EXAMINING ARGUMENTS: RHETORIC VERSUS LOGIC

Example one: Space Spirituality

Excerpts from *Bringers of the Dawn*

from Chap 1, "Ambassadors Through Time," p.3

We are here. We are the Pleiadians, a collective of energy from the Pleiades. We have a long history. Our ancestors came from another universe that had achieved completion, a universe. You are simply working on a planet coming to completion, and we are here to help you with that task. This completion, or transformation, has been heralded by many for eons. It is an important time. What happens on Earth now will affect the entire universe.

Completion consists of you understanding who you are so that you can go further with the experiment. Our ancestors came from a universe that had completed itself and then understood universally that it was Prime Creator, the First Cause, or the journey of Prime Creator in time. They came from a universe that had discovered its essence-creativity. By discovering that essence, we found out that we are creators.

from Chapter 3, "Who Your Gods Are," p. 23

There are many misconceptions about the idea of godhood. The universes are full of intelligent beings who have, over time, evolved and developed all sorts of capabilities and functions to serve their needs to express themselves creatively. The importance behind existence and consciousness is creativity, and creativity takes many forms.

Eons ago, Earth was but a thought in the minds of great beings who had set before themselves the task of creating new forms of existence. Many of these beings affected the creation of this universe, and you have termed them God. In actuality, they were extraterrestrial light-bearing energies far removed from Prime Creator. We rarely use the term God with a big G. If we were to use that term, we would be referring to the entity we know as Prime Creator. Prime Creator, in its own personal implosion through love, endowed all things with consciousness. All things are Prime Creator on Prime Creator's journey.

We see ourselves as an extension of Prime Creator — always gathering information, going off on adventures, and doing whatever we need to do to make our lives more interesting and challenging so that we can feed Prime Creator. As we feed Prime Creator through our schemes and our endeavors, we endow Prime Creator with greater energy to give to new creations.

CONSIDER THE ARGUMENT: HOW IS IT CONSTRUCTED?

1. Look for **pronouns**.
- Which ones are used?
- How are they used?
- What is the effect of these choices?

2. Look for **repeated words** and **statements**.
- Which ones are used?
- How are they used?
- What is the effect of these choices?

3. Look for **words** that indicate **truth claims**
- Which ones are used?
- How are they used?
- What is the effect of these choices?

REVIEWING REVIEWERS: 2 positive and 2 negative reviews:

- How does each reviewer assess the value of the book? (consider vocabulary)
- Which ones use actual examples from the text
- Which ones respond generally to the feel good factors?
- What assumptions are made about the possibility of / the effects of doing good?

5.0 out of 5 stars by Angie M John (Author 'Searching for Mooneyes') on 18 Aug. 2016

I love this book. I have had to buy several copies over the years as I keep giving it away to clients. The first time I read it I could not put it down until I had read it all, and I finally realised that there are so many more people who are light-workers on the planet right now. Doing this kind of spiritual work seems to mean a lot of isolation for those who do it. Being a very materialistic planet means that if you are not particularly interested in money, huge properties, and loads of possessions then you don't necessarily fit into the mainstream society which dictates we must have ALL the stuff to validate our existence. For sure being comfortable and having things is a part of life, but there is so much more to being alive than at first meets the eye. This book clarified and helped me so much to understand that due to my lack of interest in owning things, does not mean that there is something 'wrong' with me, but, instead that I am here to do work of a more spiritual nature and help and heal others with my work as a Medium. I love this book, and for those who are searching for an understanding of why they too, don't seem to fit in, and have other desires to do good for the planet, humans and animals whilst they are here, well , this is the book for you. Enjoy the read, and tell others about it!

