



ECSO6002: Justice, Utopia & Dystopia

CRIME & DEVIANCE VERSUS
POWER & CONTROL

Introduction

- Exploration of what constitutes
 - Utopia
 - Heterotopia
 - Social Justice
 - Dystopia
- We will discuss how this relate to the concepts of
 - Power
 - Control
 - Crime
 - Deviance

Plato's Republic: Society and Justice

Plato imagined an enlightened republic ruled by philosopher Kings

- Plato's Republic
- 375BC

(Plato, 2020)

Watch the video

- [The Republic by Plato | Brief Summary](#)

Plato's Republic: Society and Justice

From Aristocracy to Tyranny

From Utopia to Dystopia

From Aristocracy

To Timocracy

To Oligarchy

To Democracy

To Tyranny

Aristocracy: Plato's Republic

This is a different concept from Modern Day sense of Aristocracy

- Aristocracy: 'Rule by the Best'
- Wisdom and Intellect

Philosopher-Kings

- The ruling class: Wise and Educated in Ethics
 - Rule by the few
 - having souls of gold
 - forbidden from owning property
 - So that the policies they undertake NOT be tainted by personal interests

For some this is considered a form of

- Meritocracy
 - Power according to Merit
 - However, this concept is critiqued by many

(Plato, 2020; Reisman, 2021: 148)

Aristocracy: Plato's Republic

Auxiliaries to the Ruling Caste

- Soldiers
 - Having souls of silver
 - Their role is to force on the majority the order established by the Philosopher-Kings
 - Forbidden from owning property

The Majority of the People

- Workers
 - souls of either bronze or iron
 - allowed to own property and produce goods for themselves
- but are also obliged to
 - sustain with their own activities the Philosopher-Kings and Auxiliaries

Watch Video 3:08:

- [Aristocracy](#)

(Plato, 2020)

Timocracy: Plato's Republic

Degeneration from Aristocracy

- From intellect and wisdom to rule by Honour and Duty
- Militarily include
- Power of philosophy
- Greed Rules

(Plato, 2020; Dorter, 2006, 274)

Examples:

- UK House of Lords
 - Appointed due to loyalty to a party in government
- Donald Trump
 - Honour and duty over substance
 - 'Make America Great Again' is devoid of substance
 - What is greatness?

(Plato, 2020; Dorter, 2006, 274)

Watch Video 0:38:

- [Timocracy](#)

Oligarchy: Plato's Republic

Oligarchy means:

- Rule by the Few
- Plutocracy
 - Government by the wealthy
- Move from Honour and Duty to Power and Greed
- They change the rules so that ONLY the Rich have power

High levels of income disparities

- Linked to bad policy making
- This in turn allows enrichment through exploitive contracts

The Rich are the administrators in power and alter laws to support the rich

- Money is valued OVER Virtue, Wisdom and Ethics
- Political Power is held by Rich people
- This in turn prevents wise and virtuous and poor men from influencing public life

In turn this favours

- the rich but incompetent to hold public office

(Plato, 2020; Popper, 2020: 41)

Oligarchy: Plato's Republic

Usually perform poorly in military campaigns

- because the rich men, who are few, will make a small army,
- and they are afraid to give weapons to the majority (the poor)
- due to fears of a revolution.
- Positions in society are decided by income not merit

This can lead to Revolution

- Angry about inequality
- The poor become either beggars or thugs
- have a revolutionary spirit which threatens the internal stability of the state;
- The poor expel the rich from the city, or kill them,

Victory over the Oligarchy: Rich Ruling Class

- the poor ones become victorious over the rich
- The poor then divide their properties and political power between one another

Examples:

- Pre-Revolutionary France
 - Unequal society

(Plato, 2020)

Watch Video 2:31:

- [Oligarchy](#)

Democracy: Plato's Republic

Different from today's democracy

- Often called the Rule by the Ignorant
- All citizens
 - Who qualified as being free men
- permitted the opportunity of equal political participation
- Important decisions were made by the assembly,
 - where each citizen had the right to speak
 - the majority of offices were assigned by lot

Plato believed that expertise is the critical attribute of a leader;

He criticizes democracy of seldom producing such characters

Rather, it elects popular spinsters who are effective in manipulating popular opinion.

