils had an unconventional transition from primary to secondary due to national lockdown.
<i>What happened? A detailed decription of what you observed and what thoughts on pedagogy and practice occurred to you as a result, looking towards your research.</i>	Each pupil within the lesson received specific feedback as the teacher was circling around, some pupils were given pattern sheets, some pupils were given animal break down sheets, however none were given both. I would like to find more out about skills-based education, differentiation by outcome and modeling practices for teaching. As well as the role that confidence can play in learning.