2 out of 5 stars by Kristin on 4 Sept. 2013

I don't really know how this book ended up on my to-read shelf or in my hands (The alien "authors" would say that it's because I'm a member of the Family of Light who was drawn to it. I'm not buying it.) I'm clearly not the intended audience. Despite my interest in other-worldly things, this was way too wackadoodle for me. I tried to be open-minded, but come on. It first lost me when it claimed that there were reptilian beings living in the Middle East. It confused me when it claimed (again and again and again) that humans originally had 12 strands of DNA and needed to strive to achieve that alignment again (is there a DNA Alignment for Dummies book?). I scoffed when it stated that women have been worrying needlessly about contraception for eons because all we really have to do is state our intention NOT to get pregnant, and it won't happen. And I laughed out loud when it suggested we state to our friends "I don't believe in catching colds. I don't use my body for sickness." I'm already doing enough to be labeled That Crazy Mom without spouting stuff like that.

Despite all the looney tunes, there were moments of clarity and some interesting perspectives in this book: the idea that our thoughts determine reality, present mindedness, discussions of harmonious vibration (not totally sure what that is), as well as tips on dealing with painful emotions. It was kind of uplifting...in a really out-there way.

But I'm sorry to say that I think the celestial wave of light may have passed us all by. After all, it was supposed to crash down and alter humanity in, according to the book, good old 1993. Oh well. Back to the drawing board.

5 out of 5 stars by Lynne Grey on 8 Nov. 2007

This was the second book of this type that I had read, and it was so chock full of information and collaborated on the first book that I read that I just have to think that there really is something of this sort going on.

This book is not in the same context as David Icke's books on reptiles morphing into humans, It is more in line with the Ra books, "The Law of One". This book is a warning for all human kind. It tells us that we are not at the top of the food chain. We are being bred and kept for sustenance by fourth density beings. No way, you think. Well, read for yourself. The information is compelling, and if research is done, you'll find a great many things are made clear.

1.0 out of 5 stars by A customer on 13 Dec. 1998

Whatever happened with good old science. You know, the big bang, the cooling planets, the primordial ooze, the lightening, the single-celled organisms clumping together into jelly fishes, lung fishes crawling out of the ocean turning into reptiles then into mammals, then monkeys into men. I just can't buy it, Barbara. It seems really silly. These Pleiadas. And then you've got the Pleiada's sex tips! Repulsive! Your recommendation about mixing semen and menstrual blood together and then eating it is where you truly lost me. I had an open mind. I really did. I was all ready to buy the Mayan calendar BS and then you threw that out there. Yuck! Do you really do that? Ugghhh.

Example 2: RHETORIC IN POETRY

The Charge of the Light Brigade

1
Half a league, half a league,
Half a league onward,
All in the valley of Death
Rode the six hundred.
"Forward, the Light Brigade!
"Charge for the guns!" he said:
Into the valley of Death
Rode the six hundred.

2
"Forward, the Light Brigade!"
Was there a man dismay'd?
Not tho' the soldier knew
Someone had blunder'd:
Theirs not to make reply,
Theirs not to reason why,
Theirs but to do and die:
Into the valley of Death
Rode the six hundred.

3
Cannon to right of them,
Cannon to left of them,
Cannon in front of them
Volley'd and thunder'd;
Storm'd at with shot and shell,
Boldly they rode and well,
Into the jaws of Death,
Into the mouth of Hell
Rode the six hundred.

4
Flash'd all their sabres bare,
Flash'd as they turn'd in air,
Sabring the gunners there,
Charging an army, while
All the world wonder'd:
Plunged in the battery-smoke
Right thro' the line they broke;
Cossack and Russian
Reel'd from the sabre stroke
Shatter'd and sunder'd.
Then they rode back, but not
Not the six hundred.

5
Cannon to right of them,
Cannon to left of them,
Cannon behind them
Volley'd and thunder'd;
Storm'd at with shot and shell,
While horse and hero fell,
They that had fought so well
Came thro' the jaws of Death
Back from the mouth of Hell,
All that was left of them,
Left of six hundred.

6
When can their glory fade?
O the wild charge they made!
All the world wondered.
Honour the charge they made,
Honour the Light Brigade,
Noble six hundred.

CONSIDER THE ARGUMENT: HOW IS IT CONSTRUCTED?