(Plato, 2020; Council of Europe, 2021, 15).

Utopia: Historic and Modern Meaning

Thomas More 1516

- Wrote in Latin a book called 'Utopia'
- It literally translates as
 - no place
- from the Greek
 - οὐ ("not") and τόπος ("place")
 - More used this to mean any non-existent society

(More, *Translated by Baker-Smith*, 2012)

Today we use this term Utopia to mean:

- A non-existent place which is intended to be viewed as
- A considerably better place than today's society

(Rusen, Fehr & Rieger, 2005).

Contradictions within the Concept of Utopia

‘There are socialist, capitalist, monarchical, democratic, anarchist, ecological, feminist, patriarchal, egalitarian, hierarchical, racist, left-wing, right-wing, reformist, free love, nuclear family, extended family, gay, lesbian and many more utopias [[Naturism](#), [Nude Christians](#), ...] Utopianism, some argue, is essential for the improvement of the human condition. But if used wrongly, it becomes dangerous. Utopia has an inherent contradictory nature here’.

(Sargent, 2010)

Utopia

An Ideal World or Imaginary
Community/Society without:

- War
- Poverty
- Crime
- Almost perfect as a society
- Almost perfect members of the society

They often focus on

- Equality through economics, government and justice.

Many religions offer

- a perfect afterlife or other place after death
(Bregman, 2018; Featherstone, 2017)

Watch the Video 4:11:

- [Utopia Dystopia Part I - HARRIS Emily](#)

Heterotopia (Real Spaces) Foucault

Michel Foucault

- spaces that provide an alternate space of ordering while paradoxically remaining both separate from and connected to all other spaces (Topinka, 2010, p. 55)
- Traditionally, heterotopias are understood as sites of resistance (Hetherington, 1997)

It can be described as

- cultural, institutional and discursive spaces
- that are somehow 'other'
- disturbing, intense, incompatible, contradictory or transforming.
- Heterotopias are worlds within worlds, mirroring and yet upsetting what is outside

Foucault provides examples:

- ships, cemeteries, bars, brothels, prisons, gardens of antiquity, fairs, Muslim baths and many more

(Elden & Crampton, 2016)

Heterotopia (Real Spaces) Foucault

(Foucault 1998, p. 178).

‘Real places,

actual places,

- places that are designed into the very institution of society,

which are sorts of actually realized utopias in which the real emplacements,

all the other real emplacements that can be found within the culture are,

- at the same time,
- represented,
- contested,
- and reversed,

sorts of places that are outside all places, although they are actually localizable’

Heterotopia (Real Spaces) Foucault

- ‘Modern heterotopias are for
 - deviants,
 - people who do not fit in the dominant social norm and,
- even if individually they may return to
 - productive,
 - normal,
 - social roles,
- as a group they remain excluded from the working of society.

(Elden & Crampton, 2016)

- These are spaces
- “in which individuals whose behavior is deviant in relation to the average or norm, are placed”
(Foucault 1978: 139 *cited in* Cenzatti, 2008, p. 3).

Heterotopia and the Metaverse

Metaverse

- Hypothesised iteration of the Internet
 - Persistent online 3-D virtual environments through accessible personal computing, mobile phones and includes augmented reality through forms of headsets

(Casey, 2021)

- a realm wherein information exchange enjoys an even higher value than financial exchange, and offline consumption of goods, services and experiences is matched by the online navigation of the interfaces required to unlock, access and purchase said exchanges

(Roh, 2021)

Watch the Video 43:25:

- [Mark Zuckerberg, The Metaverse – Interview](#)

Full Webpage available at:

- [Mark Zuckerberg is betting Facebook's future on the metaverse - Article in The Verge](#)

Dystopia

Watch the Video 5:56:

- [Utopia Dystopia Part 2 - HARRIS Emily](#)
 - Suppression
 - Fear
 - Sameness – numbers
 - Constant surveillance
 - Xenophobia
 - War, disease, poverty, climate harshness
 - INEQUALITY
 - Technology

Implications for today's society:

- Discuss and feedback

(Claeys, 2017)



Utopia to Dystopia:
Is an Utopian World Possible?

1) Features of Modern Utopian Ideological Systems

World peace.

- There can only be true universal peace when every living person adheres to the ideology

Social equality.

- Communitarianism: all goods must be shared by all. No human being shall have more possessions than any other human being

No social stratification.

- All forms of social stratification should be dismantled and all forms of hierarchy abolished

Membership.

- Ideology replaces the family. Loyalty to the community should be above loyalty to family members, friends, etc

Ecology.

- There is an ideological and limited use of technology

Everyday life.

- A complete plan for every aspect of how people should live their lives and how society should function

Perfection.

- Ideology is the very definition of perfection and absolute truth. It cannot be contested in any way. It is the only proper basis for human activity

New order.

- The idea of the nation-state is impoverished. A World new order, based on ideology, is inevitable

(Domenech, Nescolarde-Selva, Lloret-Climent, Alonso & Gash, 2020)

2) The Trajectory of Modern Utopian Ideological Systems

World revolution.

- International borders are an unnecessary invention created by the enemies of utopia (capitalists, imperialists, Zionists, etc.)

Capitalism, liberalism and democracy

- are bad and must be destroyed. Western economic, social systems and belief systems that are based are the source of global inequality, division and exploitation of human beings and must be destroyed.

Generalized panic.

- Fears of climate change can be used as a means to redistribute global wealth and promote ideology.

Violence.

- Violence is necessary to impose the ideology and any infidel is a legitimate target

(Domenech, Nescolarde-Selva, Lloret-Climent, Alonso & Gash, 2020)

3) Corrective Works for these Utopian Worlds

Absolute control

- Control of all aspects of life.

Intolerance

- No other belief system can be tolerated. The world must be governed by ideology and opposing views should be suppressed.

Terror

- Enemies, dissidents and the lukewarm should be intimidated, boycotted and eventually eliminated without mercy

The Machines of Allegiance

These regimes create fear and command allegiance through the use of Machines

- These are not literally machines
 - but bureaucracies that carry out a set of
 - Deliberate
 - Interrelated strategies.

(Domenech, Nescolarde-Selva, Lloret-Climent, Alonso & Gash, 2020)

Machines of Allegiance: From Utopia to Dystopia

The cult of the leader or the cult of personality.

- These make the dictator seem larger than life or superhuman.

After Italy annexed Ethiopia in 1936, Mussolini's followers declared him to be a

- **new god in human form.**
- In the Soviet Union, long ovations after Stalin's speeches were common, as no one wanted to be seen as the first to stop applauding.
- **Maybe you can think of 'others' to add to this list!**

The Big Lie or deliberate distortions of the truth.

- During the hundred flowers campaign, Mao Zedong seemed to
- **promote free speech,**
- then **killed some half-million dissidents** when they came out in the open.

Secret police.

- An estimated 274,000 people worked with the East German secret police, the Stasi, from 1950 to 1989.
- When informers were added, this translated into one secret policeman for every 6.5 persons.

The media.

- Radio, film and television were used to
- rewrite history and manipulate the masses.
- The Bolsheviks produced documentary films that made their October revolution seem much more dramatic and deadly than it was a common joke was that more people were injured during filming than in the actual event
- **Does this remind you of Fake News?**

(Domenech, Nescolarde-Selva, Lloret-Climent, Alonso & Gash, 2020)

Plato's Republic: Society and Justice

**From Aristocracy to
Tyranny**

**From Utopia to
Dystopia**

From Aristocracy

To Timocracy

To Oligarchy

To Democracy

To Tyranny



Utopia to Dystopia

Watch the Video:

[GENDLER Alex \(2016\) How to Recognise a Dystopia. TED Talks](#)

Novels

Orwell, G & Pynchon T (1949) *1984 Nineteen Eighty-Four*, London: Penguin Books.