1. Look for **pronouns**.
– Which ones are used?
– How are they used?
– What is the effect of these choices?

2. Look for **repeated words** and **statements**.
– Which ones are used?
– How are they used?
– What is the effect of these choices?

3. Look for **words** that indicate **truth claims**
– Which ones are used?
– How are they used?
– What is the effect of these choices?

Example 3: RHETORIC *versus* LOGIC IN 'TRADITIONAL' PRACTICE

Indonesia - Abigail Haworth: 'The day I saw 248 girls suffering genital mutilation'
(*Guardian* 2012)

Twelve-year-old Suminah […] looks like she wants to punch somebody. Under her white hijab, which she has yanked down over her brow like a hoodie, her eyes have the livid, bewildered expression of a child who has been wronged by people she trusted. She sits on a plastic chair, swatting away her mother's efforts to placate her with a party cup of milk and a biscuit. Suminah is in severe pain. An hour earlier, her genitals were mutilated with scissors as she lay on a school desk.

During the morning, 248 Indonesian girls undergo the same ordeal. Suminah is the oldest, the youngest is just five months. It is April 2006 and the occasion is a mass ceremony to perform sunat perempuan or "female circumcision" that has been held annually since 1958 by the Bandung-based Yayasan Assalaam, an Islamic foundation that runs a mosque and several schools. The foundation holds the event in the lunar month of the Prophet Muhammad's birthday, and pays parents 80,000 rupiah (£6) and a bag of food for each daughter they bring to be cut.

It is well established that female genital mutilation (FGM) is not required in Muslim law. It is an ancient cultural practice that existed before Islam, Christianity and Judaism. It is also agreed across large swathes of the world that it is barbaric. At the mass ceremony, I ask the foundation's social welfare secretary, Lukman Hakim, why they do it. His answer not only predates the dawn of religion, it predates human evolution: "It is necessary to control women's sexual urges," says Hakim, a stern, bespectacled man in a fez. "They must be chaste to preserve their beauty."

https://www.theguardian.com/society/2012 /nov/18/female-genital-mutilation-circumcision-indonesia

The Gambia: Sue Lloyd-Robert 'Gambian women fleeing female genital mutilation threat'
(*BBC Newsnight,* 2013*)*

… in Sohm, the village head agreed to a meeting in which Ms Bojang [Gambian health worker against FGM] spoke to locals about the health problems associated with FGM: children dying from loss of blood and infection, and death in childbirth - all problems which normally get blamed on witchcraft.

They listened, which was a promising start, but Ms Bojang said it takes years for people to turn their back on what is a deeply entrenched practice.

Not only has mutilation taken place for generations, it has also provided employment for generations of women. The Gambia has thousands of women circumcisers. Often they inherit the role from relatives, with expertise handed down within the family.

Ms Bojang took me to the town of Janjanbureh on the north bank of the Gambia River to meet several of them.

"We take pride in our work," Aja Babung Sidebah said. "We cut the girls and then we sew them up them so that no man can interfere with them, then, the day before their wedding, they come back to us so that we can cut a hole to allow for penetration."

…

The hold such traditions have in The Gambia was made apparent when I met Muhammed Alhajie Lamin Touray, the country's most senior imam and president of the Islamic Council in The Gambia.

"Apart from the religious reasons in favour of female genital mutilation, I have heard on reliable authority that the clitoris makes a woman itch, making her want to scratch all the time and that the clitoris makes water leak from her private parts," he said.

To which I retorted, "I have had a clitoris for 60 years and this has never happened to me."

"Then you are an exception among women!" he said, laughing.

It was the laughing that I found most shocking. It was as if he was admitting to the absurdity of his position. Surely if he truly believes that the mutilation of young girls is ordained by God and is good for women, he would not laugh.

http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/uk-23933437

CONSIDER THE ARGUMENTS AROUND FGM:

1. How is the practice justified in both societies?
2. How are the problems that result from FGM normally explained?
3. Why does the practice continue? Does this differ in the two countries?
4. Is the practice related to religion?