Bradbury, R (1999) *Fahrenheit 451*, London: Harper Voyager.

Atwood, M (2005) *The Handmaid's Tale*, Dresden: Klett Sprachen GmbH.

McCarthy C (2009) *The Road*, New York: Picador.

Huxley, A (2007) *Brave New World*, London: Vintage Classics.

Burgess, A (2013) *A Clockwork Orange*, London: Penguin Modern Classics.

Dick PK (2007) *Do Androids Dream of Electric Sheep?* New York: Gateway.

Zamyatin Y (2020) *We*, London: Penguin Science Fiction.

Wells, HG (2016) *The Time Machine* Redditch, UK: Read Books Ltd.

Collins, S (2008) *The Hunger Games*, Witney, Oxon: Scholastic.

Films

The Handmaid's Tale (2017)

The Matrix (1999)

Interstellar (2014)

WALL·E (2008)

A Clockwork Orange (1971)

Metropolis (1927)

V for Vendetta (2005)

The Truman Show (1998)

Mad Max: Fury Road (2015)

Blade Runner (1982)

The Terminator (1984)

1984 (1984)

Logan (2017)

Stalker (1979)

Her (2013)

Blade Runner 2049 (2017)

Akira (1988)

Planet of the Apes (1968)

Ghost in the Shell (1995)

Twelve Monkeys (1995)

Total Recall (1990)

The 10th Victim (1965)

Reference List

Bergman R (2018) *Utopia for Realists: How We Can Build the Ideal World*, Hatchett: Little Brown Books.

Cenzatti M (2008) 'Heterotopias of Difference'. In M. Dehaene & L. De Cauter (Eds.) *Heterotopia and the City: Urban Theory and the Transformations of Public Space.*, Oxford, UK & Cambridge, MA: Blackwell.

Claeys G (2017) *Dystopia: A Natural History: A study of Modern Despotism, Its Antecedents, and its Literary Diffractions*, Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Council of Europe (2021) *State of Democracy, Human Rights and the Rule of Law 2021: A Democratic Renewal for Europe*, Strasbourg, EU: Council of Europe

Dorter, K (2006) *The Transformation of Plato's Republic*, Oxford: Lexington Books.

Reference List

Elden, S & Crampton JW (2016) *Space, Knowledge and Power: Foucault and Geography*, London: Routledge

Featherstone, M (2017) *Planet Utopia: utopia, Dystopia and Globalisation*, Abingdon: Routledge

Foucault, M. [1967] (1998) 'Different Spaces'. In J. D. Faubion (Ed.) *Aesthetics, Method, and Epistemology: Essential Works of Foucault Volume 2*. London: Penguin.

Hetherington K (1997) *The Badlands of Modernity*, London: Routledge.

More T (Baker-Smith, D Translator) (2012) *Utopia*, Penguin Classic: Cambridge.

Newton, Casey (2021-07-22). ["Mark Zuckerberg is betting Facebook's future on the metaverse"](#). The Verge. [Archived](#) from the original on 2021-10-25. Retrieved 2021-10-25.

Reference List

Plato (Lane M Translator) (2007) *The Republic*, Penguin Classic: Cambridge.

Popper KR (2020) *The Open Society and its Enemies*, Princetown, NJ: Princeton University Press.

Reisman (2021) *Plato's Economics: Republic and Control*, Cheltenham, Glos: Edward Elgar Publishing Limited.

Roh , J. (2021). Factbox: What is the 'metaverse' and how does it work? In Reuters Technology [Online]. Available from <https://www.reuters.com/technology/what-is-metaverse-how-does-it-work-2021-09-08/>. Accessed 1 October 2021.

Rusen, J, Fehr, M & Rieger, TW (2005) *Thinking Utopia: Steps into Other Worlds*. New York: Berghahn Books.

Reference List

Sargent, LT (2010). *Utopianism: A very Short Introduction*. Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press.

Topinka R (2010) 'Foucault, Borges, Heterotopia: Producing Knowledge in Other Spaces'. *Foucault Studies*, No. 9., pp. 54-70.